

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
MIDLAND-ODESSA DIVISION

RESONANT SYSTEMS, INC. d/b/a
RevelHMI,

Plaintiff,

v.

APPLE INC.,

Defendant.

Case No. 7:23-cv-00077-DC

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED



**DEFENDANT APPLE INC.'S OPPOSED MOTION TO
TRANSFER VENUE TO THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

- I. INTRODUCTON..... 1
- II. STATEMENT OF FACTS 2
 - A. Resonant Accuses Features Developed by Apple Almost Entirely in NDCA..... 2
 - B. Resonant is a Washington Company with No Apparent Ties to Texas..... 4
 - C. Many Third Party Witnesses are in NDCA and None are in WDTX..... 4
- III. LEGAL STANDARD..... 5
- IV. NDCA IS CLEARLY MORE CONVENIENT THAN WDTX..... 6
 - A. This Case Could Have Been Brought in NDCA..... 6
 - B. The Private Interest Factors Favor Transfer 6
 - 1. Relative Ease of Access to Sources of Proof Strongly Favors Transfer..... 6
 - 2. Availability of Compulsory Process Favors Transfer..... 8
 - 3. Convenience of Witnesses Strongly Favors Transfer..... 10
 - 4. Other Practical Problems are Neutral or Slightly Favor Transfer..... 12
 - C. The Public Interest Factors Favor Transfer 12
 - 1. Court Congestion is Neutral or Slightly Favors Transfer 12
 - 2. Local Interest Strongly Favors Transfer 13
 - 3. Familiarity with the Governing Law and Conflicts of Law are Neutral... 14
- V. CONCLUSION..... 14

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
Cases	
<i>In re Acer Am. Corp.</i> , 626 F.3d 1252 (Fed. Cir. 2010).....	8, 11
<i>In re Adobe Inc.</i> , No. 2020-126, 2020 WL 4308164 (Fed. Cir. Jul. 28, 2020).....	6
<i>Aguilar-Ayala v. Ruiz</i> , 973 F.2d 411 (5th Cir. 1992)	9
<i>In re Apple Inc.</i> , 979 F.3d 1332 (Fed. Cir. 2020).....	<i>passim</i>
<i>In re Apple Inc.</i> , No. 2021-181, 2021 WL 5291804 (Fed. Cir. Nov. 15, 2021)	9, 13
<i>In re Apple Inc.</i> , No. 2022-128, 2022 WL 1196768 (Fed. Cir. Apr. 22, 2022), <i>cert. denied sub nom. CPC Pat. Techs. PTY Ltd. v. Apple Inc.</i> , 143 S. Ct. 206, 214 L. Ed. 2d 80 (2022).....	8, 13
<i>In re Apple, Inc.</i> , 581 F. App'x 886 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	9
<i>Auto-Dril, Inc. v. Nat'l Oilwell Varco, L.P.</i> , No. 6:15-CV-00091, 2016 WL 6909479 (W.D. Tex. Jan. 28, 2016)	5
<i>Collaborative Agreements, LLC. v. Adobe Sys. Inc.</i> , No. 1-14-CV-356, 2015 WL 10818739 (W.D. Tex. Aug. 21, 2015)	6
<i>Datascape, Ltd. v. Dell Techs., Inc.</i> , No. 6:19-cv-00129-ADA, 2019 WL 4254069 (W.D. Tex. June 7, 2019).....	10
<i>In re DISH Network L.L.C.</i> , 856 F. App'x 310 (Fed. Cir. 2021)	13
<i>Fintiv, Inc. v. Apple Inc.</i> , No. 6:18-CV-00372-ADA, 2019 WL 4743678 (W.D. Tex. Sept. 13, 2019)	9
<i>Gemalto S.A. v. CPI Card Grp. Inc.</i> , No. 15-CA-0910, 2015 WL 10818740 (W.D. Tex. Dec. 16, 2015)	9

<i>In re Genentech, Inc.</i> , 566 F.3d 1338 (Fed. Cir. 2009).....	5, 6, 10, 12
<i>In re Google LLC</i> , 58 F.4th 1379 (Fed. Cir. 2023)	12
<i>In re Google LLC</i> , No. 2023-101, 2023 WL 1425780 (Fed. Cir. Feb. 1, 2023)	9
<i>In re Hoffman-La Roche Inc.</i> , 587 F.3d 1333 (Fed. Cir. 2009).....	5, 9, 13
<i>In re HP Inc.</i> , No. 2018-149, 2018 WL 4692486 (Fed. Cir. Sept. 25, 2018)	10
<i>In re Hulu LLC</i> , No. 2021-142, 2021 WL 3278194 (Fed. Cir. Aug. 2, 2021)	9
<i>InfoGation Corp. v. Google LLC</i> , No. 6:20-CV-00366-ADA, 2021 WL 5547070 (W.D. Tex. Apr. 29, 2021)	10, 11
<i>In re Juniper Networks, Inc.</i> , 14 F.4th 1313 (Fed. Cir. 2021)	5
<i>Koss Corp. v. Plantronics, Inc.</i> , No. 6:20-CV-00663-ADA, 2021 WL 2075685 (W.D. Tex. May 20, 2021)	7
<i>Magic Cross Ranch, L.P. v. Manion</i> , No. 3:12-CV-00541-P, 2012 WL 13027449 (N.D. Tex. Sept. 25, 2012).....	14
<i>In re Morgan Stanley</i> , 417 F. App'x 947 (Fed. Cir. 2011)	12
<i>In re Nintendo Co., Ltd.</i> , 589 F.3d 1194 (Fed. Cir. 2009).....	5
<i>TC Heartland LLC v. Kraft Foods Group Brands LLC</i> , 137 S. Ct. 1514 (2017).....	6
<i>In re TracFone Wireless, Inc.</i> , 852 F. App'x 537 (Fed. Cir. 2021)	5, 10
<i>In re TS Tech.</i> , 551 F.3d 1315 (Fed. Cir. 2008).....	14
<i>Uniloc USA, Inc. v. Apple Inc.</i> , No. A-18-CV-990-LY, 2019 WL 2066121 (W.D. Tex. Apr. 8, 2019).....	10

Uniloc USA Inc. v. Box, Inc.,
No. 1:17-CV-754-LY, 2018 WL 2729202 (W.D. Tex. June 6, 2018).....13

USTA Tech., LLC v. Google LLC,
Case No. W-22-CA-01214-XR, 2023 WL 4833481 (W.D. Tex. July 26, 2023)6, 8, 9, 12

Via Vadis, LLC v. Netgear, Inc.,
No. 14-cv-809, 2015 WL 10818675 (W.D. Tex. July 30, 2015).....10

In re Volkswagen AG,
371 F.3d 201 (5th Cir. 2004)5, 10, 13

In re Volkswagen of Am., Inc.,
545 F.3d 304 (5th Cir. 2008)1, 5, 11

XY, LLC v. Trans Ova Genetics, LC,
No. W-16-CA-00447-RP, 2017 WL 5505340 (W.D. Tex. Apr. 5, 2017)6

Statutes

28 U.S.C. § 1404(a)5, 8, 10

35 U.S.C. § 1400(b)6

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.