

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

XILINX, INC.,

Petitioner

V.

POLARIS INNOVATIONS LIMITED,

Patent Owner

IPR2023-00516

Patent No. 6,157,589

Deposition of
STEPHEN W. MELVIN, Ph.D.
Tuesday, November 21, 2023

REPORTED BY: JOHN WISSENBACH, RDR, CRR, CSR 6862

GregoryEdwards, LLC | Worldwide Court Reporting
GregoryEdwards.com | 844-483-2643

Xilinx, Inc. v. Polaris Innovations Limited
Polaris Innovations Limited Ex. 2002 - 1
Deposition Transcript of Stephen W. Melvin, Ph.D.
IPR2023-00516



<p style="text-align: right;">Page 2</p> <p>1 INDEX OF EXAMINATIONS</p> <p>2 Page</p> <p>3 WITNESS:</p> <p>4 STEPHEN W. MELVIN, Ph.D.</p> <p>5 Examination by Mr. DeZern 4</p> <p>6</p> <p>7 * * * *</p> <p>8</p> <p>9 EXHIBITS REFERENCED</p> <p>10 Exhibit 1003 (Deposition Exhibit 1)</p> <p>11 Exhibit 1005 (Deposition Exhibit 2)</p> <p>12 Exhibit 1006 (Deposition Exhibit 3)</p> <p>13</p> <p>14 * * * *</p> <p>15</p> <p>16</p> <p>17</p> <p>18</p> <p>19</p> <p>20</p> <p>21</p> <p>22</p> <p>23</p> <p>24</p> <p>25</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 4</p> <p>1 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are now on the record</p> <p>2 for the video deposition of Dr. Stephen Melvin --</p> <p>3 the time is 8:33 a.m. November 21st, 2023 -- in the</p> <p>4 matter of Xilinx, Incorporated vs. Polaris</p> <p>5 Innovations Limited, IPR Number 2023-00516, being</p> <p>6 held in the United States Patent and Trademark</p> <p>7 Office before the Patent Trial and Appeal Board.</p> <p>8 The court reporter is John Wissenbach, the</p> <p>9 videographer is Gus Phillips, and both are</p> <p>10 representatives of GregoryEdwards LLC.</p> <p>11 Will counsel please state their appearances</p> <p>12 for the record, beginning with the petitioner.</p> <p>13 MR. KAPADIA: Yes. Aashish Kapadia, for</p> <p>14 petitioner, Xilinx, Incorporated.</p> <p>15 MR. DeZERN: And David DeZern, of Nelson</p> <p>16 Bumgardner Conroy, for the respondent, Polaris.</p> <p>17 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Will the court reporter</p> <p>18 please administer the oath.</p> <p>19 STEPHEN W. MELVIN, Ph.D.,</p> <p>20 having been first duly sworn, testified as follows:</p> <p>21 EXAMINATION BY MR. DeZERN</p> <p>22 Q. All right. Good morning.</p> <p>23 A. Good morning.</p> <p>24 Q. Could you please state your name.</p> <p>25 A. Yes. Stephen Melvin.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 3</p> <p>1 BE IT REMEMBERED that, pursuant to the laws</p> <p>2 governing the taking and use of depositions, on</p> <p>3 Tuesday, November 21, 2023, commencing at 8:33 a.m.,</p> <p>4 before me, JOHN WISSENBACH, CSR 6862, of San</p> <p>5 Francisco, California, appeared through</p> <p>6 videoconference STEPHEN W. MELVIN, Ph.D., at Delta,</p> <p>7 British Columba, Canada, called as a witness by the</p> <p>8 Patent Owner, who, being by me first duly sworn, was</p> <p>9 thereupon examined as a witness in said action.</p> <p>10 APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL VIA VIDEOCONFERENCE</p> <p>11 For the Petitioner:</p> <p>12 McDERMOTT WILL & EMERY LLP</p> <p>13 BY: AASHISH KAPADIA, Attorney at Law</p> <p>14 BRIAN W. OAKS, Attorney at Law</p> <p>15 300 Colorado Street, Suite 2200</p> <p>16 Austin, Texas 78701</p> <p>17 (512) 298-6488 akapadia@mwe.com</p> <p>18 (512) 726-2574 boaks@mwe.com</p> <p>19 For the Patent Owner:</p> <p>20 NELSON BUMGARDNER CONROY PC</p> <p>21 BY: DAVID T. DeZERN, Attorney at Law</p> <p>22 2727 N. Harwood Street, Suite 250</p> <p>23 Dallas, Texas 75201</p> <p>24 (214) 446-4958 david@nelbum.com</p> <p>25 ALSO PRESENT: GUS PHILLIPS, Videographer</p> <p>26</p> <p>27 * * * *</p> <p>28</p> <p>29</p> <p>30</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 5</p> <p>1 Q. And Dr. Melvin, because this is a remote</p> <p>2 deposition and we aren't in the same room, do you</p> <p>3 have any materials, written or electronic, with you</p> <p>4 today?