

17-0673-CV

United States Court of Appeals
for the
Second Circuit

PAUL SPINELLI, SCOTT BOEHM, PAUL JASIENSKI, GEORGE NEWMAN
LOWRANCE, DAVID STLUKA, DAVID DRAPKIN, THOMAS E. WITTE,

Plaintiffs-Appellants,

– v. –

NATIONAL FOOTBALL LEAGUE, NFL VENTURES, L.P.,

(For Continuation of Caption See Inside Cover)

ON APPEAL FROM THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK
HONORABLE ROBERT W. SWEET, U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE

**REDACTED JOINT BRIEF
FOR DEFENDANTS-APPELLEES
THE ASSOCIATED PRESS AND REPLAY PHOTOS, L.L.C.**

JURA C. ZIBAS
WILSON ELSER MOSKOWITZ EDELMAN
& DICKER LLP
150 East 42nd Street
New York, New York 10017
(212) 915-5756

*Attorneys for Defendant-Appellee
Replay Photos, L.L.C.*

ANDREW L. DEUTSCH
TAMAR Y. DUVDEVANI
DLA PIPER LLP (US)
1251 Avenue of the Americas
New York, New York 10020
(212) 335-4500

*Attorneys for Defendant-Appellee
The Associated Press*

NFL PRODUCTIONS, L.L.C., NFL ENTERPRISES, L.L.C., REPLAY PHOTOS, L.L.C., ASSOCIATED PRESS, NFL PROPERTIES, LLC, ARIZONA CARDINALS HOLDINGS, INC., ATLANTA FALCONS FOOTBALL CLUB LLC, BALTIMORE RAVENS LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, BUFFALO BILLS, INC., PANTHERS FOOTBALL, INC., CHICAGO BEARS FOOTBALL CLUB, INC., CINCINNATI BENGALS, INC., CLEVELAND BROWNS LLC, DALLAS COWBOYS FOOTBALL CLUB, LTD., DENVER BRONCOS FOOTBALL CLUB, DETROIT LIONS, INC., GREEN BAY PACKERS, INC., HOUSTON NFL HOLDINGS LP, INDIANAPOLIS COLTS, INC., JACKSONVILLEJAGUARS LTD., KANSAS CITY CHIEFS FOOTBALL CLUB, INC., MIAMI DOLPHINS, LTD., MINNESOTA VIKINGS FOOTBALL CLUB LLC, NEW ENGLAND PATRIOTS, LP, NEW ORLEANS LOUISIANA SAINTS, LLC, NEW YORK FOOTBALL GIANTS, INC., NEW YORK JETS FOOTBALL CLUB, INC., OAKLAND RAIDERS LP, PHILADELPHIA EAGLES FOOTBALL CLUB, INC., PITTSBURGH STEELERS SPORTS, INC., SAN DIEGO CHARGERS FOOTBALL CO., SAN FRANCISCO FORTY NINERS LTD., FOOTBALL NORTHWEST LLC, RAMS FOOTBALL CO. LLC, BUCCANEERS LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, TENNESSEE FOOTBALL, INC., WASHINGTON FOOTBALL INC.,

Defendants-Appellees,

GETTY IMAGES (US), INC.,

Defendant.

STATEMENT PURSUANT TO FED. R. APP. P. 26.1

The Associated Press is a not-for-profit news cooperative. It has no parent corporation and no publicly-held stock. No publicly-held corporation owns 10% or more of any interest in The Associated Press.

Replay Photos, LLC is a limited liability company and a subsidiary of Lulu Enterprises, Inc. No publicly-held corporation owns more than 10% of its stock.

Table of Contents

	<u>Page</u>
COUNTERSTATEMENT OF ISSUES PRESENTED.....	1
COUNTERSTATEMENT OF THE CASE.....	2
A. AP’s Photo Library Agreements With the NFL	2
B. The NFL’s Use of Plaintiffs’ Photos Under an AP Sublicense.....	5
C. AP’s Contributor Agreements with Plaintiffs.....	7
1. Execution of the Contributor Agreements.....	7
2. Terms of the Contributor Agreements.....	7
a. <i>General Terms</i>	7
b. <i>License of Plaintiffs’ Copyrights to AP</i>	8
c. <i>Royalty Provisions</i>	9
D. The Economics of the NFL-AP-Plaintiffs’ Relationships	10
E. Plaintiffs’ Continued Performance of their Contributor Agreements	11
F. Relevant Procedural History	13
STANDARD OF REVIEW	15
SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT	15
ARGUMENT	21
I. PLAINTIFFS FAILED TO PLAUSIBLY PLEAD CLAIMS FOR COPYRIGHT INFRINGEMENT	21
A. A License Defense May Be Determined on a Rule 12(b)(6) Motion to Dismiss.....	21
B. The Licenses Granted by Plaintiffs to AP are Unambiguous and Co-Extensive with Plaintiffs’ Own Copyright Rights	22
C. AP Was Entitled to Issue Non-Royalty-Bearing Sublicenses to the NFL	24
D. AP’s Sublicense to the NFL Is Not Retroactive	27
E. <i>Davis v. Blige</i> Does Not Invalidate AP’s Sublicense to the NFL	28
1. The Language in <i>Davis</i> on Which Plaintiffs Rely is Dictum and Not Precedential.....	29

Table of Contents

(continued)

	<u>Page</u>
2. <i>Davis</i> Should Not Be Extended to Invalidate Retroactive Licenses Authorized by a Single Copyright Owner	33
F. The Court Should Affirm the Dismissal of the Copyright Claims.	39
II. PLAINTIFFS FAILED TO PLAUSIBLY PLEAD A CLAIM THAT THEIR CONTRIBUTOR AGREEMENTS WERE INVALID	41
A. Plaintiffs Waived Their Contract Invalidation Claims By Continued Performance of and Accepting Benefits Under Their Contracts	41
B. Plaintiffs Failed to State a Claim for Duress, Fraud, or Unconscionability	44
1. <i>Duress</i>	45
2. <i>Fraud</i>	47
3. <i>Unconscionability</i>	50
III. PLAINTIFFS' OTHER CLAIMS WERE PROPERLY DISMISSED	53
A. Breach of Duty of Good Faith and Fair Dealing	53
B. Breach of Fiduciary Duty.....	54
C. Violation of the Sherman Act	56
CONCLUSION.....	58

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.