UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

REALTEK SEMICONDUCTOR CORP.,
Petitioner,

v.

ATI TECHNOLOGIES ULC
Patent Owner.

Case No. IPR2023-00922
U.S. Patent No. 8,760,454

PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE
PURSUANT TO 37 C.F.R. § 42.107(A)

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

Table of Contents

Page

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. GRAPHICS PROCESSING PRIMER 3

A. Graphics Processors Use Vertex and Pixel Data to Create Display Images .3

B. Conventional Graphics Processors Use Separate Dedicated Vertex and Pixel Shaders 5

III. '454 PATENT OVERVIEW 7

A. The '454 Patent's Unified Shader Determines Which Data To Process By Evaluating Storage Capacity As Seen In Claims 1, 3-10 7

B. The Unified Shader Can Simultaneously Execute Vertex and Pixel Operations and Switch Quickly Between Operations at Various Degrees of Completion as In Claim 11 9

C. The Invention of the '454 Patent Triggers Execution by Transmitting Data Rather Than Instructions as in Claim 2 11

IV. Asserted Prior Art 11

A. Lindholm '685 11

B. Amanatides 14

C. Selzer 15

V. PETITIONER HAS FAILED TO PROVE THE CLAIMS OF THE '454 PATENT ARE OBVIOUS UNDER ANY GROUND 17

A. Ground 1: Lindholm References 17

1. Neither Lindholm '685 Nor Lindholm '913 Are Prior Art 17

a. The '454 Patent Inventors Conceived of the Inventions At Least by August 24, 2001 18

b. The '454 Patent Inventors Exercised Diligence in Constructively Reducing to Practice 24

i. The '454 Patent Was Constructively Reduced to Practice At Least by November 20, 2003 24

ii. The Inventors and Other ATI Employees Diligently Worked Every Business Day to Reduce the Claimed Invention to Practice 24

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

c. The Federal Circuit Ruled That the Same R400 Evidence Established Diligence 27

d. Petitioner's Arguments Regarding a Prior ITC Case Not Involving ATI Are Incorrect 29

2. No Executing Operations Depending Upon an Amount Of Space Available In The Store (Claim 5), Much Less Performing Vertex Operations Or Pixel Operations Until Enough Storage Is Available For The Other Operation Type (Claims 1, 3, 4) 29

3. No Processor Unit That Performs Vertex Manipulation Operations and Pixel Manipulation Operations At Various Degrees Of Completion Based On Switching Between Instructions In The Instruction Store (Claim 11) 32

4. No Execution of Instructions "In Response to" Receiving Selected Data (Claim 2) 33

5. No "Memory" Separate From the "Store" (Claim 6) 34

6. No "Control Signal" (Claims 7, 10) or "Arbiter" (Claim 10) 35

B. Ground 2: Amanatides + Kohn 36

1. No Executing Operations Depending Upon An Amount Of Space Available In The Store (Claim 5), Much Less Performing Vertex Operations Or Pixel Operations Until Enough Storage Is Available For The Other Operation Type (Claims 1, 3, 4) 36

2. No Processor Unit That Performs Vertex Manipulation Operations And Pixel Manipulation Operations At Various Degrees Of Completion Based On Switching Between Instructions In The Instruction Store (Claim 11) 43

3. No "Selected Data" (Claims 2, 5) 44

4. Alleged "Selection Circuit" Is Not Within Alleged "Unified Shader" As Required (Claims 7, 10) 46

5. No "Control Signal" (Claims 7, 10) 49

6. No "Selection Circuit" or "Arbiter," "(Claim 10) 50

C. Ground 3: Selzer + Fiske 52

1. No Executing Operations Depending Upon An Amount Of Space Available In The Store (Claim 5), Much Less Performing Vertex

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

Operations Or Pixel Operations Until Enough Storage Is Available For The Other Operation Type (Claims 1, 3, 4) 52

2. No Processor Unit That Performs Vertex Manipulation Operations And Pixel Manipulation Operations At Various Degrees Of Completion Based On Switching Between Instructions In The Instruction Store (Claim 11) 57

3. No Execution of Instructions "In Response to" Receiving Selected Data (Claim 2) 59

4. Alleged "Sequencer," "Instruction Store," "Circuitry," "Selection Circuit," and "Arbiter" Are Not Within Alleged "Unified Shader" As Required (Claims 2, 5-7, 10, 11) 60

5. Alleged "Sequencer" And "Instruction Store" Do Not Maintain Instructions (Claims 2, 5, and 11) 63

6. No "Arbiter" (Claim 10) or "Control Signal" (Claims 7, 10) 65

7. No Motivation to Combine Selzer and Fiske 67

D. Secondary Considerations 68

1. Initial Skepticism of ATI's Unified Shader 69

2. Unexpected Results in Developing the Unified Shader 70

3. The Unified Shader's Satisfaction of a Long-Felt Need and Failed Attempts by Others 70

4. Industry Praise of the Unified Shader in the Xenos GPU 71

5. Commercial Success of the Xbox360 Containing ATI's Unified Shader .71

6. Adoption by Others 72

VI. CONCLUSION 72

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page(s)

Cases

ATI Techs. ULC v. Iancu,
920 F.3d 1362 (Fed. Cir. 2019) 17,18,28

CAE Screenplates, Inc. v. Heinrich Fiedler Gmbh & Co. Kg,
224 F.3d 1308 (Fed. Cir. 2000) 35

Catalina Mktg. Int'l v. Coolsavings.com, Inc.,
289 F.3d 801 (Fed. Cir. 2002) 48

In re Magnum Oil Tools Int'l, Ltd.,
829 F.3d 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2016) 60

Perfect Surgical Techniques, Inc. v. Olympus Am., Inc.,
841 F.3d 1004 (Fed. Cir. 2016) 24

Scott v. Koyama,
281 F.3d 1243 (Fed. Cir. 2002) 25

Singh v. Brake,
317 F.3d 1334 (Fed. Cir. 2003) 18

Townsend v. Smith,
36 F.2d 292 (C.C.P.A. 1929) 18

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.