

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

REALTEK SEMICONDUCTOR CORP.,
and
TCL INDUSTRIES HOLDINGS CO., INC.

Petitioner,
v.

ATI TECHNOLOGIES ULC
Patent Owner.

Case No. IPR2023-00922

U.S. Patent No. 8,760,454¹

**PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S
RESPONSE TO PETITION**

¹ Joinder with IPR2024-00366

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	1
A. “Unified shader”	1
B. “Operative to”	1
C. “Various Degrees of Completion”	2
D. ATI’s Improper “Consideration” And “Determination” Limitations ...	3
III. GROUND 1: THE LINDHOLM REFERENCES RENDER CLAIMS 1-11 OBVIOUS.....	6
A. ATI Fails to Show Conception of the “Complete and Operative Invention” Under Federal Circuit Precedent.....	6
B. Dr. Mangione-Smith Offers No Opinion As to Conception of Many Limitations That ATI Argues Are Required by the Challenged Claims	9
C. Claims 1, 3, 4, 5-10: “Considering” Available Space and “Determining”	11
D. Claim 11: Performing Operations “At Various Degrees of Completion Based on Switching Between Instructions”	12
E. “In Response To” (Claim 2).....	13
F. Claim 6: Memory Separate From the “Store”	14
G. “Control Signal” (Claims 7 and 10) and “Arbiter” (Claim 10).....	15
IV. GROUND 2: AMANATIDES AND KOHN RENDER CLAIMS 1-11 OBVIOUS.....	15
A. Executing Operations Based on Available Space (Claims 5-10) And Performing Operations “Until” Storage is Available (Claims 1, 3, 4).....	15
B. Claim 11: Performing Operations “At Various Degrees of Completion Based on Switching Between Instructions”	16
C. Claims 2 and 5: “Selected Data”	18
D. Claims 7 and 10: “Selection Circuit” Is Within the Alleged “Unified Shader”	18
E. Claims 7 and 10: “Control Signal”	19
F. “Selection Circuit” (Claims 7 and 10) and “Arbiter” (Claim 10).....	19

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

V.	GROUND 3: SELZER AND FISKE RENDER CLAIMS 1-11 OBVIOUS.....	21
A.	Executing Operations Based on Available Space (Claims 5-10) And Performing Operations “Until” Storage is Available (Claims 1, 3, 4).....	21
B.	Claim 11: Performing Operations “At Various Degrees of Completion Based on Switching Between Instructions”	24
C.	Claim 2: “In Response To”	24
D.	Claims 2, 5-7, 10, 11: “Sequencer,” “Instruction Store,” “Circuitry,” “Selection Circuit,” and “Arbiter”	24
E.	Claims 2, 5, 11: “Sequencer” and “Instruction Store” Maintain Instructions	25
F.	“Control Signal” (claims 7 and 10) and “Arbiter” (claim 10)	25
G.	Motivation to Combine Selzer and Fiske.....	26
VI.	SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS	27

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

Cases

<i>ATI Tech. ULC v. Iancu</i> , 920 F.3d 1362 (Fed. Cir. 2019)	7, 9
<i>Brand v. Miller</i> , 487 F.3d 862 (Fed. Cir. 2007)	6
<i>Burroughs Wellcome Co. v. Barr Labs., Inc.</i> , 40 F.3d 1223 (Fed. Cir. 1994)	6
<i>Dawson v. Dawson</i> , 710 F.3d 1347 (Fed. Cir. 2013)	6
<i>In re GPAC, Inc.</i> , 57 F.3d 1573 (Fed. Cir. 1995)	29
<i>In re Imes</i> , 778 F.3d 1250 (Fed. Cir. 2015)	1
<i>Info-Hold, Inc. v. Applied Media Tech. Corp.</i> , 783 F.3d 1262 (Fed. Cir. 2015)	1
<i>Milwaukee Elec. Tool Corp. v. Snap-On Inc.</i> , 271 F. Supp. 3d 990 (E.D. Wis. 2017)	7
<i>Ormco Corp. v. Align Tech., Inc.</i> , 463 F.3d 1299 (Fed. Cir. 2006)	29
<i>Pfaff v. Wells Elecs, Inc.</i> , 525 U.S. 55 (1998).....	7
<i>Textron Innovations, Inc. v. American Eurocopter Corp.</i> , 498 Fed. Appx. 23 (Fed. Cir. 2012).....	18

PETITIONER'S EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit #	Reference Name
1001	U.S. Patent 8,760,454 to Morein et al.
1002	Prosecution History of U.S. Patent 8,760,454
1003	Declaration of Hanspeter Pfister, Ph.D.
1004	Curriculum Vitae of Hanspeter Pfister, Ph.D.
1005	Lindholm 685
1006	Lindholm 913
1007	Amanatides
1008	Kohn
1009	Selzer [Library of Congress]
1010	Fiske
1011	IEEE – Fiske
1012	Declaration of Gordon MacPherson re Authentication of Fiske (May 11, 2023)
1013	IEEE – Kohn
1014	Declaration of Gordon MacPherson re Authentication of Kohn (May 11, 2023)
1015	Initial Determination on Violation of Section 337, Certain Consumer Electronics and Display Devices With Graphics Processing and Graphics Processing Units Therein, 337-TA-932 (October 9, 2015)
1016	Selzer [University of California, Berkeley, Library]
1017	Redacted Deposition Transcript of Andrew E. Gruber, taken March 17, 2015, in ITC Case No. 337-TA-932
1018	Declaration of Hanspeter Pfister, Ph.D.
1019	Deposition Transcript of William Mangione-Smith (5/10/2024)
1020	https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/DirectX
1021	https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Unified_shader_model
1022	https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/GeForce_8_series
1023	https://www.hardwarezone.com.sg/feature-nvidia-geforce-8800-gtx-gts-g80-worlds-first-dx10-gpu/embracing-unified-shader-architecture
1024	https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Radeon_HD_2000_series

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.