

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD.,
Petitioner,

v.

DODOTS LICENSING SOLUTIONS LLC,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2023-00701
Patent 8,510,407 B1

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	A POSITA WOULD HAVE COMBINED BROWN AND WECKER	1
III.	BROWN AND BROWN-WECKER RENDER THE CLAIMS OBVIOUS .5	
	A. Brown and Brown-Wecker render obvious a NIM template.....	5
	1. Brown’s HTML instructions include control characteristics.....	5
	2. Brown’s HTML instructions are data structures	9
	B. Brown’s desktop components render obvious a NIM, and have fully configurable frames	11
	C. Brown’s URLs are instructions for the transmission and reception of content over a network from a web server.....	14
	1. DoDots admits that XML is internet content, and CDF files are coded in XML	14
	2. Patent Owner ignores other examples of content references in Brown	16
	D. Brown and Wecker render claims 1-4, 7-16, and 19-24 obvious.....	18
	E. The combination of Brown and Beer, and Brown, Wecker, and Beer renders Claims 5-6 and 17-18 obvious	21
IV.	A POSITA WOULD HAVE COMBINED SHIMADA AND BUCHHOLZ	23
	A. The combination of Shimada-Buchholz does not rely on the “expanding device”	24
	B. DoDots’ alleged disparity between “HTML” templates and templates “similar” to HTML is unsupported on the record.....	24
V.	SHIMADA-BUCHHOLZ RENDERS THE CLAIMS OBVIOUS	25
	A. Shimada-Buchholz renders obvious a NIM template.....	25
	1. Shimada’s screen configuration data includes view characteristics	25
	2. Shimada’s screen configuration data includes control characteristics	26
	3. Shimada’s HTML is a “data structure,” for the same reasons described above for Brown	28
	4. Shimada’s URLs are instructions for the transmission and reception of content over a network from a web server.....	29
	B. Shimada-Buchholz renders obvious a NIM.....	29

- C. Shimada-Buchholz renders obvious the dependent claims of the '407 Patent.....30
- VI. THERE ARE NO SECONDARY CONSIDERATIONS THAT SUPPORT PATENTABILITY30
 - A. DoDots Fails to Establish Nexus31
 - B. DoDots' Alleged Secondary Considerations Fail to Outweigh the Strong Evidence of Obviousness.....32
- VII. CONCLUSION.....36

EXHIBIT LIST

- SAMSUNG-1001 U.S. Patent No. 8,510,407 to Kembel, et al. (“the ’407 Patent”)
- SAMSUNG-1002 Excerpts from the Prosecution History of the ’407 Patent (“the Prosecution History”)
- SAMSUNG-1003 Declaration of Dr. Douglas C. Schmidt
- SAMSUNG-1004 Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Douglas C. Schmidt
- SAMSUNG-1005 U.S. Patent No. 6,278,448 B1 (“Brown”)
- SAMSUNG-1006 U.S. Patent No. 6,449,638 B1 (“Wecker”)
- SAMSUNG-1007 U.S. Patent No. 5,793,368 (“Beer”)
- SAMSUNG-1008 U.S. Patent No. 6,789,263 B1 (“Shimada”)
- SAMSUNG-1009 U.S. Patent No. 6,088,340 (“Buchholz”)
- SAMSUNG-1010 U.S. Patent No. 6,819,345 B1 (“Jones”)
- SAMSUNG-1011 *HTML 4 Unleashed* (“Darnell”)
- SAMSUNG-1012 IPR2019-01279 Final Written Decision
- SAMSUNG-1013 U.S. Patent No. 6,342,907 B1 (“Petty”)
- SAMSUNG-1014 *Lenovo Holding Company, Inc. v. DoDots Licensing Solutions LLC*, No. 2021-1247, 2021 WL 5822248 (Dec. 8, 2021).
- SAMSUNG-1015 U.S. Patent No. 6,311,058 B1 (“Wecker 2”)
- SAMSUNG-1016 U.S. Patent No. 5,737,560 (“Yohanan”)
- SAMSUNG-1017 CNET News, “PointCast unveils free news service,”
https://web.archive.org/web/20110616130215/http://news.cnet.com/PointCast-unveils-free-news-service/2100-1023_3-204658.html, last accessed Feb. 16, 2023

- SAMSUNG-1018 Declaration of June Ann Munford
- SAMSUNG-1019 *DoDots Licensing Solutions LLC v. Samsung Electronics Co., Ltd. et al.*, 6:22-cv-00535, W.D. Tex., filed May 24, 2022
- SAMSUNG-1020 U.S. Patent No. 6,094,681 (“Shaffer”)
- SAMSUNG-1021 RESERVED
- SAMSUNG-1022 U.S. Patent No. 6,185,614 B1 (“Cuomo”)
- SAMSUNG-1023 RESERVED
- SAMSUNG-1024 Joint Claim Construction Statement, 6:22-cv-00535, W.D. Tex., filed May 15, 2023
- SAMSUNG-1025 IPR2019-01279, Paper 40 (CAFC Decision)
- SAMSUNG-1026 Email from Board dated November 15, 2023 authorizing Petitioner to file a Motion to Submit Supplemental Information
- SAMSUNG-1027 Declaration of Michael Ballanco in Support of Pro Hac Vice Admission
- SAMSUNG-1028 U.S. Patent No. 6,216,141 (“Straub”)
- SAMSUNG-1029 Declaration and Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Philip Greenspun
- SAMSUNG-1030 Transcript of the deposition of Dr. Ted Selker
- SAMSUNG-1031 Transcript of the deposition of John Kembel
- SAMSUNG-1032 Transcript of the deposition of George Kembel
- SAMSUNG-1033 Official Version PDF, “The Honorable Dr. Douglas C. Schmidt Director, Operational Test and Evaluation Office of the Secretary of Defense,”
https://www.dote.osd.mil/Portals/97/docs/bios/Schmidt_DOTE_BIO20240416.pdf?ver=gulFoMGyakgLeDTya8Wklw%3d%3d, last accessed May 25, 2024
- SAMSUNG-1034 Microsoft’s Computer Dictionary, 4th Edition
- SAMSUNG-1035 *Inside Dynamic HTML*

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.