

PUBLIC VERSION

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
TEXARKANA DIVISION**

MAXELL, LTD.,

Plaintiff,

v.

APPLE INC.,

Defendant.

Case No. 5:19-cv-00036-RWS

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

PUBLIC VERSION

**MAXELL, LTD.'S OPPOSITION TO APPLE INC.'S DAUBERT MOTION
TO EXCLUDE CONCLUSORY TESTIMONY AND OPINIONS OF MAXELL'S
EXPERTS RELATING TO DOCTRINE OF EQUIVALENTS AND SOURCE CODE**

PUBLIC VERSION

Table of Contents

	PAGE
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. ARGUMENT	2
A. Apple ignores the context and scope of Maxell’s DOE opinions	2
B. Prosecution history estoppel does not bar Dr. Brogioli’s DOE opinions	6
C. Dr. Rosenberg’s structural equivalents opinions are also proper	10
D. Apple mischaracterizes Maxell’s source code opinions	11
III. CONCLUSION.....	15

PUBLIC VERSION

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>Fractus, S.A. v. Samsung Elecs. Co.</i> , No. 6:09-cv-203, 2012 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 90398 (E.D. Tex. June 28, 2012)	2
<i>GeoTag, Inc. v. Frontier Communications Corp.</i> , No. 2:10-cv-00265, 2014 WL 282731 (E.D. Tex. Jan. 24, 2014)	6
<i>Intervet Inc. v. Merial Ltd.</i> , 617 F.3d 1282 (Fed. Cir. 2010).....	7, 9
<i>Paice LLC v. Toyota Motor Corp.</i> , 504 F.3d 1293 (Fed. Cir. 2007).....	2
<i>Spectrum Pharms., Inc. v. Sandoz Inc.</i> , 802 F.3d 1326 (Fed. Cir. 2015).....	6
<i>Whirlpool Corp. v. TST Water, LLC</i> , No. 2:15-cv-01528, 2018 WL 1536875 (E.D. Tex. Mar. 29, 2018).....	8

PUBLIC VERSION

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Description
Maxell	Plaintiff Maxell, Ltd.
Apple	Defendant Apple Inc.
Madiseti Rpt.	Initial Expert Report of Vijay Madiseti, Ph.D. Concerning Apple's Infringement of U.S. Patent No. 8,339,493, served May 7, 2020 Relevant Excerpts at Ex. 1
Bims Rpt.	Opening Expert Report of Dr. Harry V. Bims Regarding Invalidity of U.S. Patent No. 6,408,193, served May 7, 2020 Relevant Excerpts at Ex. 2
Vojcic Rpt.	Initial Expert Report of Branimir Vojcic, Ph.D. Concerning Apple's Infringement of U.S. Patent No. 6,408,193, served May 7, 2020 Relevant Excerpts at Ex. 3
Bystrom Rpt.	Initial Expert Report of Maja Bystrom, Ph.D. Concerning Apple's Infringement of U.S. Patent No. 10,084,991, served May 7, 2020 Relevant Excerpts at Ex. 4
Williams Rpt.	Initial Expert Report of Tim Williams, Ph.D. Concerning Apple's Infringement of U.S. Patent No. 10,212,586 Relevant Excerpts at Ex. 5
Brogioli Rpt.	Initial Expert Report of Michael C. Brogioli, Ph.D. Concerning Apple's Infringement of U.S. Patent No. 6,329,794, served May 14, 2020 Relevant Excerpts at Ex. 6
Menascé Rpt.	Rebuttal Expert Report of Dr. Daniel A. Menascé Regarding Non-Infringement of U.S. Patent No. 6,329,794, served June 11, 2020 Relevant Excerpts at Ex. 11
Rosenberg Rpt.	Initial Expert Report of Craig Rosenberg, Ph.D. Concerning Apple's Infringement of U.S. Patent Nos. 6,748,317, 6,430,498, and 6,580,999, served May 7, 2020 Relevant Excerpts at Ex. 12
Maher Rpt.	Initial Expert Report of Robert Maher, Ph.D. Concerning Apple's Infringement of U.S. Patent No. 6,928,306, served May 7, 2020 Relevant Excerpts at Ex. 13
Bims Dep. Tr.	Deposition transcript of Dr. Harry V. Bims dated June 24, 2020 Relevant Excerpts at Ex. 14
Rosenberg Dep. Tr.	Deposition transcript of Craig Rosenberg, Ph.D. dated June 15, 2020 Relevant Excerpts at Ex. 15

..

PUBLIC VERSION

Madiseti Dep. Tr.	Deposition transcript of Vijay Madiseti, Ph.D. dated June 25, 2020 Relevant Excerpts at Ex. 16
-------------------	---

...

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.