UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD.,
Petitioner,

v.

DODOTS LICENSING SOLUTIONS LLC,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2023-00701
Patent 8,510,407 B1

CORRECTED PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION 1
II. A POSITA WOULD HAVE COMBINED BROWN AND WECKER 1
III. BROWN AND BROWN-WECKER RENDER THE CLAIMS OBVIOUS 5
A. Brown and Brown-Wecker render obvious a NIM template 5
1. Brown's HTML instructions include control characteristics 5
2. Brown's HTML instructions are data structures 9
B. Brown's desktop components render obvious a NIM, and have fully configurable frames 11
C. Brown's URLs are instructions for the transmission and reception of content over a network from a web server 14
1. DoDots admits that XML is internet content, and CDF files are coded in XML 14
2. Patent Owner ignores other examples of content references in Brown 16
D. Brown and Wecker render claims 1-4, 7-16, and 19-24 obvious 18
E. The combination of Brown and Beer, and Brown, Wecker, and Beer renders Claims 5-6 and 17-18 obvious 21
IV. A POSITA WOULD HAVE COMBINED SHIMADA AND BUCHHOLZ 23
A. The combination of Shimada-Buchholz does not rely on the "expanding device" 24
B. DoDots' alleged disparity between "HTML" templates and templates "similar" to HTML is unsupported on the record 24
V. SHIMADA-BUCHHOLZ RENDERS THE CLAIMS OBVIOUS 25
A. Shimada-Buchholz renders obvious a NIM template 25
1. Shimada's screen configuration data includes view characteristics 25
2. Shimada's screen configuration data includes control characteristics 26
3. Shimada's HTML is a "data structure," for the same reasons described above for Brown 28
4. Shimada's URLs are instructions for the transmission and reception of content over a network from a web server 29
B. Shimada-Buchholz renders obvious a NIM 29

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

C. Shimada-Buchholz renders obvious the dependent claims of the '407 Patent.....30

VI. THERE ARE NO SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS THAT SUPPORT PATENTABILITY 30

A. DoDots Fails to Establish Nexus 31

B. DoDots' Alleged Secondary Considerations Fail to Outweigh the Strong Evidence of Obviousness.....32

VII. CONCLUSION.....36

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

EXHIBIT LIST

SAMSUNG-1001 U.S. Patent No. 8,510,407 to Kembel, et al. ("the '407 Patent")

SAMSUNG-1002 Excerpts from the Prosecution History of the '407 Patent ("the Prosecution History")

SAMSUNG-1003 Declaration of Dr. Douglas C. Schmidt

SAMSUNG-1004 Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Douglas C. Schmidt

SAMSUNG-1005 U.S. Patent No. 6,278,448 B1 ("Brown")

SAMSUNG-1006 U.S. Patent No. 6,449,638 B1 ("Wecker")

SAMSUNG-1007 U.S. Patent No. 5,793,368 ("Beer")

SAMSUNG-1008 U.S. Patent No. 6,789,263 B1 ("Shimada")

SAMSUNG-1009 U.S. Patent No. 6,088,340 ("Buchholz")

SAMSUNG-1010 U.S. Patent No. 6,819,345 B1 ("Jones")

SAMSUNG-1011 *HTML 4 Unleashed* ("Darnell")

SAMSUNG-1012 IPR2019-01279 Final Written Decision

SAMSUNG-1013 U.S. Patent No. 6,342,907 B1 ("Petty")

SAMSUNG-1014 *Lenovo Holding Company, Inc. v. DoDots Licensing Solutions LLC*, No. 2021-1247, 2021 WL 5822248 (Dec. 8, 2021).

SAMSUNG-1015 U.S. Patent No. 6,311,058 B1 ("Wecker 2")

SAMSUNG-1016 U.S. Patent No. 5,737,560 ("Yohanan")

SAMSUNG-1017 CNET News, "PointCast unveils free news service," https://web.archive.org/web/20110616130215/http://news.cnet.com/PointCast-unveils-free-news-service/2100-1023_3-204658.html, last accessed Feb. 16, 2023

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

SAMSUNG-1018 Declaration of June Ann Munford

SAMSUNG-1019 *DoDots Licensing Solutions LLC v. Samsung Electronics Co., Ltd. et al.*, 6:22-cv-00535, W.D. Tex., filed May 24, 2022

SAMSUNG-1020 U.S. Patent No. 6,094,681 ("Shaffer")

SAMSUNG-1021 RESERVED

SAMSUNG-1022 U.S. Patent No. 6,185,614 B1 ("Cuomo")

SAMSUNG-1023 RESERVED

SAMSUNG-1024 Joint Claim Construction Statement, 6:22-cv-00535, W.D. Tex., filed May 15, 2023

SAMSUNG-1025 IPR2019-01279, Paper 40 (CAFC Decision)

SAMSUNG-1026 Email from Board dated November 15, 2023 authorizing Petitioner to file a Motion to Submit Supplemental Information

SAMSUNG-1027 Declaration of Michael Ballanco in Support of Pro Hac Vice Admission

SAMSUNG-1028 U.S. Patent No. 6,216,141 ("Straub")

SAMSUNG-1029 Declaration and Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Philip Greenspun

SAMSUNG-1030 Transcript of the deposition of Dr. Ted Selker

SAMSUNG-1031 Transcript of the deposition of John Kembel

SAMSUNG-1032 Transcript of the deposition of George Kembel

SAMSUNG-1033 Official Version PDF, "The Honorable Dr. Douglas C. Schmidt Director, Operational Test and Evaluation Office of the Secretary of Defense," https://www.dote.osd.mil/Portals/97/docs/bios/Schmidt_DOTE_BIO20240416.pdf?ver=gulFoMGyakgLeDTya8Wklw%3d%3d, last accessed May 25, 2024

SAMSUNG-1034 Microsoft's Computer Dictionary, 4th Edition

SAMSUNG-1035 *Inside Dynamic HTML*

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.