

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

PANASONIC AUTOMOTIVE SYSTEMS CO., LTD.,
Petitioner,

v.

UNM RAINFOREST INNOVATIONS,
Patent Owner.

PTAB Case No. IPR2024-00364
Patent No. 8,265,096 B2

PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	RELATED PROCEEDINGS	1
III.	UNM BACKGROUND.....	2
IV.	THE ASSERTED PRIOR ART	3
A.	<i>The Joint Proposal</i> (EX1016)	3
B.	<i>Trainin</i> (EX1010)	4
C.	<i>Mujtaba</i> (EX1011).....	4
V.	THE PREVIOUSLY ASSERTED PRIOR ART	5
A.	<i>Talukdar</i> (EX2002 (previously IPR2021-00375, EX1012)).....	5
B.	<i>Li</i> (EX2003 (previously IPR2021-00375, EX1016)).....	8
C.	<i>Nystrom</i> (EX2004 (previously IPR2021-00375, EX1017)).....	9
VI.	THE BOARD SHOULD DENY INSTITUTION UNDER § 325(d)	10
A.	<i>Mujtaba</i> is cumulative of <i>Nystrom</i>	11
B.	<i>Trainin</i> is cumulative of <i>Talukdar</i>	13
C.	<i>The Joint Proposal</i> Is Cumulative of <i>Talukdar</i>	15
VII.	THE '096 PATENT.....	17
A.	Technical Background.....	17
B.	The Challenged Claims	19
1.	Claim 8.....	19
2.	Claim 44.....	19
3.	Claim 45.....	20

4.	Claim 46.....	20
5.	Claim 47.....	20
6.	Claim 49.....	20
7.	Claim 50.....	21
8.	Prosecution History.....	21
C.	Priority Date	21
VIII.	LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART.....	22
IX.	PATENT OWNER’S CLAIM CONSTRUCTIONS	22
A.	Claim Construction Order in UNM Rainforest Innovations v. Apple Inc., No. 1-20-cv-00351 (W.D. Tex.).....	22
X.	PETITIONER HAS FAILED TO DEMONSTRATE A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD OF PREVAILING AS TO ANY CHALLENGED CLAIM.	23
A.	Ground 1: Claims 8, 44-47, And 50 Are Not Anticipated By The <i>Joint Proposal</i>	24
1.	Claim 8: A method of constructing a frame structure for data transmission	25
2.	Claim 44.....	30
3.	Claim 45.....	31
4.	Claim 46.....	31
5.	Claim 47.....	32
6.	Claim 50.....	32
B.	Ground 2: The Combination Of The <i>Joint Proposal</i> And <i>Trainin</i> Does Not Disclose Or Suggest All Elements Of Claim 49	32

1.	Claim 49: The method of claim 44, wherein each of the first section and the second section carries at least one of uplink and downlink data.	32
2.	Motivation To Combine.....	32
C.	Ground 3: <i>Mujtaba</i> Does Not Disclose All Elements Of Claim 8.....	35
1.	Claim 8: A method of constructing a frame structure for data transmission	35
D.	Ground 4: The Combination Of <i>Mujtaba</i> and <i>Trainin</i> Does Not Disclose Or Suggest All Elements Of Claims 8, 44-47, and 49-50	47
1.	Claim 8: A method of constructing a frame structure for data transmission	47
2.	Claim 44.....	48
3.	Claim 45.....	50
4.	Claim 46.....	50
5.	Claim 47.....	51
6.	Claim 49.....	51
7.	Claim 50.....	51
8.	Motivation to Combine.....	51
XI.	SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS OF NON-OBVIOUSNESS	57
XII.	CONCLUSION.....	58

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES:

<i>In re Gorman</i> , 933 F.2d 982 (Fed. Cir. 1991).....	35, 57
<i>Phillips v. AWH Corp.</i> , 415 F.3d 1303 (Fed. Cir. 2005)	22
<i>Virtek Vision Int'l ULC v. Assembly Guidance Sys., Inc.</i> , 2024 U.S. App. LEXIS 7185 (Fed. Cir. 2024)	<i>passim</i>

STATUTES:

35 U.S.C. § 325(d)	10, 61
--------------------------	--------

OTHER AUTHORITIES:

<i>Advanced Bionics, LLC v. Med-El Elektromedizinische Gerate GmbH</i> , IPR2019-01469, Paper 6, 8 (PTAB Feb. 13, 2020).....	10, 11
---	--------

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.