

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

PANASONIC AUTOMOTIVE SYSTEMS CO., LTD.,  
Petitioner,

v.

UNM RAINFOREST INNOVATIONS,  
Patent Owner.

---

PTAB Case No. IPR2024-00364  
Patent No. 8,265,096 B2

---

**DECLARATION OF BRANIMIR VOJCIC, D.SC., IN SUPPORT OF  
UNM RAINFOREST INNOVATIONS' PRELIMINARY RESPONSE**

I, Dr. Branimir Vojcic, under the penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States, declare that the following is true and correct based on the best of my ability.

Date: 13 May 2024

Signed:   
Branimir Vojcic, Ph.D.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	QUALIFICATIONS.....	5
II.	BASES OF OPINIONS.....	9
III.	LEGAL FRAMEWORK.....	12
	A. Claim Construction.....	12
	B. Validity.....	12
	1. Anticipation.....	13
	2. Obviousness.....	14
IV.	THE '096 PATENT (EX1001].....	22
	A. Technical Background.....	22
	B. Challenged Claims.....	24
	1. Claim 8.....	24
	2. Claim 44.....	25
	3. Claim 45.....	25
	4. Claim 46.....	25
	5. Claim 47.....	26
	6. Claim 49.....	26
	7. Claim 50.....	26
	C. Priority Date.....	26
V.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTIONS.....	27
	A. “at least one of [...] and [...]”.....	27
	B. “symbol period”.....	27

C.	District Court Constructions.....	27
VI.	VALIDITY ANALYSIS .....	28
A.	Ground 1: The Joint Proposal versus Claims 8, 44-47, And 50.....	29
1.	Claim 8.....	29
2.	Claim 44.....	34
3.	Claim 45.....	36
4.	Claim 46.....	36
5.	Claim 47.....	36
6.	Claim 50.....	36
B.	Ground 2: The Joint Proposal And Trainin versus Claim 49.....	37
1.	Claim 49.....	37
2.	Motivation to Combine.....	37
C.	Ground 3: Mujtaba versus Claim 8 .....	38
1.	Claim 8.....	38
D.	Ground 4: Mujtaba and Trainin versus Claims 8, 44-47, 49-50 .....	48
1.	Claim 8.....	48
2.	Claim 44.....	49
3.	Claim 45.....	51
4.	Claim 46.....	51
5.	Claim 47.....	52
6.	Claim 49.....	52

7.	Claim 50.....	52
8.	Motivation to Combine.....	53
E.	The Asserted Prior Art Is Cumulative Of The Previous Art.....	56
1.	<i>Mujtaba</i> is cumulative of <i>Nystrom</i> .....	56
2.	<i>Trainin</i> is cumulative of <i>Talukdar</i> .....	58
3.	The <i>Joint Proposal</i> Is Cumulative of <i>Talukdar</i> .....	59
VII.	CONCLUSION.....	61

1. I have been retained by Key IP Law Group PLLC, as an independent technical expert in the *Inter Partes* Review between UNM Rainforest Innovations (“UNM”), and Panasonic Automotive Systems Co., Ltd. (“Panasonic”), PTAB Case No. IPR2024-00364 involving U.S. Patent No. 8,265,096 (“the ’096 patent”).

2. I am being compensated for my work as a technical expert at my customary rate of \$725 per hour. My compensation does not in any way depend on the outcome of this review, and I have no personal interest in the outcome of this review.

## **I. QUALIFICATIONS**

3. I am an expert in wireless technology and other telecommunications areas. I am an Emeritus Professor of Engineering and Applied Science at The George Washington University, where I have been a member of the faculty since September 1991. In addition, I have served as a consultant for a number of companies in the wireless communications industry in various technology areas. I have also served on numerous committees and as a reviewer and editor for several journals, conferences, and organizations.

4. I received my Diploma of Engineering, Master of Science, and Doctor of Science degrees in Electrical Engineering from the University of Belgrade in Yugoslavia in 1981, 1986, and 1989, respectively. The primary focus of my Doctor of Science studies was on Code Division Multiple Access (CDMA) and spread spectrum communications technologies.

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.