

2016-2523, -2524

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE FEDERAL CIRCUIT

DSS TECHNOLOGY MANAGEMENT, INC.,

Appellant

v.

APPLE INC.,

Appellee

**Appeals from the United States Patent and Trademark Office,
Patent Trial and Appeal Board Nos. IPR2015-00369 and IPR2015-00373**

**APPELLEE APPLE INC.'S CORRECTED COMBINED PETITION FOR
PANEL REHEARING AND REHEARING EN BANC**

David K.S. Cornwell
Jon E. Wright
Kristina Caggiano Kelly
Jason A. Fitzsimmons
William H. Milliken
Sterne Kessler Goldstein & Fox PLLC
1100 New York Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20005
202.371.2600

Counsel for Appellee, Apple Inc.

Dated: May 7, 2018

UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE FEDERAL CIRCUIT

DSS Technology Management, Inc. v. Apple Inc.

Case No. 16-2523, -2524

AMEDNED
CERTIFICATE OF INTEREST

Counsel for the:

(petitioner) (appellant) (respondent) (appellee) (amicus) (name of party)

Apple Inc.

certifies the following (use "None" if applicable; use extra sheets if necessary):

1. Full Name of Party Represented by me	2. Name of Real Party in interest (Please only include any real party in interest NOT identified in Question 3) represented by me is:	3. Parent corporations and publicly held companies that own 10% or more of stock in the party
Apple Inc.	Apple Inc.	None.

4. The names of all law firms and the partners or associates that appeared for the party or amicus now represented by me in the trial court or agency or are expected to appear in this court **(and who have not or will not enter an appearance in this case)** are:

Sterne, Kessler, Goldstein & Fox P.L.L.C.: Robert Greene Sterne, Mark W. Rygiel

FORM 9. Certificate of Interest

Form 9
Rev. 10/17

5. The title and number of any case known to counsel to be pending in this or any other court or agency that will directly affect or be directly affected by this court's decision in the pending appeal. *See* Fed. Cir. R. 47.4(a)(5) and 47.5(b). (The parties should attach continuation pages as necessary).

The patent at issue in this appeal is also involved in the matter of DSS Technology Management, Inc. v. Apple, Inc., C.A. No. 4:14-cv-05330 (N.D. Cal.).

4/11/2018

Date

/s/ Jon E. Wright

Signature of counsel

Jon E. Wright

Printed name of counsel

Please Note: All questions must be answered

cc: Counsel of Record

Reset Fields

TABLE OF CONTENTS

STATEMENT OF COUNSEL	1
INTRODUCTION	2
ARGUMENT	2
I. The Panel Majority Contravened the Administrative Procedure Act by Refusing to Consider the Whole Record in Determining Whether the Board’s Obviousness Conclusion Was Supported by Substantial Evidence.....	2
A. The APA mandates whole record review by the reviewing court; the <i>Chenery</i> doctrine does not limit that review to evidence cited by the agency.....	3
B. The panel majority harmfully erred in refusing to consider record evidence that supported the Board’s determination.....	5
II. Even If the Board Failed to Sufficiently Explain Its Obviousness Conclusion, The Panel Majority Violated Longstanding Supreme Court Precedent by Reversing Instead of Vacating and Remanding to the Board for Further Proceedings.	9
A. The ordinary remand rule requires a court reviewing an insufficiently reasoned agency decision to vacate and remand for further agency proceedings absent “extraordinary circumstances.”.....	10
B. Because there are no “extraordinary circumstances” here, the panel majority’s decision to reverse, instead of vacating and remanding, violated the ordinary remand rule.	14
CONCLUSION AND RELIEF SOUGHT	16

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases:

<i>A.L. Pharma, Inc. v. Shalala</i> , 62 F.3d 1484 (D.C. Cir. 1995).....	13
<i>Am. Fed'n of Gov't Emps., AFL-CIO v. Fed. Labor Relations Auth.</i> , 778 F.2d 850 (D.C. Cir. 1985).....	13-14
<i>Ariosa Diagnostics v. Verinata Health, Inc.</i> , 805 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2015).....	1
<i>Bailey v. Dart Container Corp. of Mich.</i> , 292 F.3d 1360 (Fed. Cir. 2002).....	4
<i>Bd. of Trs. of Leland Stanford Junior Univ. v. Chinese Univ. of Hong Kong</i> , 860 F.3d 1367 (Fed. Cir. 2017).....	4
<i>Castañeda-Castillo v. Gonzales</i> , 488 F.3d 17 (1st Cir. 2006).....	12
<i>Coronado v. Holder</i> , 759 F.3d 977 (9th Cir. 2014)	12
<i>Droplets Inc. v. E*Trade Bank, et al.</i> , -- F.3d --, 2018 WL 1866903 (Fed. Cir. 2018).....	4
<i>Florida Power & Light Co. v. Lorion</i> , 470 U.S. 729 (1985).....	1, 9, 11
<i>Fogo De Chao (Holdings) Inc. v. U.S. Dep't of Homeland Sec.</i> , 769 F.3d 1127 (D.C. Cir. 2014).....	12
<i>Gonzales v. Thomas</i> , 547 U.S. 183 (2006).....	1, 11
<i>In re Applied Materials, Inc.</i> , 692 F.3d 1289 (Fed. Cir. 2012).....	5

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.