

2017-2474, -2475, -2476, -2478, -2479, -2480, -2482, -2483,
2018-1050, -1079, -1080, -1081, -1082

**United States Court of Appeals
for the Federal Circuit**

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO. LTD., MICRON TECHNOLOGY, INC.,
SK HYNIX, INC.

Appellants,

v.

ELM 3DS INNOVATIONS LLC,

Appellee.

*Appeals from the United States Patent and Trademark Office, Patent Trial and
Appeal Board in Inter Partes Review Nos. IPR2016-00386, IPR2016-00387,
IPR2016-00388, IPR2016-00390, IPR2016-00391, IPR2016-00393,
IPR2016-00394, IPR2016-00395, IPR2016-00708, IPR2016-00687,
IPR2016-00691, IPR2016-00770, and IPR2016-00786*

**APPELLEE ELM 3DS INNOVATIONS LLC's
COMBINED PETITION FOR PANEL REHEARING
AND REHEARING *EN BANC***

Michael T. Renaud
mtrenaud@mintz.com
James M. Wodarski
jwodarski@mintz.com
William A. Meunier
wameunier@mintz.com
Michael C. Newman
mcnewman@mintz.com
MINTZ LEVIN COHN FERRIS
GLOVSKY AND POPEO PC
One Financial Center
Boston, MA 02111
Tel. (617) 542.6000
Fax (617) 542.2241

Counsel for Appellee Elm 3DS Innovations LLC

July 12, 2019

CERTIFICATE OF INTEREST

Counsel for Appellee Elm 3DS Innovations LLC certifies the following:

1. The full name of every party represented by me is:

Elm 3DS Innovations LLC

2. The name of the real party in interest (if the party named in the caption is not the real party in interest) represented by me is:

None.

3. All parent corporations and any publicly held companies that own 10 percent or more of the stock of the party represented by me are:

None.

4. The names of all law firms and the partners or associates that appeared for the party now represented by me in the trial court or agency or are expected to appear in this Court (and who have not entered an appearance in this Court) are:

Robins Kaplan LLP (Cyrus A. Morton and Kelsey Thorkelson).

Carmichael IP, PLLC (James Carmichael).

5. The title and number of any case known to counsel to be pending in this or any other court or agency that will directly affect or be directly affected by this court's decision in the pending appeal:

The following cases pending before the Delaware District Court: *Elm 3DS Innovations LLC v. Samsung Electronics Co. Ltd.*, Civil Action No. 1:14-cv-01430-LPS, *Elm 3DS Innovations LLC v. Micron Technology Inc.*, Civil Action No. 1:14-cv-01431-LPS, and *Elm 3DS Innovations LLC v. SK hynix Inc.*, Civil Action No. 1:14-cv-01432-LPS.

Dated: July 12, 2019

/s/ William A. Meunier
William A. Meunier

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CERTIFICATE OF INTERESTi

TABLE OF AUTHORITIESiv

FEDERAL CIRCUIT RULE 35(b)(2) STATEMENT OF COUNSEL 1

I. Summary2

II. Points of Law or Fact Overlooked or Misapprehended By The Panel.....4

III. The Panel Should Grant Rehearing To Omit The 50 Microns Requirement.....5

A. The Court Need Not Resolve The 50 Microns Dispute5

B. Examples Are Not Clear And Unambiguous Disavowals7

C. “50 Microns” Was An Example Of A Sufficiently Low Value, Not A Clear And Unambiguous Disavowal..... 10

1. “50 Microns” Was Merely An Example Of A Sufficiently Low Thinness 11

2. The Prosecution History’s Indefiniteness Rejection Response Did Not Clearly And Unambiguously Disavow Substantially Flexible Substrates Thicker Than 50 Microns 12

3. There Is No Evidence That A POSITA Would Understand That Substantially Flexible Substrates Thicker Than 50 Microns Were Disavowed 15

4. The Claim Differentiation Doctrine Confirms There Was No Disavowal Of Sufficiently Thinned Substrates That Are Thicker Than 50 Microns..... 17

IV. The En Banc Court Should Grant Rehearing To Consider and Modify Its “Substantially Flexible” Construction To Omit The 50 Microns Requirement..... 18

V. Conclusion 19

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Federal Cases	
<i>Aventis Pharma S.A. v. Hospira, Inc.</i> , 675 F.3d 1324 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	<i>passim</i>
<i>Bayer-Cropscience AG v. Dow Agrosciences LLC</i> , 728 F.3d 1324 (Fed. Cir. 2013)	6, 19
<i>Dealertrack, Inc. v. Huber</i> , 674 F.3d 1315 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	1, 9, 19
<i>Elkay Mfg. Co. v. Ebco Mfg. Co.</i> , 192 F.3d 973 (Fed. Cir. 1999)	1, 16, 19
<i>In re Trans Tex. Holdings Corp.</i> , 498 F.3d 1290 (Fed. Cir. 2007)	1, 9, 19
<i>K-2 Corp. v. Salomon S.A.</i> , 191 F.3d 1356 (Fed. Cir. 1999)	7
<i>Leo Pharm. Prods. v. Rea</i> , 726 F.3d 1346 (Fed. Cir. 2013)	6
<i>Phillips v. AWH Corp.</i> , 415 F.3d 1303 (Fed. Cir. 2005)	<i>passim</i>
<i>SanDisk Corp. v. Memoroex Prods.</i> 415 F.3d 1278 (Fed. Cir. 2005)	14
<i>Seachange Int’l, Inc. v. C-COR, Inc.</i> , 413 F.3d 1361 (Fed. Cir. 2005)	17
<i>Thorner v. Sony Computer Entm’t Am. LLC</i> , 669 F.3d 1362 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	1, 9, 16, 19
<i>Toshiba Corp. v. Imation Corp.</i> , 681 F.3d 1358 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	1, 7, 14, 19

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.