Exhibit 25

DOCKET A L A R M Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>. Case 1:20-cv-00393-LO-TCB Document 751-4 Filed 06/22/21 Page 2 of 4 PageID# 20483

CONFIDENTIAL BUSINESS INFORMATION – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA ALEXANDRIA DIVISION

REBUTTAL EXPERT REPORT OF JOSEPH C. M[£]ALEXANDER III REGARDING VALIDITY OF U.S. PATENT NUMBERS: 6,803,545 AND 10,420,374

RJR STRATEGIC HOLDINGS, INC. AND R.J. REYNOLDS VAPOR COMPANY vs. ALTRIA CLIENT SERVICES LLC; PHILIP MORRIS USA INC.; and PHILIP MORRIS PRODUCTS S.A.

Civil Action No. 1:20-cv-00393-LO-TCB

March 24, 2021

Case 1:20-cv-00393-LO-TCB Document 751-4 Filed 06/22/21 Page 3 of 4 PageID# 20484 CONFIDENTIAL BUSINESS INFORMATION – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER

8.2 **Prior Art Summary**⁵³²

8.2.1 Chinese Utility Model Patent Publication No. CN 201482667 U ("Liao")

556. Chinese Utility Model Patent Publication No. CN 201482667 U ("Liao") entitled

"Electronic atomizer." The inventor of this reference is the same inventor as the '374 Patent.

557. Liao does not describe the internal functioning or details of its airflow sensing

apparatus. Liao provides only that:

The sensing apparatus 4 is a capacitive airflow sensor. The airflow sensing switch circuit 21 is configured to sense smoking actions of a user, and the circuit provides an airflow sensing function by detecting a capacitance value of an external capacitive airflow sensor C1. When the user smokes, an airflow is generated. When the airflow flows through the capacitive airflow sensor C1, the capacitance value of the capacitive airflow sensor C1 changes, thereby triggering the airflow sensing switch circuit 21.⁵³³

558. Liao's electronic atomizer includes a housing and a processing chip, a heating apparatus, a sensing apparatus, an airflow sensor and a battery in the housing.⁵³⁴ Liao does not

disclose the material for the housing 1.

8.2.2 U.S. Patent No. 8,661,910 ("McLaughlin")

559. U.S. Patent No. 8,661,910 ("McLaughlin") entitled "Capacitive Sensor" relates to

capacitive air flow sensors for use in an oxygen conserving delivery system for general aviation.⁵³⁵

⁵³² Dr. Blalock provides a "summary" of U.S. Patent No. 5,134,886 ("Ball") at paragraphs 273-277 of his report, but does not rely on the reference for any of his combinations or otherwise provide any analysis regarding the reference. I reserve all rights to amend, modify, or supplement my opinions should Dr. Blalock be permitted to rely on the reference in the future. ⁵³³ Liao, at ¶ [0016].

⁵³⁴ Liao, at ¶ [0004], [0011].

⁵³⁵ McLaughlin, at 2:13-17 ("[W]hen the subject invention is used with an oxygen delivery system for general aviation"); 2:67-3:4 ("In a preferred application of the preferred embodiment of the invention ... as part of a supplemental oxygen conserving delivery system for use in general aviation."); ("Alternatively, the power source may be external to the oxygen delivery system such as the typical 12 volt power available in general aviation aircraft"); 8:21-22

Case 1:20-cv-00393-LO-TCB Document 751-4 Filed 06/22/21 Page 4 of 4 PageID# 20485 CONFIDENTIAL BUSINESS INFORMATION – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER

10 **CONCLUDING REMARKS**

1012. I understand that any further finding of the Court regarding claim construction, or receipt of any additional information, may require me to amend or supplement my opinions. If amendments or supplements to this report are necessary, I will provide those in a timely manner.

Dated: March 24, 2021

Joseph C. 7/3 Mefante

Joseph C. M^cAlexander ÍII