

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
TEXARKANA DIVISION

MAXELL, LTD. §
§
V. § CAUSE NO. 5:19-CV-00036-RWS
§
APPLE, INC. §

MINUTES FOR MARKMAN and MOTIONS HEARING
HELD BEFORE JUDGE ROBERT W. SCHROEDER III
JANUARY 8, 2020

OPEN: 10:01 a.m.

ADJOURN: 6:04 pm

ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF: See Attorney Sign-In Sheet

ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANT: See Attorney Sign-In Sheet

TECHNICAL ADVISOR: Shane Nelson

LAW CLERK: Melissa Keech

COURTROOM DEPUTY: Betty Schroeder

COURT REPORTER: Anna Lafrenz

10:01 a.m. Case called; parties make introductions and announce ready; Court welcomes everyone

10:04 a.m. Mr. Saqid Siddiqui begins with the term “device for getting location information denoting a present place of said terminal”; agrees with Court’s construction

10:10 a.m. Ms. LuAnn Simmons argues the term

10:13 a.m. Court questions Ms. Simmons; Ms. Simmons responds

10:16 a.m. Court questions Ms. Simmons; Ms. Simmons responds

10:25 a.m. Court questions Ms. Simmons; Ms. Simmons responds

10:30 a.m. Court questions Ms. Simmons; Ms. Simmons responds

10:33 a.m. Mr. Siddiqui responds to Ms. Simmons' argument

10:41 a.m. Court questions Mr. Siddiqui; Mr. Siddiqui responds

10:42 a.m. Ms. Simmons responds

10:46 a.m. Mr. Siddiqui responds

10:47 a.m. Mr. Siddiqui argues the terms "a device for getting location information of another portable terminal from said another portable terminal via connected network"; "a device for getting a location information of another portable terminal"; and "a device for retrieving a route from said present place to said destination"

10:50 a.m. Ms. Simmons responds to argument

10:52 a.m. Mr. Siddiqui responds

10:53 a.m. Ms. Simmons responds

10:54 a.m. Mr. Siddiqui responds

10:56 a.m. Ms. Simmons responds

10:57 a.m. Mr. Tripp Fussell argues the term "capacity detector for detecting a remaining capacity of said battery"

11:11 a.m. Court questions Mr. Fussell; Mr. Fussell responds

11:14 a.m. Ms. Simmons responds to argument

11:15 a.m. Court questions Ms. Simmons; Ms. Simmons responds

11:18 a.m. Court questions Ms. Simmons; Ms. Simmons responds

11:33 a.m. Court questions Ms. Simmons; Ms. Simmons responds

11:35 a.m. Mr. Fussell responds

11:38 a.m. Court questions Mr. Fussell; Mr. Fussell responds

11:43 a.m. Ms. Simmons responds

11:45 a.m. Mr. Fussell responds

11:47 a.m. Recess

1:02 p.m. Mr. Fussell argues the term “ringing sound generator”

1:14 p.m. Ms. Simmons responds to argument

1:17 p.m. Court questions Ms. Simmons; Ms. Simmons responds

1:19 p.m. Court questions Ms. Simmons; Ms. Simmons responds

1:27 p.m. Court questions Ms. Simmons; Ms. Simmons responds

1:29 p.m. Mr. Fussell responds

1:31 p.m. Court questions Mr. Fussell; Mr. Fussell responds

1:32 p.m. Ms. Simmons responds

1:34 p.m. Mr. Fussell responds

1:35 p.m. Mr. Kfir Levy argues the term “an input unit for receiving an input entered by a user”

1:38 p.m. Court questions Mr. Levy; Mr. Levy responds

1:43 p.m. Court questions Mr. Levy; Mr. Levy responds

1:44 p.m. Ms. Simmons responds to argument

1:55 p.m. Mr. Levy responds

2:03 p.m. Ms. Simmons responds

2:04 p.m. Mr. Levy argues the term “means for selecting an object displayed on said display apparatus”

2:07 p.m. Ms. Simmons responds to argument

2:09 p.m. Mr. Levy responds

2:10 p.m. Mr. Levy argues the term “display apparatus”

2:13 p.m. Court questions Mr. Levy; Mr. Levy responds

2:19 p.m. Court questions Mr. Levy; Mr. Levy responds

2:22 p.m. Mr. Tony Beasley responds to argument

2:23 p.m. Court addresses Mr. Beasley; Mr. Beasley responds

2:28 p.m. Mr. Levy responds

2:31 p.m. Court questions Mr. Levy; Mr. Levy responds

2:32 p.m. Recess

2:52 p.m. Mr. Bryan Nese argues the term “effective scanning lines M of a display screen”

2:55 p.m. Mr. Vincent Zhou responds to argument

2:59 p.m. Court questions Mr. Zhou; Mr. Zhou responds

3:06 p.m. Court questions Mr. Zhou; Mr. Zhou responds

3:10 p.m. Mr. Nese responds

3:14 p.m. Court questions Mr. Nese; Mr. Nese responds

3:17 p.m. Mr. Zhou responds

3:21 p.m. Court questions Mr. Nese; Mr. Nese responds

3:22 p.m. Mr. Nese advises that Maxell agrees to the Court’s construction of the “culling” and “mixing” terms

3:22 p.m. Mr. Zhou argues the “culling” term

3:26 p.m. Court questions Mr. Zhou; Mr. Zhou responds

3:27 p.m. Mr. Nese responds to argument

3:31 p.m. Mr. Zhou responds

3:34 p.m. Mr. Nese responds

3:35 p.m. Mr. Zhou argues the “mixing” term

3:38 p.m. Mr. Nese responds to argument

3:40 p.m. Mr. Zhou responds

3:41 p.m. Mr. Siddiqui argues the term “communication apparatus”

3:43 p.m. Mr. Beasley responds to argument

3:43 p.m. Court questions Mr. Beasley; Mr. Beasley responds

3:47 p.m. Mr. Siddiqui responds

3:50 p.m. Mr. Beasley responds

3:51 p.m. Courtroom sealed

3:51 p.m. Mr. Beasley argues Apple’s Motion to Compel Licensing and Negotiation Documents (dkt. #156)

4:00 p.m. Court questions Mr. Beasley; Mr. Beasley responds

4:03 p.m. Mr. Levy responds to argument

4:18 p.m. Mr. Beasley responds

4:19 p.m. Mr. Levy responds

4:20 p.m. Mr. Zhou argues Apple’s Motion to Compel Compliant Infringement Contentions (dkt. #123)

4:28 p.m. Court questions Mr. Zhou; Mr. Zhou responds

4:36 p.m. Mr. Siddiqui responds to argument

4:57 p.m. Court questions Mr. Siddiqui; Mr. Siddiqui responds

5:00 p.m. Mr. Zhou responds

5:00 p.m. Court questions Mr. Zhou; Mr. Zhou responds

5:08 p.m. Mr. Siddiqui responds

5:09 p.m. Court questions Mr. Siddiqui; Mr. Siddiqui responds

5:12 p.m. Mr. Khou responds

5:15 p.m. Court questions Mr. Siddiqui; Mr. Siddiqui responds

5:17 p.m. Recess - Courtroom unsealed

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.