

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

ILLUMINA INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

MOLECULAR LOOP BIOSCIENCES, INC.,
Patent Owner.

Case No. IPR2024-00964

Patent No. 11,041,852

DECLARATION OF PAUL T. SPELLMAN, PH.D.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	1
A. Qualifications and Experience	1
B. Materials Considered.....	5
II. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	6
III. SUMMARY OF OPINIONS.....	7
IV. LEGAL STANDARDS	12
V. BACKGROUND AND STATE OF THE ART.....	15
A. First Generation Sequencing	15
B. Next Generation Sequencing Techniques Available as of December 2010.....	18
1. Overview of Sequencing Workflow	19
2. Basic Principles Behind Illumina and Roche 454 Sequencing	21
3. Immobilization of Nucleic Acids of Interest	25
4. Amplification of Nucleic Acids of Interest.....	26
5. Generation of Sequence Reads and Sequences of Nucleic Acids of Interest.....	29
6. Use of Sequence Identifiers in Multiplex Sequencing	30

7.	Resources available to a POSA before December 2010.....	39
VI.	SUMMARY OF THE PRIOR ART.....	40
A.	<i>Parameswaran</i> (EX1004)	40
B.	<i>Gloor</i> (EX1005)	46
C.	<i>Bentley</i> (EX1006).....	51
VII.	THE '852 PATENT.....	53
A.	Overview	53
B.	The Claims of the '852 Patent.....	54
C.	Disclosures of the '852 Patent.....	56
D.	Prosecution History of the '852 Patent	62
E.	Claim Construction.....	64
VIII.	CHALLENGED CLAIMS ARE UNPATENTABLE OVER THE PRIOR ART.....	65
A.	Ground 1: Claims 1-8 Would Have Been Obvious Over <i>Parameswaran</i> and <i>Gloor</i>	65
1.	Claim 1 Would Have Been Obvious Over <i>Parameswaran</i> and <i>Gloor</i>	65
2.	A POSA Would Have Been Motivated to Combine <i>Parameswaran</i> and <i>Gloor</i>	81

3.	A POSA Would Have Had a Reasonable Expectation of Success in Combining <i>Parameswaran</i> and <i>Gloor</i>	87
4.	Dependent Claims 2-8 Would Have Been Obvious Over the Combination of <i>Parameswaran</i> and <i>Gloor</i>	92
B.	Ground 2: Claims 1-8 Would Have Been Obvious Over <i>Parameswaran</i> and <i>Bentley</i>	101
1.	Claim 1 Would Have Been Obvious Over <i>Parameswaran</i> and <i>Bentley</i>	102
2.	A POSA Would Have Been Motivated to Combine <i>Parameswaran</i> and <i>Bentley</i>	106
3.	A POSA Would Have Had a Reasonable Expectation of Success in Combining <i>Parameswaran</i> and <i>Bentley</i>	106
4.	Dependent Claims 2-8 Would Have Been Obvious Over <i>Parameswaran</i> and <i>Bentley</i>	109
C.	No Unexpected Results or Other Evidence of Nonobviousness.....	112
IX.	CONCLUSION.....	112

I. INTRODUCTION

1. I, Dr. Paul T. Spellman, have been retained as an independent expert in the field of genetics and DNA sequencing. I submit this declaration on behalf of Petitioner Illumina, Inc., in the above-captioned *inter partes* review (“IPR”).

2. I am being compensated for my time in connection with this IPR at my standard hourly consulting rate of \$500/hour. I do not have any personal or financial stake or interest in the outcome of this proceeding and my compensation is in no way contingent on the nature of my analysis or the outcome of this IPR or any other proceeding.

3. I am over 21 years of age and, if I am called upon to do so, I would be competent to testify as to the matters set forth herein.

A. Qualifications and Experience

4. I believe that I am qualified to serve as a technical expert in this matter based upon my qualifications, discussed in detail below. A copy of my curriculum vitae is attached as **Appendix A** to this declaration.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.