## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS MARSHALL DIVISION

UNILOC 2017 LLC		
Plaintiff,		
vs.		Case No. 2:18-cv-00514
AT&T MOBILITY LLC, and AT&T SERVICES, INC.,		Jury Trial Demanded
Defendants.	/	

## **ERICSSON INC.'S MOTION TO INTERVENE AS A DEFENDANT**

# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	FACTUAL BACKGROUND	2
A.	THE NATURE AND STATE OF PROCEEDINGS	
В.	Uniloc Asserts Infringement of Accused Products That Are Designed, Manufactured, Marketed and Sold by Ericsson	3
III.	LEGAL STANDARD	
IV.	ARGUMENT	5
A.	ERICSSON HAS A RIGHT TO INTERVENE PURSUANT TO RULE 24(A)(2)	5
1.	. Ericsson's Motion to Intervene is Timely	5
2.	. Ericsson Has a Significant Interest in This Lawsuit	7
3.		
4.	. AT&T Cannot Adequately Represent Ericsson's Interests	10
В.	In the Alternative, Ericsson Should Be Permitted to Intervene	
V.	CONCLUSION	

# **TABLE OF AUTHORITIES**

	rage(s)
Cases	
Kahn v. Gen. Motors Corp., 889 F.2d 1078 (Fed. Cir. 1989)	7
City of Houston v. Am. Traffic Sols., Inc., 668 F.3d 291 (5th Cir. 2012)	4
Edwards v. City of Houston, 78 F.3d 983 (5th Cir. 1996) (en banc)4	, 5, 6, 11
Hacienda Records, L.P. v. Ramos, 718 F.App'x 223 (5th Cir. 2018)	10
Heaton v. Monogram Credit Card Bank, 297 F.3d 416 (5th Cir. 2002)	11
Honeywell Int'l Inc. v. Audiovox Commc'ns Corp., Case No. 04-1337-KAJ, 2005 WL 2465898 (D. Del. May 18, 2005)	7, 10
Indus. Tech. Research Inst. v. LG Elecs., Inc., Case No. 3:13-cv2016-GPC-WVG, 2014 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 148865 (S.D. Cal. Oct. 15, 2014)	9
Intellectual Ventures I LLC v. AT&T Mobility LLC, C.A. No. 12-193-LPS et al., 2014 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 125280 (D. Del. Sept. 8, 2014)	8, 10
John Doe No. 1 v. Glickman, 256 F.3d 371 (5th Cir. 2001)	5
Microsoft Corp. v. Commonwealth Scientific & Indus. Research Organisation, No. 6:06-CV-549, 2007 WL 4376104 (E.D. Tex. Dec. 13, 2007)	7
Newby v. Enron Corp., 443 F.3d 416 (5th Cir. 2006)	4, 11
Reid v. General Motors Corp., 240 F.R.D. 257 (E.D. Tex. 2006)	12
Select Retrieval, LLC v. ABT Elecs., No. 11 C 03752, 2013 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 174442 (N.D. Ill. Dec. 13, 2013)	9



## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES CONT.

Sierra Club v. Espy,	
18 F.3d 1202 (5th Cir. 1994)	4, 6, 7
Stauffer v. Brooks Brothers, Inc.,	
619 F.3d 1321 (Fed. Cir. 2010)	4
Team Worldwide Corp. v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.,	
Civ. Action No. 2:17-cv-00235-JRG, 2017 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 201769	
(E.D. Tex. Dec. 7, 2017)	8, 9
Texas v. United States,	
805 F.3d 653 (5th Cir. 2015)	4, 5, 7, 10
TiVo Inc. v. AT&T, Inc.,	
C.A. No. 2:09-CV-259, 2010 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 146363	
(E.D. Tex. Mar. 31, 2010)	6
U.S. Ethernet Innovations, LLC v. Acer, Inc.,	
Civil No. 6:09-cv-448-JDL, 2010 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 150649	
(E.D. Tex. May 10, 2010)	8, 11
Uniloc 2017 LLC et al. v. AT&T, Inc. et al.,	
Case No. 2-18-cv-00379 (E.D. Tex. Aug. 29, 2018)	2
Uniloc 2017 LLC v. Verizon Commc'ns Inc., et al.,	
Case No. 2-12-cv-00513 (E.D. Tex. Nov. 29, 2018)	2
Other Authorities	
Fed R Civ P 24	1-5 10-12

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 24, Ericsson Inc. ("Ericsson") moves for leave to intervene in the above-titled action.<sup>1</sup> Ericsson seeks to intervene because it sells equipment to Defendants AT&T Mobility LLC and AT&T Services, Inc. (together, "AT&T") that Plaintiff Uniloc 2017 LLC ("Uniloc") alleges infringe a Uniloc patent. As the designer and manufacturer of accused products, Ericsson has a substantial interest in the litigation and is in the best position to defend against certain of Uniloc's claims. Ericsson's Motion is timely, and no existing party will suffer prejudice if Ericsson intervenes. Moreover, Ericsson's intervention will not result in the case being delayed, and Ericsson will not move to transfer the case if this Motion is granted.

### I. INTRODUCTION

In its complaint, Uniloc accuses AT&T of infringing three patents. Uniloc alleges that one of those three patents is infringed through AT&T's use of cellular base stations that implement a 4G LTE feature called "LTE Licensed Assisted Access" ("LTE-LAA"). Ericsson sells base stations to AT&T that implement the accused LTE-LAA feature.

Ericsson moves to intervene as a matter of right. As the designer and manufacturer of accused products, Ericsson is in the best position to defend those products against Uniloc's infringement allegations. Ericsson has an interest in the litigation because the dispute's existence alone could negatively affect Ericsson's ability to sell its base station products to AT&T and other customers.

AT&T cannot adequately represent Ericsson's interests in this litigation because AT&T does not possess the same thorough understanding of Ericsson's products. In addition, AT&T's defensive strategies may be divided between Ericsson's and other suppliers' products, which could

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Filed with this Motion is Ericsson's Answer in Intervention as well as a proposed order.



# DOCKET

# Explore Litigation Insights



Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

# **Real-Time Litigation Alerts**



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time** alerts and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

# **Advanced Docket Research**



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

# **Analytics At Your Fingertips**



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

### API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

#### **LAW FIRMS**

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

#### **FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS**

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## **E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS**

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.

