# **EXHIBIT 2**

From: SurendraKumar.Ravula@lw.com
Sent: Wednesday, May 4, 2022 12:29 PM

To: Michalik, John M.; RJREDVA; cmolster@molsterlaw.com pmiedva.lwteam@lw.com; Altria.RJRV@weil.com

**Subject:** RE: Case No. 1:20-cv-00393-LO-TCB (E.D. Va.) - Claims / Prior Art Reduction

#### \*\* External mail \*\*

John: We disagree with your characterizations below. Thanks for re-confirming Reynolds' opposition to PMI/Altria's April 29 motion.

#### **Kumar Ravula**

Pronouns: he/him/his

#### **LATHAM & WATKINS LLP**

330 North Wabash Avenue, Suite 2800 | Chicago, IL 60611

D: +1.312.876.6555

From: Michalik, John M. <jmichalik@JonesDay.com>

**Sent:** Wednesday, May 4, 2022 11:13 AM

To: Ravula, Kumar (CH) <SurendraKumar.Ravula@lw.com>; RJREDVA <RJREDVA@jonesday.com>;

cmolster@molsterlaw.com

**Cc:** #C-M PMIEDVA - LW TEAM <pmiedva.lwteam@lw.com>; Altria.RJRV@weil.com **Subject:** RE: Case No. 1:20-cv-00393-LO-TCB (E.D. Va.) - Claims / Prior Art Reduction

Kumar - -

Your email misstates the facts surrounding our exchange leading up to PM/Altria's April 29 motion.

First, your April 25 email incorrectly counted the number of prior art combinations Reynolds had identified for the asserted claims of the '911 patent in the parties' joint submission on April 20. In an April 27 email, I informed you that you had incorrectly counted and explained how you had done so. You then requested that the parties submit a "supplemental filing" regarding Reynolds's identification of prior art combinations, and I responded that Reynolds saw no reason to submit another filing repeating the same prior art combinations the parties already jointly submitted on April 20. We then held a meet and confer, also on April 27, in which I explained again how you had incorrectly counted the number of prior art combinations in the April 20 joint filing. You responded that, with my explanation, you understood how many - - and which - - combinations Reynolds had identified for the claims of the '911 patent. After I explained Reynolds's identification of prior art combinations for the '911 patent during our call, you asked again if Reynolds would agree to a "supplemental filing", and I repeated that Reynolds saw no need to file another paper repeating the same prior art combinations already jointly submitted on April 20. After being corrected on Reynolds's identification of prior art combinations for the '911 patent, you never asserted that Reynolds had identified an excessive or unreasonable number. Then PM filed its motion on April 29.

This email also confirms Reynolds stands by its April 20 identification of prior art combinations for claim 2 of the '911 patent and will be filing its opposition to PM's April 29 motion today.



#### 

John M. Michalik Partner

#### IONES DAY® - One Firm Worldwide™

110 North Wacker Drive Suite 4800 Chicago, Illinois 60606 Office +1.312.269.4215 Mobile +1.312.315.5926 imichalik@jonesday.com

#### \*Please note our new address effective April 25, 2022

From: <u>SurendraKumar.Ravula@lw.com</u> <<u>SurendraKumar.Ravula@lw.com</u>>

Sent: Tuesday, May 3, 2022 5:47 PM

To: Michalik, John M. <jmichalik@JonesDay.com>; RJREDVA <RJREDVA@jonesday.com>; cmolster@molsterlaw.com

Cc: pmiedva.lwteam@lw.com; Altria.RJRV@weil.com

Subject: RE: Case No. 1:20-cv-00393-LO-TCB (E.D. Va.) - Claims / Prior Art Reduction

#### \*\* External mail \*\*

John,

When we met and conferred today, you accused me of not having properly raised our request that RJR reasonably reduce its identification of prior art combinations down from 6 combinations for claim 2 of the '911 patent. That is false. We discussed it on the meet and confer on April 27, 2022 (before we filed our motion) and we requested in writing that RJR reduce its combinations prior to that. Simply put, RJR has refused to reduce its combinations.

For the sake of potentially resolving the dispute, we ask one more time: **does RJR agree to reduce its prior art combinations for claim 2 of the '911 patent?** 

If you confirm RJR is willing to do so in writing by tomorrow (prior to filing your opposition), then the parties can jointly update the Court.

#### **Kumar Ravula**

Pronouns: he/him/his

#### **LATHAM & WATKINS LLP**

330 North Wabash Avenue, Suite 2800 | Chicago, IL 60611

D: +1.312.876.6555

From: Ravula, Kumar (CH)

Sent: Tuesday, May 3, 2022 4:28 PM

To: Michalik, John M. <jmichalik@JonesDay.com>; RJREDVA <RJREDVA@jonesday.com>; cmolster@molsterlaw.com

Cc: #C-M PMIEDVA - LW TEAM pmiedva.lwteam@lw.com; Altria.RJRV@weil.com
Subject: RE: Case No. 1:20-cv-00393-LO-TCB (E.D. Va.) - Claims / Prior Art Reduction

John,

Further to our meet and confer and to clarify our proposal from yesterday, PMI/Altria will agree to withdraw claim 4 of the '374 Patent if Reynolds will agree to the addition of claim 13 of the '911 Patent.

