

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
I. RELEVANT BACKGROUND.....	1
II. B.E.’S MOTION TO DISMISS SHOULD BE DENIED.....	1
A. Match’s Counterclaims Satisfy The Notice Pleading Requirements Of Fed. R. Civ. P. 8.....	2
B. Match’s Counterclaims Are Adequately Pled Under The Federal Rules Of Civil Procedure	5
III. B.E.’S MOTION TO STRIKE SHOULD BE DENIED	6
A. Motions To Strike Are Disfavored	6
B. B.E.’s Claim That The <i>Iqbal/Twombly</i> Standard Applies To Affirmative Defenses Should Be Rejected.....	7
C. Each of Match’s Affirmative Defenses Has Been Adequately Pled.....	10
1. Non-Infringement	10
2. Invalidity	11
3. Prosecution History Estoppel.....	12
4. No Injunctive Relief.....	13
5. Patent Misuse	14
6. Failure To State A Claim	14
7. Estoppel, Waiver, Implied License, Express License, Laches	15
8. Good Faith, Limitation on Patent Damages, Patent Marking, Invalid Claim	16
9. Unclean Hands, Estoppel, Acquiescence, and/or Other Equitable Defenses.....	17
IV. CONCLUSION.....	17

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

CASES

<i>Ashcroft v. Iqbal</i> , 556 U.S. 662 (2009).....	passim
<i>Avocent Redmond Corp. v. U.S.</i> , No. 08-69C, 2009 WL 367499 (Ct. Fed. Cl. Feb. 5, 2009)	10
<i>Barry Fiala, Inc. v. Arthur Blank & Co., Inc.</i> , No. 2:02-cv-2282, 2003 WL 22309442 (W.D. Tenn., Feb. 19, 2003)	6
<i>Bayer CropScience AG v. Dow AgroSciences LLC</i> , No. 10-1045 RMB-JS, 2011 WL 6934557 (D. Del. Dec. 30, 2011)	9
<i>Bell Atlantic Corp. v. Twombly</i> , 550 U.S. 544 (2007).....	passim
<i>Brown & Williamson Tobacco Corp. v. United States</i> , 201 F.2d 819 (6th Cir.1953)	6, 7
<i>Conley v. Gibson</i> , 355 U.S. 41 (1957).....	2
<i>Damron v. ATM Central LLC</i> , No. 1:10-cv-01210-JDB-egb, 2010 WL 6512345 (W.D. Tenn. Oct. 29, 2010).....	6, 9
<i>Duramed Pharms., Inc. v. Watson Labs., Inc.</i> , No. 308-CV-00116-LRH-RAM, 2008 WL 5232908 (D. Nev. Dec. 12, 2008).....	12, 17
<i>eBay Inc. v. MercExchange, L.L.C.</i> , 547 U.S. 388 (2006).....	13
<i>Elan Pharma Intern. Ltd. v. Lupin Ltd.</i> , No. 09-1008 (JAG), 2010 WL 1372316 (D.N.J. March 31, 2010).....	2, 4, 11
<i>Festo Corp. v. Shoketsu Kinzoku Kogyo Kabushiki Co.</i> , 493 F.3d 1368 (Fed. Cir. 2007)	12
<i>First Nat'l Ins. Co. of Am. v. Camps Servs.</i> , No. 08-cv-12805, 2009 WL 22861 (E.D. Mich. Jan. 5, 2009)	8
<i>Gen-Probe Inc. v. Becton Dickinson and Co.</i> , No. 09-cv-2319-BEN, 2010 WL 4442731 (S.D. Cal. Nov. 1, 2010)	14
<i>Graphic Packaging Int'l, Inc. v. C.W. Zumbiel Co.</i> , No. 1:10-cv-3008, 2011 WL 5829674 (N.D. Ga. Aug. 1, 2011).....	12
<i>In re Bill of Lading Transmission and Processing Sys. Patent Litig.</i> , 681 F.3d 132 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	5
<i>Keene Corp. v. United States</i> , 508 U.S. 200 (1993).....	8

Kilgore-Wilson v. Home Depot U.S.A.,
 No. 2:11-cv-02601-JTF, 2012 WL 4062663 (W.D. Tenn. Sept. 14, 2012)..... passim

K-Tech Telecomm, Inc. v. Time Warner Cable, Inc.,
 714 F.3d 1277 (Fed. Cir. 2013) 5

