

No. 21-1218

In The
Supreme Court of the United States

—◆—
TYLER AYRES, *et al.*,

Petitioners,

v.

INDIRECT PURCHASER PLAINTIFFS,
TOSHIBA CORPORATION, SAMSUNG SDI CO., LTD.,
KONINKLIJKE PHILIPS, N.V., THOMSON SA,
HITACHI LTD., PANASONIC CORPORATION, *et al.*,

Respondents.

—◆—
**On Petition For A Writ Of Certiorari
To The United States Court Of Appeals
For The Ninth Circuit**

—◆—
REPLY BRIEF
—◆—

TRACY R. KIRKHAM
JOHN D. BOGDANOV
COOPER & KIRKHAM, P.C.
357 Tehama Street,
Second Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103
Telephone: (415) 788-3030
trk@coopkirk.com
jdb@coopkirk.com

JOHN G. CRABTREE
Counsel of Record
CHARLES M. AUSLANDER
BRIAN C. TACKENBERG
CRABTREE & AUSLANDER
240 Crandon Blvd.
Suite 101
Key Biscayne, FL 33149
Telephone: (305) 361-3770
jcrabtree@crabtreelaw.com

[Additional Counsel Listed On Inside Cover]

COCKLE LEGAL BRIEFS (800) 225-6964
WWW.COCKLELEGALBRIEFS.COM

FRANCIS O. SCARPULLA
PATRICK B. CLAYTON
LAW OFFICES OF
FRANCIS O. SCARPULLA
3708 Clay Street
San Francisco, CA 94118
Telephone: (415) 751-4193
fos@scarpullalaw.com
pbc@scarpullalaw.com

THERESA D. MOORE
LAW OFFICES OF
THERESA D. MOORE
One Sansome Street,
35th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94104
Telephone: (415) 613-1414
tmoore@aliotolaw.com

BRIAN M. TORRES
BRIAN M. TORRES, P.A.
One S.E. Third Avenue,
Suite 3000
Miami, FL 33131
Telephone: (305) 901-5858
btorres@briantorres.legal

ROBERT J. BONSIGNORE
BONSIGNORE, LLC
3771 Meadowcrest Drive
Las Vegas, NV 89121
Telephone: (781) 856-7650
rbonsignore@classactions.us

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ARGUMENT	1
I. The courts of appeals are divided over whether a judgment moots a pending intervention appeal.....	1
A. Two circuits have expressly recognized the circuit split that the Respondents deny exists.....	1
B. The Respondents recast the issue to evade the circuit split.....	2
C. The circuit split is clear and persistent....	3
1. The Second Circuit has consistently applied the minority rule	3
2. The Ninth Circuit remains in disarray	4
3. The D.C. Circuit remains in disarray	6
II. The case presents an appropriate vehicle to address the split.....	7
A. The Petitioners did not concede mootness	7
B. The Respondents’ other arguments about why they think they should ultimately win are inapt.....	9
C. Non-publication does not impede this Court’s review.....	11
III. The jurisdictional MDL issue supports granting certiorari.....	12

TABLE OF CONTENTS—Continued

	Page
A. The Ninth Circuit’s failure to reach the issue does not preclude review.....	12
B. The issue is important.....	13
C. The MDL jurisdictional issue does not hinder review.....	13
CONCLUSION.....	14

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page
CASES	
<i>Andrus v. Texas</i> , 140 S.Ct. 1875 (2020)	12
<i>C.I.R. v. McCoy</i> , 484 U.S. 3 (1987)	12
<i>CVLR Performance Horses, Inc. v. Wynne</i> , 792 F.3d 469 (4th Cir. 2015).....	1
<i>DBSI/TRI IV Ltd. P'ship v. United States</i> , 465 F.3d 1031 (9th Cir. 2006).....	6
<i>DeOtte v. State</i> , 20 F.4th 1055 (5th Cir. 2021).....	1
<i>Dunn v. Reeves</i> , 141 S.Ct. 2405 (2021)	12
<i>Energy Transportation Group, Inc. v. Maritime Administration</i> , 956 F.2d 1206 (D.C. Cir. 1992).....	6, 7
<i>Intec USA, LLC v. Engle</i> , 467 F.3d 1038 (7th Cir. 2006)	14
<i>Kunz v. New York State Comm'n on Judicial Misconduct</i> , 155 Fed. App'x 21 (2d Cir. 2005)	3, 4
<i>Lopez v. NLRB</i> , 655 Fed. App'x 859 (D.C. Cir. 2016)	6, 7
<i>Mitchell v. Forsyth</i> , 472 U.S. 511 (1985).....	12
<i>National Bulk Carriers v. Princess Management Co.</i> , 597 F.2d 819 (2d Cir. 1979)	3, 4
<i>New York City Transit Auth. v. Beazer</i> , 440 U.S. 568 (1979)	12
<i>Nixon v. Fitzgerald</i> , 457 U.S. 731 (1982).....	12
<i>Sinochem Intern. Co. Ltd. v. Malaysia Intern. Shipping Corp.</i> , 549 U.S. 422 (2007).....	13

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.