

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY

---

HELSINN HEALTHCARE S.A. and  
ROCHE PALO ALTO LLC.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

DR. REDDY'S LABORATORIES, LTD.,  
DR. REDDY'S LABORATORIES, INC.,  
SANDOZ INC., TEVA PHARMACEUTICALS  
USA, INC., and TEVA PHARMACEUTICAL  
INDUSTRIES, LTD.,

Defendants.

---

:  
:  
:  
:  
: Civil Action No. 11-3962 (MLC)(DEA)  
: Civil Action No. 11-5579 (MLC)(DEA)  
: (consolidated)



**EXPERT REPORT OF LEE KIRSCH, PH.D.**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
I. QUALIFICATIONS.....	1
II. SUMMARY OF OPINIONS.....	3
A. Legal Standards.....	3
B. Summary Of Opinions.....	4
III. PERSON OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART.....	5
IV. THE ASSERTED PATENTS.....	7
A. The ‘724 Patent.....	7
B. The ‘725 Patent.....	8
C. The ‘424 Patent.....	8
V. BACKGROUND OF THE TECHNOLOGY.....	9
A. 5-HT <sub>3</sub> Compounds As Therapeutic Agents For The Treatment Of Emesis.....	9
B. Selected Prior Art Relevant to Intravenous Palonosetron Formulations.....	10
1. The ‘333 Patent.....	10
C. The Approach of a POSA In Preparing Formulations For Intravenous Administration.....	22
1. Formulation Principles.....	22
2. Strategies for Preformulation Studies.....	23
3. Strategies for Formulation Screening and Optimization Studies.....	29
VI. PLAIN AND ORDINARY MEANING OF “PHARMACEUTICALLY STABLE”.....	30
VII. THE CLAIMS OF THE ASSERTED PATENTS ARE INVALID.....	33
A. Claims 2 And 9 Of The ‘724 Patent Are Obvious.....	34
1. Claim 2 is Obvious in View of the ‘333 Patent and the Knowledge of One of Ordinary Skill in the Art.....	34

a.	A POSA would have been motivated to make an intravenous palonosetron formulation at the time of the alleged invention.....	35
b.	A POSA would have been motivated to improve stability of an intravenous palonosetron formulation.....	39
c.	<i>“Palonosetron or a pharmaceutically acceptable salt thereof is in a concentration of about 0.05 mg/ml” would have been obvious.</i> .....	40
d.	<i>“Buffered at a pH from 4.0 to 6.0” would have been obvious.</i> .....	44
e.	<i>“A pharmaceutically acceptable sterile aqueous carrier including a tonicifying effective amount of mannitol” would have been obvious.</i> .....	46
f.	<i>“From 0.005 mg/ml to 1.0 mg/ml of EDTA” would have been obvious.</i> .....	47
g.	<i>“Pharmaceutically stable”</i> would have been obvious. ....	50
h.	<i>“For reducing emesis or reducing the likelihood of emesis”</i> would have been obvious.....	51
2.	Claim 2 is Obvious in View of the ‘333 Patent and the Knowledge of One of Ordinary Skill in the Art, and Further in View of Won 1995.....	51
3.	Claim 9 is Obvious in View of the Prior Art, Including the ‘333 Patent and Won 1995.....	54
B.	Claim 2 Of The ‘725 Patent Is Obvious In View Of The Prior Art, Including The ‘333 Patent And Won 1995.....	55
C.	Claims 2, 5, And 6 Of The ‘424 Patent Are Obvious.....	57
1.	Claim 2 is Obvious in View of the Prior Art, Including the ‘333 Patent and Won 1995.....	57
2.	Claim 5 is Obvious in View of the Prior Art, Including the ‘333 Patent and Won 1995.....	58
3.	Claim 6 is Obvious in View of the Prior Art, Including the ‘333 Patent and Won 1995.....	59
VIII.	CONCLUSION.....	59

I, Lee Kirsch, Ph.D., submit my expert report in the above-referenced case on behalf of Defendants Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc. and Teva Pharmaceutical Industries, Ltd. (collectively “Teva”) and Sandoz Inc. (“Sandoz”). I reserve the right to amend or supplement my opinions in light of evidence presented by Helsinn Healthcare S.A. and Roche Palo Alto LLC (collectively “Helsinn” or “Plaintiffs”), or additional information that may be made available to me in the future. I have not yet created the exhibits or demonstratives that I expect to use to summarize or explain my opinions at trial, but they will likely include formulation summaries and presentations showing the formulation development background described in this report.

## **I. QUALIFICATIONS.**

1. I am currently a Professor at the University of Iowa, College of Pharmacy, Division of Pharmaceutics. A complete list of my publications, presentations, professional activities, and honors that I have received are fully set forth in my *curriculum vitae*, attached hereto at Exhibit A.

2. I received a B.S. degree in Pharmacy in 1975 from Purdue University and received a Ph.D. in Pharmaceutical Chemistry in 1982 from the Ohio State University. From 1982 to 1994, I was a research scientist at Lilly Research Laboratories in the Pharmaceutical Product Development Division. During my time at Lilly, my responsibility was to develop drug formulations for new drug substances and to address formulation issues associated with marketed drug products. My particular area of focus was injectable drug product design and development, including drugs intended for intravenous and extravascular administration. During my industrial tenure, my research focus was on drug stability issues as evidenced by my publication and presentation history during this time period. In 1994, I took a position at the University of Iowa College of Pharmacy, first as an Associate Professor and then in 2010 as a full Professor. During my time at Iowa, my research has continued to focus on issues of drug product design and

development, and especially drug product stability. In addition to conducting fundamental research on drug stability phenomena, I also have had the opportunity to work on numerous industrially-supported projects, addressing various drug product performance and design issues for injectable, solid oral, topical and various other types of drug formulations. I also have had the opportunity to teach courses at Iowa, including drug degradation kinetics and mechanisms, drug stability, pharmaceutical proteins, advanced compounding, solid dosage forms, lyophilization, pharmaceutical product development, pharmacokinetics and biopharmaceutics, pharmaceutical package design and integrity, and pharmaceutical technology.

3. I have received numerous awards and honors, including the Distinguished Service Award from the Parenteral Drug Association, Jack L. Beal Post Baccalaureate Award from The Ohio State University, Fred Simon Award for the best paper in the PDA Journal of Pharmaceutical Science and Technology, Editor-in-chief for the AAPS PharmSciTech Journal, and Editor of the PDA Journal of Pharmaceutical Science and Technology.

4. I have authored or co-authored over 50 published scientific articles in the areas of pharmaceutical chemistry, drug stability, drug delivery, pharmacokinetics, pharmaceutical package integrity, and analytical chemistry. I have served as a peer-reviewer on various well-respected pharmaceutical science and technology journals, including *Journal of Pharmaceutical Science*, *Drug Development and Industrial Pharmacy*, *Pharmaceutical Research*, *International Journal of Pharmaceutics*, *PDA Journal of Pharmaceutical Science and Technology*, *Journal of Pharmaceutical Innovation*, *Pharmaceutical Development and Technology*, *AAPS PharmSciTech*, and *International Journal of Chemical Kinetics*.

5. In the last four years, I have testified at trial or by deposition in *AstraZeneca v. Mylan*, (10-cv-05519) (D.N.J. 2012).

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.