We understand from the meet and confer today that Reynolds opposes the addition of claim 13 from the '911 Patent. Therefore, PMI/Altria will not be withdrawing claim 4 of the '374 Patent at this time.



Thanks,

#### **Kumar Ravula**

Pronouns: he/him/his

#### **LATHAM & WATKINS LLP**

330 North Wabash Avenue, Suite 2800 | Chicago, IL 60611

D: +1.312.876.6555

From: Ravula, Kumar (CH) < SurendraKumar.Ravula@lw.com >

**Sent:** Tuesday, May 3, 2022 12:01 PM

To: Michalik, John M. <<u>jmichalik@JonesDay.com</u>>; RJREDVA <<u>RJREDVA@jonesday.com</u>>; <u>cmolster@molsterlaw.com</u>

Cc: #C-M PMIEDVA - LW TEAM pmiedva.lwteam@lw.com; Altria.RJRV@weil.com
Subject: RE: Case No. 1:20-cv-00393-LO-TCB (E.D. Va.) - Claims / Prior Art Reduction

John,

We are available at 4 pm CT. Please use the dial-in below.

1-877-205-3155 180102

#### **Kumar Ravula**

Pronouns: he/him/his

#### **LATHAM & WATKINS LLP**

330 North Wabash Avenue, Suite 2800 | Chicago, IL 60611

D: +1.312.876.6555

From: Michalik, John M. < jmichalik@JonesDay.com>

Sent: Tuesday, May 3, 2022 11:43 AM

**To:** Ravula, Kumar (CH) < <u>SurendraKumar.Ravula@lw.com</u>>; RJREDVA < <u>RJREDVA@jonesday.com</u>>;

cmolster@molsterlaw.com

Cc: #C-M PMIEDVA - LW TEAM pmiedva.lwteam@lw.com; Altria.RJRV@weil.com
Subject: RE: Case No. 1:20-cv-00393-LO-TCB (E.D. Va.) - Claims / Prior Art Reduction

Kumar - -

Reynolds accepts PM/Altria's withdrawal of claim 4 of the '374 patent. Reynolds opposes PM/Altria's attempt to add claim 13 of the '911 patent. PM/Altria's deadline to identify claims for trial was April 5, and Reynolds has been preparing for trial for a month based on PM/Altria's April 5 disclosure. We are available to meet and confer at 4:00 CT.

John M. Michalik
Partner

JONES DAY® - One Firm Worldwide<sup>sм</sup>

110 North Wacker Drive

Suite 4800 Chicago, Illinois 60606 Office +1.312.269.4215



Mobile +1.312.315.5926 jmichalik@jonesday.com

#### \*Please note our new address effective April 25, 2022

From: <u>SurendraKumar.Ravula@lw.com</u> <<u>SurendraKumar.Ravula@lw.com</u>>

**Sent:** Tuesday, May 3, 2022 10:24 AM

**To:** RJREDVA <RJREDVA@jonesday.com>; cmolster@molsterlaw.com

Cc: pmiedva.lwteam@lw.com; Altria.RJRV@weil.com

Subject: RE: Case No. 1:20-cv-00393-LO-TCB (E.D. Va.) - Claims / Prior Art Reduction

#### \*\* External mail \*\*

Counsel: As a reminder, please let us know if RJR agrees to the modification below. If RJR opposes, please let us know when you are available for a meet and confer today. Thanks.

#### **Kumar Ravula**

Pronouns: he/him/his

#### **LATHAM & WATKINS LLP**

330 North Wabash Avenue, Suite 2800 | Chicago, IL 60611

D: +1.312.876.6555

From: Ravula, Kumar (CH)

Sent: Monday, May 2, 2022 3:28 PM

To: 'RJREDVA' < <a href="mailto:RJREDVA@jonesday.com">RJREDVA@jonesday.com">RJREDVA' < <a href="mailto:RJREDVA@jonesday.com">RJREDVA@jonesday.com</a>; 'cmolster@molsterlaw.com' < <a href="mailto:cmolster@molsterlaw.com">cmolster@molsterlaw.com</a>>

Cc: #C-M PMIEDVA - LW TEAM com; 'Altria.RJRV@weil.com' <<u>Altria.RJRV@weil.com</u>>

Subject: Case No. 1:20-cv-00393-LO-TCB (E.D. Va.) - Claims / Prior Art Reduction

Counsel,

Counterclaim Plaintiffs identify claim 13 of the '911 Patent for trial, and withdraw claim 4 of the '374 patent. Our updated identification of claims for trial is below.

Please confirm that RJR agrees to this amendment and that RJR will provide its reasonable number of prior art references and combinations for claim 13 of the '911 patent by May 6 so that the parties can provide an updated submission to the Court. If RJR opposes, please let us know when you are available for a meet and confer tomorrow.

Patent	Claims
10,420,374	3, 5, 8, 10, 16, 18, 20, 24, 25
10,555,556	4
10,104,911	2, 11, 12, 13
9,814,265	1, 4, 17



# DOCKET

# Explore Litigation Insights



Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## **Real-Time Litigation Alerts**



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time** alerts and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

### **Advanced Docket Research**



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

### **Analytics At Your Fingertips**



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

#### API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

#### **LAW FIRMS**

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

#### **FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS**

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

#### **E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS**

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.

