

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA
ALEXANDRIA DIVISION

RAI STRATEGIC HOLDINGS, INC. AND
R.J. REYNOLDS VAPOR COMPANY

Plaintiffs and
Counterclaim Defendants,

v.

ALTRIA CLIENT SERVICES LLC; PHILIP
MORRIS USA INC.; and PHILIP MORRIS
PRODUCTS S.A.

Defendants and
Counterclaim Plaintiffs.

Case No. 1:20-cv-00393-LO-TCB

ORAL ARGUMENT REQUESTED



**PMI/ALTRIA'S OPPOSITION TO RJR'S *DAUBERT* MOTION TO EXCLUDE
CERTAIN EXPERT OPINIONS OF JOSEPH C. MCALEXANDER**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. FACTUAL BACKGROUND.....	3
III. ARGUMENT.....	6
A. Mr. McAlexander’s Opinions On The Technical Benefits Of The ’545 Patent And How They Relate To FDA Authorization Are Probative And Admissible	6
B. The Court Should Not Preclude Mr. McAlexander From Offering Testimony On Objective Indicia Of Non-Obviousness	10
C. Mr. McAlexander’s Commercial Success Opinions Are Reliable And Based On Sound Methodology	15
D. Mr. McAlexander Provides Detailed DOE Opinions	17
IV. CONCLUSION.....	19

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**CASES**

<i>Apple, Inc. v. Motorola, Inc.</i> , 757 F.3d 1286 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	7, 9
<i>CardioNet, LLC v. ScottCare Corp.</i> , No. 12-cv-2516, 2017 WL 4742476 (E.D. Pa. Oct. 19, 2017)	10
<i>Carnegie Mellon Univ. v. Marvell Tech. Grp., Ltd.</i> , 807 F.3d 1283 (Fed. Cir. 2015)	9
<i>Chrimar Sys., Inc. v. ADTRAN, Inc.</i> , No. 15-cv-00618, 2016 WL 11746545 (E.D. Tex. Nov. 7, 2016)	16
<i>EMC Corp. v. Pure Storage, Inc.</i> , 154 F. Supp. 3d 81 (D. Del. Feb. 11, 2016)	7
<i>Genband US LLC v. Metaswitch Networks Corp.</i> , No. 14-cv-033, 2016 WL 125503 (E.D. Tex. Jan. 9, 2016)	11
<i>Greatbatch Ltd. v. VX Corp.</i> , No. 13-cv-723, 2015 WL 9171042 (D. Del. Dec. 8, 2015)	1
<i>Highland Capital Management, L.P. v. Schneider</i> , 379 F. Supp. 2d 461 (S.D.N.Y. 2005)	11
<i>In re Namenda Direct Purchaser Antitrust Litig.</i> , No. 15-cv-7488, 2019 WL 6242128 (S.D.N.Y. Aug. 2, 2019)	13
<i>In re TMI Litig.</i> , 193 F.3d 613 (3d Cir. 1999)	9
<i>InTouch Techs., Inc. v. VGO Commc'ns, Inc.</i> , 751 F.3d 1327 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	15
<i>Janssen Pharms., Inc. v. Teva Pharms. USA, Inc.</i> , No. 18-cv-734, 2021 WL 5323737 (D.N.J. Nov. 16, 2021)	14
<i>Johns Hopkins Univ. v. Alcon Lab'ys Inc.</i> , No. 15-525, 2018 WL 4178159 (D. Del. Aug. 30, 2018)	13
<i>Johns v. Bayer Corp.</i> , No. 09-cv-1935, 2013 WL 1498965 (S.D. Cal. Apr. 10, 2013)	11
<i>Johnson v. Air & Liquid Sys., Corp.</i> , No. 4:18CV132, 2020 WL 11563846 (E.D. Va. Nov. 6, 2020)	8, 17

<i>Limelight Networks, Inc. v. XO Commnc's, LLC</i> , No. 15-cv-720, 2018 WL 678245 (E.D. Va. Feb. 2, 2018).....	11, 12
<i>Lutron Elecs. Co. v. Crestron Elecs., Inc.</i> , 970 F. Supp. 2d 1229 (D. Utah 2013)	15
<i>Meridian Mfg. v. C&B Mfg.</i> , 340 F. Supp. 3d 808 (N.D. Iowa 2018)	8, 15
<i>Mfg. Res. Int'l, Inc. v. Civiq Smartscares, LLC</i> , No. 17-cv-269, 2019 WL 4198194 (D. Del. Sept. 4, 2019)	10
<i>Miles Labs., Inc. v. Shandon Inc.</i> , 997 F.2d 870 (Fed. Cir. 1993)	17
<i>Mooring Capital Fund, LLC v. Knight</i> , 388 F. App'x 814 (10th Cir. 2010).....	9
<i>Numatics Inc. v. Balluf, Inc.</i> , 66 F. Supp. 3d 934 (E.D. Mich. 2014)	16
<i>Power Integrations, Inc. v. Fairchild Semiconductor Int'l, Inc.</i> , 711 F.3d 1348 (Fed. Cir. 2013)	12
<i>Quanergy Sys., Inc. v. Velodyne Lidar USA, Inc.</i> , No. 2020-2070, 2022 WL 333668 (Fed. Cir. Feb. 4, 2022).....	16
<i>Rambus Inc. v. Hynix Semiconductor Inc.</i> , 254 F.R.D. 597 (N.D. Cal. 2008)	15, 16
<i>S.E.C. v. Lipson</i> , 46 F. Supp. 2d 758 (N.D. Ill. 1998).....	11
<i>Shire ViroPharma Inc. v. CSL Behring LLC</i> , No. 17-cv-414, 2021 WL 1227097 (D. Del. Mar. 31, 2021).....	8, 14
<i>Talkington v. Atria Reclamelucifers Fabrieken BV (Cricket BV)</i> , 152 F.3d 254 (4th Cir. 1998).....	7
<i>TecSec, Inc. v. Adobe Inc.</i> , No. 10-cv-115, 2018 WL 11388472 (E.D. Va. Nov. 21, 2018).....	17
<i>TK-7 Corp. v. Estate of Barbouti</i> , 993 F.2d 722 (10th Cir. 1993)	9
<i>Trading Techs. Int'l, Inc. v. IBG LLC</i> , No. 10-cv-715, 2020 WL 12309207 (N.D. Ill. Oct. 21, 2020).....	12
<i>United Servs. Auto. Ass'n v. Wells Fargo Bank, N.A.</i> , No. 18-cv-00366, 2019 WL 6896677 (E.D. Tex. Dec. 17, 2019).....	13

United States v. Johnson,
54 F.3d 1150 (4th Cir. 1995) 11

United States v. Lujan,
No. 05-cv-0924, 2011 WL 13210238 (D.N.M. July 14, 2011)..... 14

Valley View Dev., Inc. v. United States ex rel. U.S. Army Corps of Eng'rs,
721 F. Supp. 2d 1024 (N.D. Okla. 2010) 14, 15

Westfield Ins. Co. v. Harris,
134 F.3d 608 (4th Cir. 1998)..... 7

Wonderland Nurserygoods Co. v. Thorley Indus. LLC,
No. 13-cv-387, 2015 WL 5021416 (W.D. Pa. 2015) 15, 16

RULES

FED. R. EVID. 703 2, 10, 11, 12

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.