

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS  
TEXARKANA DIVISION

MAXELL, LTD. §  
§  
V. § CAUSE NO. 5:19-CV-00036-RWS  
§  
APPLE, INC. §

---

MINUTES FOR PRETRIAL CONFERENCE  
HELD BEFORE JUDGE ROBERT W. SCHROEDER III  
MARCH 10, 2021

OPEN: 10:00 a.m.

ADJOURN: 1:46 p.m.

---

ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF: Jamie Beaber, Geoffrey Culbertson, Tripp Fussell, Kfir Levy, Bryan Nese, Saqib Siddiqui and Kelly Tidwell

ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT: Sean Cunningham, Mark Fowler, Erin Gibson, Gil Gillam and Michael Jay

LAW CLERK: Susan Stradley

COURTROOM DEPUTY: Shedera Combs

COURT REPORTER: Kate McAlpine

---

10:00 a.m. Case called; Parties introduce themselves and announce ready; Court welcomes everyone; Court reviews pretrial proceedings; Court reviews logistics of trial - courtroom setup, voir dire, trial day, protocols

10:07 a.m. Mark Fowler asks when and where to send COVID test results; Court responds; Mr. Fowler requests partial waiver (one day) for test of a witness; Court will allow; Mr. Fowler inquires about remote courtroom, including number of individuals allowed, enter/exit policy, testing of participants, video/audio to overflow as well as to other remote parties; Court responds; Mr. Fowler notifies Court of potential issue with Apple's first witness; Court responds

10:21 a.m. Geoff Culbertson asks for clarification re testing experts; Court responds; Mr. Culbertson asks about location of testifying witness in courtroom; Court responds; Mr. Culbertson asks about number allowed in courtroom.

- 10:26 a.m. Mr. Fowler asks for clarification on location of jury and parties during trial
- 10:27 a.m. Court reviews voir dire procedures; Court will allow parties to set up equipment on Friday prior to voir dire, Monday after voir dire or Tuesday morning
- 10:39 a.m. Gil Gillam asks if mini-opening statements will be allowed during voir dire; Court will allow
- 10:40 a.m. Mr. Culberston asks when panel list and questionnaires will be available; Court will make them available Friday at noon for pick up; Mr. Culbertson asks for copies of letter to panel and final questionnaire; Court will provide
- 10:40 a.m. Court reviews normal trial day
- 10:42 a.m. Court reviews exchange of witness and exhibit lists; Parties agreement is acceptable; Court explains exhibit procedure
- 10:46 a.m. Court explains use of clock - no sidebars, jury will be removed from courtroom if necessary; Parties will be charged time
- 10:47 a.m. Court will not require in-person meet and confer; Issues where no agreement is reached should be filed on the docket by 10 p.m.
- 10:48 a.m. Court reviews sealing courtroom procedure
- 10:49 a.m. Court will allow jury notebooks if parties agree
- 10:50 a.m. Mr. Gillam asks re panel list and questionnaires; Court will make them available electronically at the parties request
- 10:54 a.m. Court sets the following time limits: voir dire - 45 minutes, openings - 45 minutes, presentation - 18 hours per side and closing - 45 minutes; Court will consider lengthening closing to one hour
- 10:56 a.m. Mr. Culbertson asks if closing can be split between attorneys; Court responds; Mr. Gillam asks for clarification of voir dire time; Court responds
- 10:58 a.m. Mr. Cunningham questions re overflow courtroom when sealed; Court responds
- 10:59 a.m. Court questions re parties agreement to carry deposition designations to trial; Kfir Levy responds
- 10:59 a.m. Mr. Levy reviews remaining MIL issues and states agreement as to MIL #5
- 11:02 a.m. Erin Gibson argues re striking portion of Mulhern testimony re estimated sales

