

No. 21-869

IN THE
Supreme Court of the United States

ANDY WARHOL FOUNDATION FOR
THE VISUAL ARTS, INC.,

Petitioner,

v.

LYNN GOLDSMITH, *et al.*,

Respondents.

ON WRIT OF CERTIORARI TO THE UNITED STATES
COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE SECOND CIRCUIT

**BRIEF OF *AMICI CURIAE* ELECTRONIC
FRONTIER FOUNDATION AND
ORGANIZATION FOR TRANSFORMATIVE
WORKS IN SUPPORT OF PETITIONER**

CORYNNE MCSHERRY
Counsel of Record
CARA GAGLIANO
ELECTRONIC FRONTIER FOUNDATION
815 Eddy Street
San Francisco, CA 94109
(415) 436-9333
corynne@eff.org

Counsel for Amici Curiae

312893



COUNSEL PRESS

(800) 274-3321 • (800) 359-6859

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	i
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES	iii
INTEREST OF AMICI CURIAE.....	1
INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY OF ARGUMENT.....	2
ARGUMENT.....	4
I. Fair Use Breathing Space Is More Important Than Ever.....	4
II. The Second Circuit’s Factor One Analysis Confuses Far More Than It Clarifies and Would Stifle New Creativity	12
A. Two works of visual art (or any two works in a roughly similar medium) do not necessarily share the “same overarching purpose”.....	12
B. In many cases, transformativeness cannot be assessed without considering intent and audience	14
C. Many digital transformative uses recognizably derive from and retain essential elements of the original	17

Table of Contents

	<i>Page</i>
III. The Factor One Analysis Should Be Flexible and Tied to the Circumstances of the Case—including, Where Appropriate, the Intended Audience of the Work	19
IV. The Court Should Take This Opportunity to Reassess the Factor Four Burden	23
CONCLUSION	26

TABLE OF CITED AUTHORITIES

	<i>Page</i>
Cases	
<i>Adjmi v. DLT Entm't Ltd.</i> , 97 F. Supp. 3d 512 (S.D.N.Y. 2015)	20
<i>Andy Warhol Found. for the Visual Arts, Inc. v. Goldsmith</i> , 11 F.4th 262 (2d Cir. 2021)	17, 19
<i>Art of Living Found. v. Does 1–10</i> , 2011 WL 5444622 (N.D. Cal. Nov. 9, 2011)	20
<i>Authors Guild v. Google, Inc.</i> , 804 F.3d 202 (2d Cir. 2015)	25
<i>Bateman v. Mnemonics, Inc.</i> , 79 F.3d 1532 (11th Cir. 1996)	23
<i>Blanch v. Koons</i> , 467 F.3d 244 (2d Cir. 2006)	21
<i>Bleistein v. Donaldson Lithographing</i> , 188 U.S. 239 (1903)	23
<i>Cambridge Univ. Press v. Patton</i> , 769 F.3d 1232 (11th Cir. 2014)	24
<i>Campbell v. Acuff-Rose Music, Inc.</i> , 510 U.S. 569 (1994)	<i>passim</i>

Cited Authorities

	<i>Page</i>
<i>Dubner v. City and Cnty. of S.F.</i> , 266 F.3d 959 (9th Cir. 2001)	24, 26
<i>Eldred v. Ashcroft</i> , 537 U.S. 186 (2003)	4
<i>Golan v. Holder</i> , 565 U.S. 302 (2012)	4
<i>Google LLC v. Oracle Am., Inc.</i> , 141 S. Ct. 1183 (2021)	<i>passim</i>
<i>Hughes v. Benjamin</i> , 437 F. Supp. 3d 382 (S.D.N.Y. 2020)	20
<i>In re DMCA Subpoena to Reddit, Inc.</i> , 441 F. Supp. 3d 875 (N.D. Cal. 2020)	9, 11, 20
<i>Kelly v. Arriba Soft Corp.</i> , 336 F.3d 811 (9th Cir. 2003)	22
<i>Kirtsaeng v. John Wiley & Sons</i> , 568 U.S. 519 (2013)	6
<i>Lenz v. Universal Music Corp.</i> , 815 F.3d 1145 (9th Cir. 2016)	11, 23
<i>Magnum Photos Int’l, Inc. v. Houk Gallery, Inc.</i> , 2018 WL 4538902 (S.D.N.Y. Sept. 21, 2018)	22

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.