

EXHIBIT I

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
TEXARKANA DIVISION

MAXELL, LTD.,)	Case No.
)	5:19-cv-00036-RWS
Plaintiff)	
)	
vs.)	
)	
APPLE, INC.,)	
)	
Defendant)	

Videotaped Deposition of Craig Rosenberg, Ph.D.
Washington, D.C.
October 29, 2019
9:02 a.m.

Reported by: Bonnie L. Russo
Job No. 170304

1 CRAIG ROSENBERG, PH.D.

2 compute the position of the receiver.

3 So this is yet another example of
4 location -- technology that can give you
5 location information.

6 Q. Is it fair to say that interpreting
7 this paragraph and other parts of the patent,
8 which, as you -- as you've mentioned was a
9 translation from Japanese, that you've relied
10 on your knowledge, your experience as one
11 skilled in the art to interpret what the
12 inventor was probably trying to convey?

13 A. I think that's the role of an
14 expert, is to -- to look through the patent and
15 to opine as to what one of skill in the art at
16 the time of the invention would understand.

17 So unless I've misunderstood your
18 question, I -- that's what I did. And I
19 believe that that's what's expected of an
20 expert to do. That's the role of -- of the
21 expert in this case.

22 Q. Going back to Paragraph 46, again in
23 that -- in that part of the patent where it
24 refers to infrared ray sensors or the like.

25 Do you see that?

1 CRAIG ROSENBERG, PH.D.

2 A. I do see that.

3 Q. What does the phrase "or the like"
4 mean to you?

5 A. To me that would mean that -- other
6 technologies that can get location information.
7 I mentioned earlier in the deposition magnetic
8 technologies to do six multiple degrees of
9 freedom. I mentioned ultrasonic to collect
10 position information.

11 So "or the like" would be other
12 technologies that can also get position
13 information, such as cell phone triangulation,
14 GPS, infrared, ultrasonic, magnetic,
15 inertial -- you know, gravitational- and
16 inertial-based sensors. There's a variety.

17 Q. Can you think of any types of
18 structures that would be excluded by the phrase
19 "or the like"?

20 A. Well, I mean I don't mean to be
21 glib, but like a -- a bridge is a structure but
22 I don't think the -- the -- the patentee
23 intended things that were outside the scope of
24 collecting location-based information. So --

25 Q. Uh-huh.

1 CRAIG ROSENBERG, PH.D.

2 A. -- the context is location-based
3 information. Structures that are outside of
4 technologies to collect location-based
5 information is the domain that we're speaking
6 of here.

7 Q. Sure.

8 So you think "or the" -- the phrase
9 "or the like" basically refers to any structure
10 that is capable of collecting location
11 information data; is that fair to say?

12 A. Well, I don't see any disavows, if
13 you will, or anything in the patents that
14 the -- the patentee is -- is saying that this
15 technology I'm not considering and should not
16 be considered for collecting it.

17 So my read, when I see -- when I see
18 a list of -- of technologies that can collect
19 location-based information and then followed by
20 "or the like" would be or other similar
21 technologies that can also collect
22 location-based information. That's my
23 understanding.

24 Q. And that itself is not limited to --
25 you gave examples: magnetic, ultrasonic.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.