

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE
BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

- - - - - x
US ENDODONTICS, LLC, :
Petitioner, : Case No. IPR2015-00632
v. : U.S. Patent No.
GOLD STANDARD : 8,727,773 B2
INSTRUMENTS, LLC, :
Patent Owner. :
- - - - - X

Videotaped Deposition of ROBERT SINCLAIR, Ph.D.
Washington, DC
Monday, January 18, 2016
9:02 a.m.

Job No.: 98829
Pages 1 - 310
Reported by: Debra A. Whitehead

Videotaped Deposition of Robert Sinclair, Ph.D.
Conducted on January 18, 2016

2

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

Videotaped Deposition of ROBERT SINCLAIR, Ph.D.,
held at the offices of:

ROTHWELL, FIGG, ERNST & MANBECK, P.C.
607 14th Street, NW
Suite 800
Washington, DC 20005
(202) 783-6040

Pursuant to agreement, before Debra A. Whitehead,
an Approved Reporter of the United States District
Court and Notary Public of the District of Columbia.

DI ANET DEPOS

Videotaped Deposition of Robert Sinclair, Ph.D.
Conducted on January 18, 2016

3

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

A P P E A R A N C E S

ON BEHALF OF PETITIONER:

JEFFREY S. GINSBERG, ESQUIRE
PATTERSON BELKNAP WEBB & TYLER LLP
1133 Avenue of the Americas
New York, New York 10036-6710
(212) 336-2000

ON BEHALF OF PATENT OWNER:

DEREK F. DAHLGREN, ESQUIRE
JASON M. NOLAN, Ph.D., ESQUIRE
ROTHWELL, FIGG, ERNST & MANBECK, P.C.
607 14th Street, NW
Suite 800
Washington, DC 20005
(202) 783-6040

ALSO PRESENT:

DEREK FOX, Video Specialist

DI ANET DEPOS

Videotaped Deposition of Robert Sinclair, Ph.D.
Conducted on January 18, 2016

43

1 Prior to your involvement in this matter, 09:57:48
2 were you familiar with the methods of heat-treating 09:57:50
3 an nickel-titanium endodontic file? 09:57:59

4 A I would be familiar with methods of 09:58:01
5 heat-treating nickel-titanium material. 09:58:03

6 Q And do you believe that methods of 09:58:05
7 heat-treating a nickel-titanium material would be 09:58:07
8 applicable to methods of heat-treating a 09:58:09
9 nickel-titanium endodontic file? 09:58:12

10 A In terms of the procedures of heat 09:58:20
11 treatment, they could be the same. 09:58:22

12 Q And how about the results of the heat 09:58:26
13 treatment? 09:58:27

14 A I would -- hum. So it's not necessarily -- 09:58:31
15 not necessarily so that if you had a nickel-titanium 09:58:42
16 material, as opposed to nickel-titanium endodontic 09:58:50
17 file which has been processed into that file, that 09:58:56
18 the materials would behave in an identical fashion 09:59:03
19 to heat treatment. 09:59:07

20 Q Do you think the teachings of methods and 09:59:09
21 results from heat-treating a nickel-titanium alloy 09:59:12
22 generally are informative regarding methods and 09:59:18

DI ANET DEDOS

Videotaped Deposition of Robert Sinclair, Ph.D.
Conducted on January 18, 2016

44

1 results to heat-treating a nickel-titanium 09:59:25

2 endodontic file? 09:59:32

3 A I think that they are informative. But 09:59:35

4 nickel titanium is a rather complicated material. 09:59:40

5 And so its precise history and, as we've mentioned 09:59:47

6 before, composition, are important to how it behaves 09:59:52

7 and how it -- how it might alter under heat 09:59:59

8 treatment conditions. 10:00:06

9 Q You have never heat treated a 10:00:08

10 nickel-titanium endodontic file. Correct? 10:00:17

11 A An endodontic file I believe I have not heat 10:00:22

12 treated. 10:00:25

13 Q Prior to your involvement in this case, you 10:00:26

14 had never overseen any testing concerning the heat 10:00:28

15 treatment of a nickel-titanium endodontic file. 10:00:31

16 Correct? 10:00:33

17 A I believe not. My -- a lot of my work was 10:00:35

18 on the other forms of nickel-titanium material. 10:00:39

19 Q When you say "other forms of nickel-titanium 10:00:44

20 material," what do you mean? 10:00:48

21 A So it could be wire. It could be sheet, 10:00:49

22 thin sheet. 10:00:56

DI ANET DEDOS

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.