UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

IAPARTMENTS, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

EDST, LLC,
Patent Owner.

U.S. Patent No. 11,189,118

Post Grant Review of U.S. Patent No. 11,189,118

Post Grant Review No. PGR2022-00059

DECLARATION OF PHILIP C. DUMAS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

I. INTRODUCTION 25

II. QUALIFICATIONS 27

A. Education Background And Career History 27

B. Patents 28

III. MATERIAL REVIEWED 30

IV. RELEVANT LEGAL STANDARDS 30

A. Person of Ordinary Skill In The Art (POSA) 30

B. Prior Art 31

C. Anticipation 32

D. Obviousness 32

E. Claim Construction 37

F. Written Description 38

V. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART 39

VI. TECHNOLOGY BACKGROUND 39

VII. THE ’ 118 PATENT 44

A. Overview 44

B. Prosecution History Of The ’118 Patent 46

VIII. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION 50

A. “offline door lock” 51

B. “credential device” 52

IX. PRIOR ART REFERENCES 53

A. Cahill (Ex.1005).....53

B. Kraus (Ex.1006).....55

C. Deros (Ex.1007).....60

D. Ho (Ex.1008).....62

E. Wired (Ex.1013) 64

X. ANALYSIS.....69

A. Ground 1: Claims 1-20 Lack Of Written Description Of The Smart Hub Communicatively Coupled To A User Device Via A Non-LoRaWAN Communication Link 75

B. Ground 2: Claims 1-20 Are Obvious In Light Of Cahill And Deros 84

1. Motivation to Combine Cahill and Deros.....84

a. LoRa WAN.....85

b. Smart Thermostats And Other Smart Devices 87

c. Smart Thermostat Hub.....88

d. Smart Hub Communicatively Couple To User Device 90

2. Independent Claim 1 93

a. [1pre] "A system for controlling and securing a plurality of smart devices within a unit of a multi-family residential or commercial property, the system comprising:".....93

b. [1a] "a smart hub comprising: one or more processors; a memory communicatively coupled to the one or more processors".....95

c. [1b] "a first communication interface configured to communicatively couple the one or more processors to a

Long Range (LoRa) wide area network (LoRaWAN) communication link; and” 96

d. [1c] “a second communication interface configured to communicatively couple the one or more processors to the plurality of smart devices and to a user device associated with an occupant of the unit via a non-LoRaWAN communication link;” 98

e. [1d] “where the one or more processors are configured to: receive control information via the LoRaWAN communication link from a property management platform for the multi-family residential or commercial property, the control information including a request for a status check associated with an electronic door lock,” 102

f. [1e] “identify at least one smart device of the plurality of smart devices based on the control information, the at least one smart device including the electronic door lock, ...104

transmit a command derived from the control information to the at least one smart device via the non-LoRaWAN communication link” 104

g. [1f] “receive status information from the electronic door lock via the non-LoRaWAN communication link based on transmission of the command, and 105

transmit the status information to the property management platform for the multi-family residential or commercial property via the LoRaWAN communication link.” 105

3. Claim 2 107

a. [2a] “The system of claim 1 where electronic door lock comprises an offline door lock and” 107

b. [2b] “the command is further configured to disable at least one access credential stored at a memory of the offline door lock.” 108

...

4. Claim 3 – "The system of claim 1 where: the one or more processors are configured to derive a second command from the control information, the second command to be transmitted to a second smart device of the at least one smart device via the non-LoRaWAN communication link, the second smart device comprises a thermostat and the second command is configured to adjust a temperature setting of the thermostat, or the second smart device comprises a smart light fixture and the second command is configured to turn off or turn on the smart light fixture." 110

5. Claim 4 – "The system of claim 1 where the one or more processors, the first communication interface, the second communication interface, and the memory are integrated within a housing of a thermostat." 112

6. Claim 5 – "The system of claim 1 where the smart hub is coupled to electrical wiring at the multi-family residential or commercial property." 113

7. Claim 6 – "The system of claim 1 where the smart hub is located within the unit of the multi-family residential or commercial property." 114

8. Claim 7 114

    a. [7a] "The system of claim 1 where: the non-LoRaWAN communication link comprises at least one of a Wireless Fidelity (Wi-Fi) communication link, a ZigBee communication link, and a Bluetooth communication link," 114

    b. [7b] "the second communication interface is configured to directly couple the one or more processors to the plurality of smart devices via the non-LoRaWAN communication link, and" 114

    c. [7c] "communicatively coupling the one or more processors to the user device enables user interaction with the smart hub." 114

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.