

PUBLIC VERSION

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
TEXARKANA DIVISION**

MAXELL, LTD.,

Plaintiff,

v.

APPLE INC.,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 5:19-cv-00036

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

PUBLIC VERSION

**MAXELL, LTD.'S MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT OF
NO INVALIDITY OF U.S. PATENT NOS. 6,748,317, 6,580,999, AND 6,430,498
IN VIEW OF THE NAVTALK ALLEGED PRIOR ART**

PUBLIC VERSION

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	LEGAL STANDARD.....	2
III.	STATEMENT OF UNDISPUTED FACTS	3
IV.	STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES FOR THE COURT TO DECIDE	5
V.	ARGUMENT	5
VI.	CONCLUSION.....	11

PUBLIC VERSION
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
CASES	
<i>Anderson v. Liberty Lobby, Inc.</i> , 477 U.S. 242 (1986).....	3
<i>Carella v. Starlight Archery</i> , 804 F.2d 135 (Fed. Cir. 1986).....	2, 5
<i>Celotex Corp. v. Catrett</i> , 477 U.S. 317 (1986).....	2
<i>Clock Spring, L.P. v. Wrapmaster, Inc.</i> , 560 F.3d 1317 (Fed. Cir. 2009).....	3
<i>Couch v. Howell</i> , 49 U.S.P.Q. (BNA) 595 (S.D. Fla. May 26, 1941), aff’d, 127 F.2d 975, 53 U.S.P.Q. (BNA) 531 (5th Cir. 1942)	5
<i>Eason v. Thaler</i> , 73 F.3d 1322 (5th Cir. 1996)	2
<i>In re Ekenstam</i> , 256 F.2d 321 (CCPA 1958)	9
<i>Finnigan Corp. v. Int’l Trade Commission</i> , 180 F.3d 1354 (Fed. Cir. 1999).....	3
<i>Forsyth v. Barr</i> , 19 F.3d 1527 (5th Cir. 1994)	2
<i>Gandy v. Main Belting Co.</i> , 143 U.S. 587 (1892).....	8
<i>In re Hall</i> , 781 F.2d 897 (Fed. Cir. 1986).....	2, 5
<i>Hilgraeve, Inc. v. Symantec Corp.</i> , 271 F. Supp. 2d 964 (E.D. Mich. 2003).....	3
<i>Juicy Whip, Inc. v. Orange Bang, Inc.</i> , 292 F.3d 728 (Fed. Cir. 2002).....	3
<i>Microsoft Corp. v. i4i Limited Partnership</i> , 131 S. Ct. 2238, 564 U.S. 91 (2011).....	2

..

PUBLIC VERSION

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES—continued

	Page(s)
<i>Minnesota Min. & Mfg. Co. v. Chemque, Inc.</i> , 303 F.3d 1294 (Fed. Cir. 2002).....	2, 5
<i>Navico Inc.</i> , No. 2:16-CV-00190-JRG-RSP, 2017 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 139806.....	10
<i>Ragas v. Tenn. Gas Pipeline Co.</i> , 136 F.3d 455 (5th Cir. 1998)	2
<i>Tone Bros., Inc. v. Sysco Corp.</i> , 28 F.3d 1192 (Fed. Cir. 1994).....	6
<i>Zimmer Tech. Inc. v. Howmedica Osteonics Corp.</i> , 476 F. Supp. 2d 1024 (N.D. Ind. 2007)	3

STATUTES

35 U.S.C. § 102.....	5, 9
35 U.S.C. § 282.....	2

OTHER AUTHORITIES

Fed. R. Civ. P. 56(c)	2
-----------------------------	---

...

PUBLIC VERSION
TABLE OF EXHIBITS

Exhibit No.	Description
1	Excerpts from the Opening Expert Report of Dr. Joseph A. Paradiso Regarding Invalidity of U.S. Patent Nos. 6,748,317, 6,580,999, and 6,430,498 (May 7, 2020)
2	Expert Report of Robert L. Stoll (June 4, 2020)
3	Declaration of David Ayres (March 24, 2020)
4	Deposition Transcript of L. Kent Broddle (April 17, 2020)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.