Case 1:20-cv-00393-LO-TCB Document 1347-1 Filed 06/13/22 Page 1 of 6 PageID# 33761



**DOCKET A L A R M** Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>. UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA

ALTRIA CLIENT SERVICES, LLC,	)
	)
et al.,	) Civil Action
	) No. 1:20-cv-00393-LO-TCB
Plaintiffs,	)
	) June 10, 2022
ν.	) 9:13 a.m.
	)
RAI STRATEGIC HOLDINGS, INC.,	)
et al.,	)
	)
Defendants.	)
	)

DAY 2 - MORNING SESSION TRANSCRIPT OF JURY TRIAL PROCEEDINGS BEFORE THE HONORABLE LEONIE M. BRINKEMA, UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE

APPEARANCES:

For the Plaintiffs:

Maximilian Antony Grant, Esq.

Latham & Watkins LLP (DC) 555 11th Street, NW Suite 1000 Washington, DC 20004-1304 202-637-2200 Email: Max.grant@lw.com

Clement Joseph Naples, Esq. Latham & Watkins, LLP 885 Third Avenue 25th Floor New York, NY 10022 212-906-1200 Email: Dement.naples@lw.com

Gregory K. Sobolski, Esq. Latham & Watkins, LLP 505 Montgomery Street Suite 2000 San Francisco, CA 94111-6538 202-637-2267 Email: Max.grant@lw.com

## Case 1:20-cv-00393-LO-TCB Document 1347-1 Filed 06/13/22 Page 3 of 6 PageID# 33763 91

1	Q. Okay.	And the examiner, just to the right of that,	
2	that's Elliott S. Ruddie. Do you see that?		
3	A. I do.		
4	Q. And jus	t under that, Number 3, it says, "Primary, Lynne	
5	Anderson." Do you see that?		
6	A. Yes.		
7	Q. Now, "p	rimary examiner," that means senior examiner at	
8	the Patent Office. Do you understand that?		
9	A. Yes.		
10	Q. Now, ex	aminers at the Patent Office like Mr. Ruddie and	
11	Ms. Anderson have expertise in the art of the patent application		
12	they're review	ving, right?	
13	A. Yes.		
14	Q. So we c	an safely assume that the '911 Patent examiners	
15	here have expe	ertise in the art of the '911 Patent, right?	
16	A. Yes.		
17	Q. And bec	ause they have expertise in the '911 Patent's art,	
18	we can assume	that examiners understand the '911 Patent's	
19	claims, right?		
20	A. Yes.		
21	MR. SOB	OLSKI: Well, let's go to page 4 I'm sorry, page	
22	5. And blow u	up on the screen so the jury can see the part that	
23	says "the exam	niner suggested structure" and can we bring that	
24	up, Mr. Smith,	blow up that part of it so we can all see it.	
25	BY MR. SOBOLSF	XI:	

DOCKET A L A R M Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>.

1	about,	right?	
2	A.	Well, in the application it says "toroid," and here it	
3	said '	'toroidal." It's talking about a toroidal shape.	
4	Q.	Let's bring up that language from Claim 13, Mr. Kodama.	
5		All right. Now let's put up Figure 6 of the '911 Patent	
6	that we were just looking at. Do you see that?		
7	A.	Yes.	
8	Q.	Now, that's exactly what Figure 6 of the '911 Patent	
9	shows,	right, "the at least one cavity is a blind hole has a	
10	toroidal shape," correct?		
11	A.	That's Figure 6, but I would not call that a blind hole.	
12	Based upon my experience in the industry, that is not a blind		
13	hole.	That would be what we call an annular groove.	
14	Q.	It's just not what the examiners called it, right?	
15	A.	Well, unfortunately, I believe the examiners might have	
16	used the wrong wording there. They actually used "blind cavity"		
17	instead of "blind hole." In industry, we would not call that		
18	area shaded in yellow a blind hole, it would be an annular		
19	groove or some other shape.		
20	Q.	In other words, you think the experts got it wrong.	
21	A.	I think they might have chosen the wrong wording in their	
22	reply,	yes.	
23	Q.	Let's talk about the shape of the Alto device.	
24		MR. SOBOLSKI: We can take that down.	
25	BY MR.	SOBOLSKI:	

**A L A R M** Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>.

DOCKET

## Case 1:20-cv-00393-LO-TCB Document 1347-1 Filed 06/13/22 Page 5 of 6 PageID# 33765

1	A.	That's correct.	
2	Q.	In fact, the Han reference doesn't have any specific	
3	dimens	sions, right?	
4	A.	That's correct.	
5	Q.	None, right?	
6	A.	That's correct.	
7	Q.	Okay. And then you also talk about the Xia reference,	
8	right?		
9	A.	Yes.	
10		MR. SOBOLSKI: Let's bring Xia up. I think it's RX 369.	
11	BY MR	. SOBOLSKI:	
12	Q.	Now, you're not do you have it, sir?	
13	A.	I'm trying to find it.	
14	Q.	Take your time, please.	
15	A.	I'm sorry.	
16	Q.	Do you have it?	
17	A.	Yes, I have it.	
18	Q.	Now, you aren't the first person to consider the '911	
19	Patent	t in view of Xia, correct?	
20	A.	That's correct.	
21	Q.	In fact, Xia is one of those references that the Patent	
22	Office	e examiner already considered before allowing the '911	
23	Patent	t, right?	
24	A.	Yes, it was in the file history of the patent.	
25	Q.	The examiners actually considered Xia before allowing the	

**DOCKET A L A R M** Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>.

## DOCKET A L A R M



# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

### **Real-Time Litigation Alerts**



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

#### **Advanced Docket Research**



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## **Analytics At Your Fingertips**



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

#### API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

#### LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

#### FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

#### E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.