



**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
TEXARKANA DIVISION**

MAXELL, LTD.,

Plaintiff,

v.

APPLE INC.,

Defendant.

Case No. 5:19-cv-00036-RWS

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED



**MAXELL, LTD.'S OPPOSITION TO APPLE INC.'S AMENDED
MOTION TO TRANSFER VENUE PURSUANT TO 28 U.S.C. § 1404(a)**



TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. BACKGROUND	2
A. Maxell’s Extensive Contacts in the Eastern District	2
B. Apple’s Extensive Contacts in Texas	4
III. LEGAL STANDARD	6
IV. [REDACTED]	7
V. ARGUMENT	9
A. Ease of Access to Sources of Proof Weighs Against Transfer.	9
1. <i>Apple’s Alleged Evidence</i>	9
2. <i>Third-Party Evidence</i>	11
3. <i>Maxell’s Evidence</i>	12
B. Compulsory Process to Secure the Attendance of Witnesses is Neutral.	13
C. The Cost of Attendance of Willing Witnesses Weighs Against Transfer	16
1. <i>Apple’s Identified Witnesses</i>	16
2. <i>Third-Party Witnesses</i>	17
3. <i>Maxell Witnesses</i>	19
D. Other Practical Problems Weigh Against Transfer	20
E. Court Congestion Weighs Against Transfer	21
F. Local Interest is Neutral	23
G. The Familiarity with Governing Law is Neutral	24
H. Unnecessary Problems of Conflict of Laws is Neutral	25
VI. CONCLUSION	25



TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Acqis LLC v. EMC Corp.</i> , 67 F. Supp. 3d 769 (Fed. Cir. 2009)	23
<i>Affinity Labs of Tex. v. Samsung Elecs. Co., Ltd.</i> , 968 F. Supp. 2d 852 (E.D. Tex. Sept. 17, 2013).....	9
<i>Cellular Communications Equipment LLC v. Apple Inc.</i> , 6:14-cv-00251 (E.D. Tex.).....	17
<i>CIT Group/Commercial Services, Inc. v. Romansa Apparel, Inc.</i> , No. 3:02-CV-1954, 2003 WL 169208 (N.D. Tex. Jan. 21, 2003).....	13, 17
<i>ContentGuard Holdings, Inc. v. Amazon.com, Inc.</i> , No. 2:13-CV-1112, 2015 WL 1885256 (E.D. Tex. Apr. 24, 2015), <i>mandamus denied</i> , 650 Fed. Appx. 771 (Fed. Cir. 2015)	7, 8, 24, 25
<i>Conversant Wireless Licensing S.A.R.L., v. Apple Inc.</i> , No. 5:15-cv-05008-NC (N.D. Cal.)	15
<i>e-Watch Inc. v. Apple, Inc.</i> , No. 2:13-CV-01061, 2016 WL 7338342 (E.D. Tex. Dec. 19, 2016)	<i>passim</i>
<i>EVS Codec Techns., LLC v. LG Elecs., Inc.</i> , No. 2:18-cv-00343, 2019 WL 2904747 (E.D. Tex. July 5, 2019)	7, 8
<i>In re Genentech, Inc.</i> , 566 F.3d 1338 (Fed. Cir. 2009).....	6, 10
<i>Godo Kaisha IP Bridge I v. Intel Corp.</i> , No. 2:17-CV-00676, 2018 WL 5728524 (E.D. Tex. Aug. 29, 2018).....	20, 21
<i>Golden Bridge Technology Inc. v. Apple Inc.</i> , No. 5:12-cv-04882-PSG (N.D. Cal.)	15
<i>In re Hoffmann-La Roche Inc.</i> , 587 F.3d 1333 (Fed. Cir. 2009).....	23
<i>Implicit, LLC v. Palo Alto Networks, Inc.</i> , No. 6:17-CV-00336, 2018 WL 1942411 (E.D. Tex. Feb. 20, 2018).....	21
<i>Maxell Ltd. v. ZTE (USA) Inc.</i> , No. 5:16-cv-00179-RWS (E.D. Tex.).....	12, 21



