

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
TEXARKANA DIVISION**

MAXELL, LTD.,

Plaintiff,

v.

APPLE INC.,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 5:19-cv-00036

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

**MAXELL, LTD.'S REPLY IN SUPPORT OF ITS MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY
JUDGMENT OF NO INVALIDITY OF U.S. PATENT NOS. 6,748,317, 6,580,999, AND
6,430,498 IN VIEW OF THE ABOWD AND CYBERGUIDE ALLEGED PRIOR ART**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. This Court Should Give No Weight to Inadmissible Evidence 1

II. Apple Cannot Show That Abowd or Cyberguide Qualify As Prior Art..... 2

 A. Abowd’s Public Accessibility 2

 B. Cyberguide’s Public Use..... 4

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Acceleration Bay, LLC v. Activision Blizzard Inc.</i> , 908 F.3d 765 (Fed. Cir. 2018).....	3
<i>Advanceme, Inc. v. Rapidpay</i> , No. 6:05-CV-424, 2007 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 117675 (E.D. Tex. July 9, 2007)	1, 2
<i>Blue Calypso, LLC v. Groupon, Inc.</i> , 815 F.3d 1331 (Fed. Cir. 2016).....	2
<i>Brandon v. Sage Corp.</i> , 808 F.3d 266 (5th Cir. 2015)	1
<i>Candela Corp. v. Palomar Med. Techs., Inc.</i> , No. 9:06-CV-277, 2008 WL 11441909 (E.D. Tex. Sept. 24, 2008).....	4
<i>Clock Spring, L.P. v. Wrapmaster, Inc.</i> , 560 F.3d 1317 (Fed. Cir. 2009).....	5
<i>Colucci v. Callaway Golf Co.</i> , 750 F. Supp. 2d 767 (E.D. Tex. 2010).....	5
<i>Cummins-Allison Corp. v. Glory Ltd.</i> , 2006 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 105083 (E.D. Tex. Jan. 23, 2006).....	2
<i>Dey, L.P. v. Sunovion Pharm., Inc.</i> , 715 F.3d 1351 (Fed. Cir. 2013).....	5
<i>Galindo v. Precision American Corp.</i> , 754 F. 2d 1212 (5th Cir. 1985)	3
<i>Intergraph Corp. v. Intel Corp.</i> , No. 2:01-cv-160, 2002 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 29660 (E.D. Tex. June 18, 2002)	2
<i>Invitrogen Corp. v. Biocrest Mfg., L.P.</i> , 424 F.3d 1374 (Fed. Cir. 2005).....	4
<i>Juicy Whip, Inc. v. Orange Bang, Inc.</i> , 292 F.3d 728 (Fed. Cir. 2002).....	5
<i>Krim v. BancTexas Grp., Inc.</i> , 989 F.2d 1435 (5th Cir. 1993)	1, 3

..

Oram v. Linderman,
No. CV-12-02450-PHX-FJM (BSB), 2014 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 78138 (D. Ariz.
June 9, 2014).....2

Stamps.com Inc. v. Endicia, Inc.,
437 F. App'x 897 (Fed. Cir. 2011)4

Other Authorities

Fed. R. Civ. P. 56(c)(2).....2

...

TABLE OF EXHIBITS**(Including Exhibits From Maxell's Motion, Dkt. 382)**

Exhibit No.	Description
1	Excerpts from the Opening Expert Report of Dr. Joseph A. Paradiso Regarding Invalidity of U.S. Patent Nos. 6,748,317, 6,580,999, and 6,430,498 (May 7, 2020)
2	Expert Report of Robert L. Stoll (June 4, 2020)
3	Expert Report of Jacob Robert Munford Concerning Publication and Public Accessibility and exhibits (May 7, 2020)
4	Deposition Transcript of Jacob R. Munford (June 19, 2020)
5	Document entitled "Cyberguide: A Mobile Context-Aware Tour Guide" ("Abowd")

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.