

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

---

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

---

**LG ELECTRONICS, INC., LG ELECTRONICS U.S.A., INC,**  
Petitioner,

v.

**MULTIMEDIA TECHNOLOGIES PTE. LTD.**  
Patent Owner

---

Case No. IPR2024-00351  
U.S. Patent No. 9,510,040

---

**PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

I. INTRODUCTION ..... 1

II. THE BOARD SHOULD EXERCISE ITS DISCRETION TO DENY THIS PETITION UNDER § 314(a).....2

    A. Factor 1: Petitioner has Not Requested a Stay, and would have No Authority to Request a Stay in the Vizio Litigation.....5

    B. Factor 2: The Board’s Final Written Decision Deadline Would Likely be After a Trial in the LG Litigation and/or Vizio Litigation .....6

    C. Factor 3: There Has Been Substantial Investment by the Parties and District Court in the LG Litigation and the Vizio Litigation .....8

    D. Factor 4: Petitioner’s Claims Directly Overlap with both Parallel Litigations, Despite Petitioner’s Efforts to Obscure this with an Ineffective Stipulation ..... 11

    E. Factor 5: Petitioner is the Defendant in the LG Litigation, and the Vizio Litigation Involves Substantially Similar Issues..... 17

    F. Factor 6: Petitioner Has Not Established Grounds for Review under The Statutory Standard, Let Alone the Far Stricter “Compelling Merits” Standard..... 18

III. OVERVIEW OF THE ’040 PATENT .....20

IV. SUMMARY OF THE REFERENCES ASSERTED IN THE PETITION...26

    A. Kim .....26

    B. Choi .....28

    C. Lee-1 .....29

    D. Lee-2.....29

V. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART .....30

VI. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION .....30

VII. PETITIONER FAILS TO SHOW A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD OF PREVAILING ON ANY CHALLENGED CLAIM.....30

A. Ground 1: Kim in view of Lee-1 and Choi Does Not Render Obvious Claims 1-5, 11-15, and 21 of the ‘040 Patent.....31

1. Kim in view of Lee-1 and Choi Does Not Disclose a “First Content Information” That is Associated with a “Highlighted Source” .....31

2. Combining Kim with Lee-1 or Choi Does Not Render Obvious the Claims 1-5, 11-15, and 21 of the ‘040 Patent.....36

B. Ground 2: Kim in view of Lee-1, Choi, and Lee-2 Does Not Render Obvious Claims 2-3, 6, 12-13, 16, and 22 of the ‘040 Patent .....37

VIII. CONCLUSION.....37

## TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	Page(s)
<b>Cases</b>	
<i>10X Genomics v. President and Fellows of Harvard College</i> , IPR2023-01299, Paper 15 (PTAB Mar. 7, 2024).....	8, 10, 11
<i>Apple Inc. v. Fintiv, Inc.</i> , IPR2020-00019, Paper 11 (PTAB Mar. 20, 2020).....	<i>passim</i>
<i>AviaGames, Inc. v. Skillz Platform, Inc.</i> , IPR2022-00530, Paper 14 (PTAB Mar. 2, 2023).....	4, 19
<i>BOE Technology Group Co. v. Element Capital Commercial Co.</i> , IPR2023-00808, Paper 9 (PTAB Nov. 15, 2023).....	16
<i>Boehringer Ingelheim International GMBH v. Biogen Inc.</i> , IPR2015-00418, Paper 14 (PTAB July 13, 2015).....	33
<i>CommScope Technologies LLC v. Dali Wireless, Inc.</i> , IPR2022-01242, Paper 23 (PTAB Feb. 27, 2023).....	3, 4, 18, 19
<i>Ericsson Inc. and Nokia of America Corp. v. Collision Communications, Inc.</i> , IPR2022-01233, Paper 12 (PTAB Jan 19, 2023).....	11
<i>Mylan Laboratories Ltd. v. Janssen Pharmaceutica NV</i> , IPR2020-00440, Paper 17 (PTAB Sept. 16, 2020).....	9, 16, 17
<i>NHK Spring Co. v. Intri-Plex Technologies, Inc.</i> , IPR2018-00752, Paper 8 (PTAB Sept. 12, 2018).....	2, 5, 7
<i>NXP USA, Inc. v. IMPINJ, Inc.</i> , IPR2021-01556, Paper 13 (PTAB, Sept. 7, 2022).....	13
<i>Samsung Elecs. Co. v. Cardware Inc.</i> , IPR2023-00314, Paper 11 (PTAB July 18, 2023).....	7
<i>Samsung Electronics Co. v. California Institute of Technology</i> , IPR2023-00130, Paper 10 (PTAB May 4, 2023).....	8

<i>Samsung Electronics Co. v. Mojo Mobility Inc.</i> , IPR2023-01098, Paper 11 (PTAB Feb. 9, 2024).....	10
<i>Sand Revolution II, LLC v. Continental Intermodal Group - Trucking LLC</i> , IPR 2019-01393, Paper 24 (PTAB June 16, 2020) .....	15
<i>Sotera Wireless, Inc. v. Masimo Corp.</i> , IPR2020-01019, Paper 12 (PTAB Dec. 1, 2020) .....	<i>passim</i>
<i>Village Green Technologies, LLC v. Samsung Electronics, Co.</i> , No. 2:22-CV-00099-JRG, 2023 WL 416419 (E.D. Tex. Jan. 25, 2023) .....	6
<i>Wasica Finance GmbH v. Schrader International, Inc.</i> , 432 F. Supp. 3d 448 (D. Del. 2020).....	14
<i>Wirtgen America, Inc. v. Caterpillar, Inc.</i> , No. 1:17-CV-00770-JDW-MPT, 2024 WL 51010 (D. Del. Jan. 4. 2024) .....	14
<b>Statutes</b>	
35 U.S.C. § 314(a) .....	<i>passim</i>
<b>Other Authorities</b>	
C.F.R. § 42.104(b)(2).....	33
Memorandum, Interim Procedure for Discretionary Denials in AIA Post-Grant Proceedings with Parallel District Court Litigation (USPTO June 21, 2022).....	3, 7, 13, 16

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.