Mark IV Industries Corp. v. Transcore, L.P.,
 No. 09-418, 2009 WL 4828661 (D. Del. Dec. 2, 2009) 15

McLemore v. Regions Bank,
 Nos. 3:08-cv-0021 & 3:08-cv-1003, 2010 WL 1010092 (M.D. Tenn. Mar. 18, 2010)..... 8

McZeal v. Sprint Nextel Corp.,
 501 F.3d 1354 (Fed. Cir. 2007) 5

Microsoft Corp. v. Phoenix Sol’ns, Inc.,
 741 F. Supp. 2d 1156 (C.D. Cal. 2010) 4

Montgomery v. Wyeth,
 580 F.3d 455 (6th Cir. 2009) 8, 10

MTA Metro-North R.R. v. Buchanan Marine, L.P.,
 No. 05 Civ. 881, 2006 WL 3655244, (D. Conn. Dec. 8, 2006)..... 15

Paducah River Painting, Inc. v. McNational, Inc.,
 No. 5:11-cv-00135-R, 2011 WL 5525938 (W.D. Ky. Nov. 14, 2011)..... 12

Penn Mut. Life Ins. Co. v. Norma Espinosa 2007-1 Ins. Trust,
 No. 09-300-LPS, 2011 WL 710970 (D. Del. Feb. 22, 2011) 9

Pfizer Inc. v. Apotex Inc.,
 726 F. Supp. 2d 921 (N.D. Ill. 2010) 4, 12

Rosada v. John Wieland Homes & Neighborhoods, Inc.,
 No. 3:09-cv-653-J-20MCR, 2010 WL 1249841 (M.D. Fla. Mar. 25, 2010) 15

Schinzing v. Mid-States Stainless, Inc.,
 415 F.3d 807 (8th Cir. 2005) 2

Senju Pharms. v. Apotex, Inc.,
 Civ. No. 12-159-SLR, 2013 WL 444928 (D. Del. Feb. 6, 2013) 8

Sun Microsystems, Inc. v. Versata Enterprises, Inc.,
 630 F. Supp. 2d 395 (D. Del. 2009)..... 16

Symbol Techs., Inc. v. Aruba Networks, Inc.,
 609 F. Supp. 2d 353 (D. Del. 2009)..... 3, 16

Teirstein v. AGA Medical Corp.,
 No. 6:08cv14, 2009 WL 704138 (E.D. Tex. Mar. 16, 2009)..... 12, 13

Trading Tech. Int’l, Inc. v. BCG Partners, Inc.,
 No. 10-cv-715, 2011 WL 3946581 (N.D. Ill. Sept. 2, 2011)..... 11

Under Sea Indust., Inc. v. Dacor Corp.,
 833 F.2d 1551 (Fed.Cir.1987) 2

Zenith Radio Corp. v. Hazeltine Research,
 395 U.S. 100 (1969)..... 14

FEDERAL STATUTES

35 U.S.C. § 101..... 3, 11
 35 U.S.C. § 102..... 3, 11
 35 U.S.C. § 103..... 3, 11
 35 U.S.C. § 105..... 12
 35 U.S.C. § 112..... 3, 11
 35 U.S.C. § 285..... 16
 35 U.S.C. § 286..... 16
 35 U.S.C. § 287..... 16
 35 U.S.C. § 288..... 16

FEDERAL RULES

Fed. R. Civ. P. 8..... 2, 11
 Fed. R. Civ. P. 8(a) 2, 3, 4, 7
 Fed. R. Civ. P. 8(a)(2)..... 2
 Fed. R. Civ. P. 8(b) 7, 15
 Fed. R. Civ. P. 8(b)(1)..... 11
 Fed. R. Civ. P. 8(b)(1)(a) 7
 Fed. R. Civ. P. 8(c) 7, 14, 15, 16
 Fed. R. Civ. P. 11 3
 Fed. R. Civ. P. 12..... 12
 Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6)..... 1
 Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(f)..... 1, 6, 7
 Fed. R. Civ. P. 84..... 5
 Fed. R. Civ. P., Form 18 1, 5
 Fed. R. Civ. P., Form 30 1, 5, 15

STATE RULES

Local Patent Rule 3.1 1
 Local Patent Rule 3.3..... 4
 Local Patent Rule 3.5..... 4

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.