Ехнівіт 32-5

DOCKET A L A R M Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>. Casse 66 201-cov-0005080-AADAA Dooccumeentt 1317-65 FFileed 0033 800/2222 FPaggee 21 off 329

EXHIBIT 4

DOCKET A L A R M Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at <u>docketalarm.com</u>. Casse 66 201-0x/00015080-ANDAA Doorcumentt 1317-65 FFileed 0033 (201/2222 FPagge 32 off 329

Trials@uspto.gov 571-272-7822

DOCKET

Paper 9 Date: January 28, 2021

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

INTEL CORPORATION, Petitioner,

v.

PARKERVISION, INC., Patent Owner.

IPR2020-01302 Patent 7,539,474 B2

Before MICHAEL R. ZECHER, BART A. GERSTENBLITH, and IFTIKHAR AHMED, *Administrative Patent Judges*.

GERSTENBLITH, Administrative Patent Judge.

DECISION Granting Institution of *Inter Partes* Review 35 U.S.C. § 314 IPR2020-01302 Patent 7,539,474 B2

I. INTRODUCTION

A. Background

Intel Corporation ("Petitioner") filed a Petition (Paper 3, "Pet.") requesting institution of *inter partes* review of claims 1, 3, 4, 7, and 9–12 ("the Challenged Claims") of U.S. Patent No. 7,539,474 B2 (Ex. 1001, "the '474 patent"). ParkerVision, Inc. ("Patent Owner") filed a Preliminary Response (Paper 8, "Prelim. Resp.").

An *inter partes* review may be instituted only if "the information presented in the petition . . . and any [preliminary] response . . . shows that there is a reasonable likelihood that the petitioner would prevail with respect to at least 1 of the claims challenged in the petition." 35 U.S.C. § 314(a) (2018). For the reasons given below, Petitioner has established a reasonable likelihood that it would prevail in showing the unpatentability of at least one of the challenged claims of the '474 patent. Accordingly, we institute an *inter partes* review of claims 1, 3, 4, 7, and 9–12 of the '474 patent on all grounds raised in the Petition.

B. Related Proceedings

Petitioner and Patent Owner identify the following related matter: *ParkerVision, Inc. v. Intel Corp.*, No. 6:20-cv-108-ADA (W.D. Tex.) ("the related litigation"). Pet. 10; Paper 7 (Patent Owner's Mandatory Notices), 2. In addition, Petitioner filed a petition challenging several claims of U.S. Patent No. 7,110,444 B1, which is related to the '474 patent, in IPR2020-01265. Pet. 10. IPR2020-01302 Patent 7,539,474 B2

C. Real Parties in Interest

Petitioner identifies Intel Corporation as the real party in interest.

Pet. 10. Patent Owner identifies ParkerVision, Inc. as the real party in interest. Paper 7, 2.

D. The Asserted Grounds of Unpatentability and Declaration Evidence

Petitioner challenges the patentability of claims 1, 3, 4, 7, and 9–12 of the '474 patent on the following grounds:

Claim(s) Challenged	35 U.S.C. § ¹	Reference(s)/Basis
1, 3, 4, 9–11	102(b)	Larson ²
1, 3, 4, 7, 9–11	103(a)	Larson, Butler ³
12	102(e)	Arpaia ⁴

Pet. 12. Petitioner supports its challenge with a Declaration by Vivek Subramanian, Ph.D. (Ex. 1002, "the Subramanian Declaration"), a Declaration by Sylvia D. Hall-Ellis, Ph.D. (Ex. 1021), and a Declaration by Christopher Ernst (Ex. 1022).

E. The '474 Patent

The '474 patent is directed to "[m]ethods, systems, and apparatuses for down-converting an electromagnetic (EM) signal by aliasing the EM

¹ The Leahy-Smith America Invents Act ("AIA") included revisions to 35 U.S.C. §§ 102 and 103 that became effective on March 16, 2013. Because the '474 patent has an effective filing date before March 16, 2013, we apply the pre-AIA versions of the statutory bases for unpatentability. ² *RF and Microwave Circuit Design for Wireless Communications* (Lawrence E. Larson, ed., Artech House Publishers 1996) (Ex. 1005, "Larson").

³ U.S. Patent No. 4,603,436, issued July 29, 1986 (Ex. 1006, "Butler").

⁴ U.S. Patent No. 6,192,225 B1, issued Feb. 20, 2001 (Ex. 1007, "Arpaia").

DOCKET A L A R M



Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.