

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

SHARKNINJA, INC.,
SHARKNINJA OPERATING LLC,
SHARKNINJA MANAGEMENT LLC, AND
SHARKNINJA SALES COMPANY,
Petitioners,

v.

DYSON TECHNOLOGY LIMITED,
Patent Owner.

Case No. IPR2023-01323

U.S. Patent No. 11,589,660

**Declaration of Daniel M. Nosenchuck, Ph.D. in Support of Petition
for *Inter Partes* Review of U.S. Patent No. 11,589,660**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
PETITIONERS' EXHIBIT LIST	
I. QUALIFICATIONS	2
II. SCOPE OF OPINIONS	3
III. MATERIALS REVIEWED AND CONSIDERED	4
IV. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART	4
V. STATEMENT OF LEGAL PRINCIPLES.....	6
A. Claim Construction.....	6
B. Obviousness.....	6
VI. TECHNOLOGY OF THE '660 PATENT	8
B. Overview of the '660 Patent.....	8
C. Prosecution History	14
D. Effective Filing Date	16
E. Challenged Claims	16
VII. SUMMARY OF THE INVALIDITY GROUNDS AND PRIOR ART	16
A. Invalidity Grounds.....	16
B. U.S. Patent No. 4,943,182 (“Hoblingre”) (Exhibit 1004).....	17
C. EP 0 791 758 A1 (“Mouhot”) (Exhibit 1005, Exhibit 1006).....	20
D. U.S. Patent Publication No. 2015/0265022 (“Maclaine”) (Exhibit 1007).....	22
E. U.S. Patent No. 6,161,244 (“Jeannet”) (Exhibit 1008).....	26
VIII. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	27

IX.	APPLICATION OF THE PRIOR ART TO THE CLAIMS.....	28
A.	Ground 1: Hoblingre Anticipates Claims 1-9, 15, 23, 24, and 32	28
1.	Independent Claim 1	28
2.	Dependent Claim 2.....	41
3.	Dependent Claim 3.....	42
4.	Dependent Claim 4.....	43
5.	Dependent Claim 5.....	45
6.	Dependent Claim 6.....	46
7.	Dependent Claim 7.....	47
8.	Dependent Claim 8.....	48
9.	Dependent Claim 9.....	49
10.	Dependent Claim 15	50
11.	Dependent Claim 23	51
12.	Dependent Claim 24	52
13.	Dependent Claim 32	53
B.	Ground 2: Hoblingre in View of Maclaine Renders Obvious Claims 1-9, 15, 18, 23, 24, and 30-32.....	54
1.	Motivation to Combine Hoblingre and Maclaine.....	54
2.	Independent Claim 1	57
3.	Dependent Claim 15	58
4.	Dependent Claim 18	59
5.	Dependent Claim 30	62
6.	Dependent Claim 31	62

C.	Ground 3: Hoblingre in View of Maclaine and Jeannet Renders Obvious Claims 1-9, 15, 18, 23, 24, 30-34	63
1.	Motivation to Combine Hoblingre, Maclaine, and Jeannet.....	63
2.	Independent Claim 33	65
3.	Dependent Claim 34	72
D.	Ground 4: Mouhot Anticipates Claims 1-9, 15, 23, 24, and 32	73
1.	Independent Claim 1	74
2.	Dependent Claim 2.....	88
3.	Dependent Claim 3.....	90
4.	Dependent Claim 4.....	91
5.	Dependent Claim 5.....	93
6.	Dependent Claim 6.....	96
7.	Dependent Claim 7.....	97
8.	Dependent Claim 8.....	99
9.	Dependent Claim 9.....	100
10.	Dependent Claim 15	102
11.	Dependent Claim 23	103
12.	Dependent Claim 24	104
13.	Dependent Claim 32	106
E.	Ground 5: Mouhot in View of Maclaine Renders Obvious Claims 1-9, 15, 18, 23, 24, and 30-32	106
1.	Motivation to Combine Mouhot and Maclaine.....	107
2.	Independent Claim 1	109
3.	Dependent Claim 15	110

4.	Dependent Claim 18	112
5.	Dependent Claim 30	114
6.	Dependent Claim 31	115
F.	Ground 6: Mouhot in View of Maclaine and Jeannet Renders Obvious Claims 33 and 34	116
1.	Motivation to Combine Mouhot, Maclaine, and Jeannet	116
2.	Independent Claim 33	117
3.	Dependent Claim 34	124
X.	SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS OF NON-OBVIOUSNESS	125
XI.	CONCLUSION.....	126

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.