price

- 11:07 a.m. Mr. Levy responds
- 11:10 a.m. Ms. Gibson responds
- 11:12 a.m. Court questions re new opinions; Mr. Levy responds
- 11:14 a.m. Court requests copies of full reports; Mr. Levy responds
- 11:15 a.m. Mr. Gillam argues updated damages information
- 11:17 a.m. Mr. Levy responds
- 11:23 a.m. Court questions re relief sought; Mr. Gillam responds
- 11:24 a.m. Mr. Levy responds
- 11:25 a.m. Court requests Mr. Levy and Mr. Gillam to meet and confer
- 11:26 a.m. Michael Jay argues re MIL #10 relating to the 282 notice
- 11:30 a.m. Trip Fussell responds re MIL #10
- 11:32 a.m. Court asks Apple to provide expert report and two patents; Mr. Jay responds
- 11:32 a.m. Mr. Cunningham addresses two patents re prosecution history estoppel
- 11:34 a.m. Bryan Nese responds
- 11:36 a.m. Mr. Cunningham responds and provides citations
- 11:39 a.m. Mr. Nese responds
- 11:41 a.m. Jamie Beaber notifies Court MIL #5 is agreed as written; Mr. Jay responds
- 11:42 a.m. Mr. Fowler argues re MIL #6 re Steve Jobs
- 11:43 a.m. Court questions re three axis gyro; Mr. Nese responds; Mr. Fowler responds
- 11:45 a.m. Kelly Tidwell responds
- 11:47 a.m. Court questions how to test; Mr. Tidwell responds

- 11:49 a.m. Court questions re purpose of Apple's MIL #6; Mr. Fowler responds
- 11:51 a.m. Court questions re exchange of opening slides; Mr. Beaber responds; Mr. Fowler responds
- 11:52 a.m. Mr. Jay argues re Apple's MIL #8
- 11:53 a.m. Mr. Tidwell responds
- 11:54 a.m. Court will allow inquiry as to owning stock; Mr. Jay responds; Mr. Tidwell responds
- 11:55 a.m. Recess
- 12:14 p.m. Ms. Gibson follows up on Mulhern's damages calculations
- 12:17 p.m. Mr. Levy responds
- 12:20 p.m. Court questions when opinion/report was first disclosed to Apple; Mr. Levy responds
- 12:21 p.m. Ms. Gibson responds
- 12:23 p.m. Mr. Levy responds
- 12:24 p.m. Court questions re new opinion; Mr. Levy responds
- 12:26 p.m. Court questions re why just now disclosed; Mr. Levy responds
- 12:28 p.m. Court questions re prejudice; Ms. Gibson responds
- 12:30 p.m. Court asks if deposition would solve; Ms. Gibson responds; Mr. Levy responds
- 12:33 p.m. Court requires Maxell to produce witness for deposition by Monday; Apple may filed motion to strike by Tuesday; Maxell response due Wednesday
- 12:34 p.m. Mr. Nese addresses objections to DX 69, 70 and 67
- 12:37 p.m. Mr. Jay responds
- 12:38 p.m. Court if Apple cannot lay proper foundation they will not come in; Mr. Nese asks for clarification on when to raise objection during trial; Court responds
- 12:40 p.m. Mr. Levy addresses objections to DX 130, 131, 134, 135 and 470 stating the objections are withdrawn

12:40 p.m. Saqib Siddiqui addresses objections to DX 311-316

12:43 p.m. Mr. Fowler responds

12:46 p.m. Court questions re prejudice; Mr. Siddiqui responds; Mr. Fowler responds

12:48 p.m. Court will allow as demonstrative and may allow to be admitted during trial

12:48 p.m. Mr. Tidwell states that Apple is withdrawing DX 472; Ms. Gibson confirms

12:49 p.m. Ms. Gibson states Apple has withdrawn all objections except for foundation as to PX 63-65, 67-68, 70, 57, 58 and 59

12:49 p.m. Ms. Gibson addresses objection to PX78

12:50 p.m. Mr. Levy responds

12:52 p.m. Ms. Gibson states objection is withdrawn

12:52 p.m. Mr. Gillam addresses objection to PX 80, 81, 83, 84 and 86

12:54 p.m. Mr. Tidwell responds

12:56 p.m. Mr. Gillam responds

12:58 p.m. Court question why needs to come in; Mr. Tidwell responds; Court asks for cases that have allowed license into evidence; Mr. Tidwell responds

12:59 p.m. Mr. Gillam responds

1:00 p.m. Mr. Tidwell responds

1:00 p.m. Mr. Gillam responds

1:00 p.m. Ms. Gibson addresses objections to exhibits PX 87-89, 90 and 97-102

1:02 p.m. Mr. Tidwell responds

1:04 p.m. Ms. Gibson responds

1:05 p.m. Court questions re wilfulness; Mr. Gibson responds

1:06 p.m. Ms. Gibson addresses objection to exhibit PX 226

1:08 p.m. Mr. Tidwell responds

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.