

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA
ALEXANDRIA DIVISION**

RAI STRATEGIC HOLDINGS, INC. and
R.J. REYNOLDS VAPOR COMPANY,

Plaintiffs,

v.

ALTRIA CLIENT SERVICES LLC; PHILIP
MORRIS USA INC.; and PHILIP MORRIS
PRODUCTS S.A.

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 1:20-cv-393

**REPLY IN SUPPORT OF COUNTERCLAIM PLAINTIFFS'
MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. SUMMARY JUDGMENT OF NO INEQUITABLE CONDUCT FOR THE '545 PATENT	1
A. RJR Does Not Dispute That Its Inequitable Conduct Claim Fails On The Merits	1
B. The Court Should Not Permit RJR's Procedural Tactics.....	2
II. SUMMARY JUDGMENT ON RJR'S FIFTH, SIXTH, EIGHTH, AND ELEVENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES	5
A. RJR Has Raised No Genuine Disputes of Material Fact to Support Its Fifth Affirmative Defense Of Waiver, Acquiescence, and Estoppel.....	7
B. RJR's Speculative "Future Facts" Do Not Support Its Ensnarement Defense	9
C. The Court Should Grant Summary Judgment On The Remaining Fifth, Sixth, and Eleventh Affirmative Defenses.....	10
III. PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT OF NO INVALIDITY FOR THE '374 PATENT	11
A. RJR Concedes That Liu Is Not "By Another" And Is Not Prior Art Under Pre-AIA § 102(a)	12
B. Pre-AIA § 102(d) Does Not Apply	15
C. The Liu Reference Is Not Prior Art Under Pre-AIA § 102(b).....	18

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES

Bayer AG v. Schein Pharm., Inc.,
129 F. Supp. 2d 705 (D.N.J. 2001), *aff'd*, 301 F.3d 1306 (Fed. Cir. 2002) 16, 17

Bayer AG v. Schein Pharm., Inc.,
301 F.3d 1306 (Fed. Cir. 2002) 16

Civix-DDI, LLC v. Cellco P’ship,
387 F. Supp. 2d 869 (N.D. Ill. 2005)..... 4

Colluci v. Callaway Golf Co.,
750 F. Supp. 2d 767 (E.D. Tex. 2010) 17

Dane Techs., Inc. v. Gatekeeper Sys.,
135 F. Supp. 3d 970 (D. Minn. 2015) 8

Depuy Spine, Inc. v. Medtronic Sofamor Danek, Inc.,
567 F.3d 1314 (Fed. Cir. 2009) 10

H. Jay Spiegel & Assocs., P.C. v. Spiegel,
652 F. Supp. 2d 639 (E.D. Va. 2009) 8

In re Bass,
474 F.2d 1276 (CCPA 1973)..... 12, 17

In re Kathawala,
9 F.3d 942 (Fed. Cir. 1993) 16

Kewazinga Corp. v. Google LLC,
No. 20 Civ. 1106 (LGS), 2021 WL 466877 (S.D.N.Y. Feb. 9, 2021) 9

Mahurkar v. C.R. Bard, Inc.,
79 F.3d 1572 (Fed. Cir. 1996) 13

Marshall v. Univ. of Md. Med. Ctr.,
No. TDC-17-2779, 2018 WL 3727947 (D. Md. Aug. 6, 2018) 7

Master Craft v. Stanley Works,
No. 04-132 (JMR/JSM), 2006 WL 8438190 (D. Minn. Apr. 27, 2006) 3

Munchkin, Inc. v. Int’l Refills Co.,
IPR2016-01154, Paper 13 (PTAB Dec. 12, 2016) 17, 18

Netscape Commc’ns. Corp. v. Valueclick, Inc.,
684 F. Supp. 2d 699 (E.D. Va. 2010) 8

OddzOn Prods., Inc. v. Just Toys, Inc.,
122 F.3d 1396 (Fed. Cir. 1997) 12, 16, 17

Southwest Bell Tel., L.P. v. Arthur Collins, Inc.,
454 F. Supp. 2d 600 (N.D. Tex. 2006) 4

Sprint Commc’ns Co. L.P. v. Charter Commc’ns, Inc.,
No. 17-1734-RGA, 2021 WL 982726 (D. Del. Mar. 16, 2021) 8

TecSec, Inc. v. Adobe Systems Inc.,
326 F. Supp. 3d 105 (E.D. Va. 2018) 4

Thomas v. FTS USA, LLC,
No. 3:13-cv-825, 2016 WL 3566657 (E.D. Va. June 24, 2016) 6

TMM Data, LLC v. Braganza,
No. 5:14-cv-729-FL, 2016 WL 1228595 (E.D.N.C. Mar. 28, 2016) 3, 4

UCB, Inc. v. Watson Labs., Inc.,
927 F.3d 1272 (Fed. Cir. 2019) 10

Wilkins v. Montgomery,
751 F.3d 214 (4th Cir. 2014) 7

Williams v. ABM Parking Servs. Inc.,
296 F. Supp. 3d 779 (E.D. Va. 2017) 5

Zimmer Tech., Inc. v. Howmedica Osteonics Corp.,
453 F. Supp. 2d 1030 (N.D. Ind. 2006) 4

STATUTES

35 U.S.C. § 102(d) (pre-AIA) 16

35 U.S.C. § 102(d) 18

OTHER AUTHORITIES

MPEP § 2135 17

RULES

FED. R. CIV. P. 11(b)(1)-(3) 1, 7

FED. R. CIV. P. 26(e) 6, 10

FED. R. CIV. P. 37(a)(4)..... 6, 7
FED. R. CIV. P. 37(c) 6, 7, 10
FED. R. CIV. P. 41(a)(2)..... 5
FED. R. CIV. P. 56(a) 2
LOCAL R. CIV. P. 56(B)..... 2

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.