Maxell, Ltd. v. Huawei Device USA Inc.,
No. 5:16-cv-00178-RWS (E.D. Tex.).....21

Maxell, Ltd. v. ZTE Corp.,
5:18-cv-0034-RWS (E.D. Tex.).....21

In re Morgan Stanley,
417 Fed. Appx. 947 (Fed. Cir. 2011).....20

Omni MedSci, Inc., v. Apple Inc.,
No. 2:18-cv-134, Dkt. 63, 1 (E.D. Tex. Oct. 29, 2018)11, 18

Oyster Optics, LLC v. Coriant (USA) Inc.,
No. 2:16-CV-01302, 2017 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 221068 (E.D. Tex. Dec. 8, 2017).....11

Papst Licensing GmbH & Co., KG v. Apple, Inc.,
No. 6:15-CV-1095, 2016 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 177687 (E.D. Tex. Sept. 30, 2016)..... *passim*

Payne v. Grayco Cable Services, Inc.,
No. 1:11-CV-487, 2011 WL 13076902 (E.D. Tex. Dec. 8, 2011)13, 17

Repp v. Webber,
No. 90-c-4086, 1990 WL 205899 (N.D. Ill. Dec. 6, 1990).....19

Salazar v. HTC Corporation,
No. 2:16-CV-01096, 2017 WL 8943155 (E.D. Tex. Oct. 19, 2017)19

Seven Networks, LLC v. Google LLC,
2018 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 146375 (E.D. Tex. Aug. 14, 2018)19

Smartflash LLC v. Apple Inc.,
No. 6:13-cv-00447 (E.D. Tex.).....17

St. Lawrence Communs. LLC v. Apple Inc.,
No. 2:16-cv-82, 2017 WL 3712153 (E.D. Tex. Feb. 6, 2017).....16

Stragent, LLC v. Intel Corp.,
No. 6:11-cv-00421 (E.D. Tex.).....14

Tessera Advanced Technologies, Inc. v. Samsung Electronics Co., Ltd.,
No. 2:17-CV-00671, 2018 WL 8014281 (E.D. Tex. Sept. 5, 2018).....8

Tire Serv. Equip. Mfg. Co. v. Gaither Tool Co.,
No. 13-2996, 2014 WL 1671498 (D. Minn. April 23, 2014).....19

In re Toa Techs., Inc.,
543 F. App'x 1006 (Fed. Cir. 2013)10



TracBeam, LLC v. Apple, Inc.,
No. 6:14-CV-680, 2015 WL 5786449 (E.D. Tex. Sept. 29, 2015).....10, 12, 13

Uniloc USA, Inc. v. Cisco Sys., Inc.,
No. 6:15-CV-1175, 2017 WL 959856 (E.D. Tex. Mar. 13, 2017)8

Uniloc USA, Inc. v. Huawei Device USA, Inc.,
No. 2:17-CV-00736, 2018 WL 7138384 (E.D. Tex. Sept. 6, 2018).....18, 21

Valencell, Inc. v. Apple Inc.,
No. 5:16-CV-1, 2017 WL 491646 (E.D.N.C. Feb. 6, 2017).....8, 9

In re Verizon Bus. Network Servs.,
635 F.3d 559 (Fed. Cir. 2011).....20

VirnetX Inc. v. Apple, Inc.,
No. 6:10-cv-4171, 17

In re Vistaprint Ltd.,
628 F.3d 1342 (Fed. Cir. 2010).....20

In re Volkswagen,
371 F.3d 201 (5th Cir. 2004)6, 7

In re Volkswagen,
545 F.3d at 3156, 9, 25

VS Technologies, LLC v. Twitter, Inc.,
No. 2:11cv43, 2011 WL 11074291 (E.D. Va. June 28, 2011).....24

Statutes

19 U.S.C. § 1337(a)(3)(C)22

28 U.S.C. § 1404.....6, 9

Other Authorities

Rule 45(c)(1)(B).....5

Rule 45(c)(1)(B)(ii).....14, 16

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.