

**IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE**

In re Patent of: Xiaodong Li, et al.  
U.S. Patent No.: 10,965,512 Attorney Docket No.: 18768-0206IP1  
Issue Date: March 30, 2021  
Appl. Serial No.: 17/012,813  
Filing Date: September 4, 2020  
Title: METHOD AND APPARATUS USING CELL-SPECIFIC AND  
COMMON PILOT SUBCARRIERS IN MULTI-CARRIER,  
MULTI CELL WIRELESS COMMUNICATION NETWORKS

**Mail Stop Patent Board**

Patent Trial and Appeal Board  
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

**DECLARATION OF MATTHEW C. VALENTI, Ph.D. IN  
SUPPORT OF PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW OF  
U.S. PATENT NO. 10,965,512**

## I. Engagement

1. I have been retained by General Motors LLC, Nissan North America, Inc., Tesla, Inc., and American Honda Motor Co., Inc. (“Petitioner” or “Petitioners”) to provide this declaration concerning the technical subject matter relevant to a petition for *inter partes* review of U.S. Patent No. 10,965,512 (“512 patent”).

2. I am over 21 years of age and otherwise competent to make this Declaration. I make this Declaration based on facts and matters within my own knowledge and on information provided to me by others.

3. Specifically, I was asked to review the declaration of Dr. Paul Min that was submitted by the Petitioner in IPR2022-01539 as Exhibit 1003 (“the Min Declaration”) and form an opinion of whether I agreed with the facts, analysis, and conclusions in that declaration.

4. My compensation in this matter is not based on the substance of my opinions or the outcome of this matter. I have no financial interest in the Petitioners.

5. In writing this declaration, I have considered my own knowledge and experience, including my work experience in the field of mobile and wireless communication systems and my experience working with others

involved in this field, including in the design and analysis of mobile and wireless communication systems.

## **II. Background and Qualifications**

### **A. Educational Background**

6. I received a Bachelor of Science degree in Electrical Engineering from the Virginia Polytechnic Institute & State University (Virginia Tech) in May 1992. I received a Master of Science degree in Electrical Engineering from Johns Hopkins University in May 1995 and a Ph.D. in Electrical Engineering from Virginia Tech in 1999.

### **B. Professional Experience**

7. From 1992 to 1995 I served as an Electronics Engineer at the U.S. Naval Research Laboratory in Washington DC. During this time, I worked on adaptive antenna technology, including systems that performed beamforming.

8. From 1995 to 1999, I was a Graduate Research Assistant and Instructor in the Bradley Department of Electrical and Computer Engineering at Virginia Tech. For my Ph.D. research while working as a research assistant, I conducted in-depth investigations into signal processing and error-control coding techniques specifically tailored for mobile radio systems. A key focus

of my research was on understanding the crucial role played by pilot symbols and their utilization in channel estimation processes.

9. From 1999 to present, I have been a faculty member at West Virginia University in Morgantown, West Virginia, starting out as an Assistant Professor, being promoted to Associate Professor with tenure in 2005, and then to Professor in 2010. At WVU, I regularly teach the senior undergraduate course on Wireless Networking (CPE 462), which covers key concepts behind modern cellular networks, including orthogonal frequency division multiple access (OFDMA) and techniques for managing interference such as frequency reuse. I also teach graduate courses on Coding Theory (EE 567) and Communication Theory (EE 561). In addition to my teaching, I run an active funded research program focused on wireless communications and signal processing. I have advised over 50 graduate students who worked in my lab, including 10 Ph.D. students, to degree completing.

10. I have authored numerous technical papers on various aspects of mobile and wireless communication systems that have been published in well-respected, peer-reviewed journals, such as the *IEEE Transactions on Communications*, *IEEE Transactions on Wireless Communications*, *IEEE Transactions on Vehicular Technology*, and the *International Journal on Wireless Information Networks*.

11. A representative publication of mine is entitled “Iterative channel estimation and decoding of pilot symbol assisted turbo codes over flat-fading channels” which was published in the Sept. 2001 issue of the *IEEE Journal on Selected Area in Communications*. In this paper, I developed refined methods for performing channel estimation for wireless communication systems that use pilots and error-control codes. The paper has been cited over 390 times by other researchers who found the work useful.

12. Taken as a whole, my academic and practical experience have given me a substantial basis upon which to evaluate the technology that is in question in the claims of the '512 Patent. Based on my experience and education, and the acceptance of my publications and professional recognition by peers in my field, I believe that I am qualified to opine as to the knowledge and level of skill of one of ordinary skill in the art at the time of the alleged invention of the '512 patent (which I further describe below) and what such a person would have understood at that time, and the state of the art during that time.

13. A complete copy of my curriculum vitae, which includes a list of my publications and contains further details on my education, experience, publications, patents, and other qualifications to render an expert opinion, is attached as Appendix A.

# Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

## Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

## Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

## Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

## API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

## LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

## FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

## E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.