</p> <p>5 A. I don't.</p> <p>6 Q. Do you intend to open any materials during</p> <p>7 the course of this deposition?</p> <p>8 A. Only the PDFs that -- that you put in the</p> <p>9 chat box.</p> <p>10 Q. Okay. Well, I'd just ask you, if there's</p> <p>11 any materials you might want to open that you have</p> <p>12 accessible, please let me know, so that we can mark</p> <p>13 them and keep a clean record of this deposition. Is</p> <p>14 that okay?</p> <p>15 A. Okay. That's fine, yes.</p> <p>16 Q. And do you have access to any chat or</p> <p>17 messaging applications other than through this Zoom</p> <p>18 platform that we are using?</p> <p>19 A. Not at the moment, no.</p> <p>20 Q. Okay. Will you let me know if you receive</p> <p>21 any messages during this deposition?</p> <p>22 A. Yes.</p> <p>23 Q. And is there anyone else in the room with</p> <p>24 you?</p> <p>25 A. No.</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 6</p> <p>1 Q. And will you please advise if anyone does 2 enter? 3 A. Yes, I will. 4 Q. Okay. Dr. Melvin, you've been deposed 5 before, right? 6 A. Yes. 7 Q. Approximately how many times? 8 A. 20 -- 20 to 30 times, maybe. 9 Q. Okay. So you know the drill. I'll ask 10 questions. You're under oath to answer. Your 11 counsel may object, but you still have to answer. 12 Is that okay? 13 A. Yes. 14 Q. And if you need a break, please just let me 15 know. We can do that. But I'd ask that you finish 16 responding to any pending questions. 17 A. Okay. 18 Q. Any reason you can't testify truthfully to 19 the best of your ability today? 20 A. No. 21 (Deposition Exhibit 1 was marked for 22 identification.) 23 BY MR. DeZERN: 24 Q. All right. Now, I'm going to mark as 25 Exhibit 1 -- which, as we discussed, I'm submitting</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 8</p> <p>1 A. Yes. 2 Q. Did anyone else contribute to the work or 3 analysis for your opinions in this declaration? 4 A. I don't recall any. 5 Q. Okay. And in your declaration, you 6 provided your opinions regarding the validity of the 7 '589 patent based on several different references, 8 right? 9 A. That's correct. 10 Q. So I just have to -- I just want to ask a 11 few questions about some of -- some of those 12 opinions. And let's start with -- well, actually, 13 we can -- if you still have the second page of your 14 declaration pulled up, some of the opinions you 15 provided were based on a reference which is listed 16 here as 1005, U.S. Patent Number 5,774,402, to Lee, 17 correct? 18 A. That's correct. 19 Q. And can we just refer to that as the Lee 20 reference this morning? 21 A. Yeah, sure. 22 Q. Okay. So if you will flip in your 23 declaration to page 70, I believe. Please let me 24 know when you're there. 25 A. Okay. That's page 70 on the bottom or --</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 7</p> <p>1 through the chat. And it will upload. And I'll 2 give you a second. Please let me know when you've 3 got that. 4 A. Okay. I have it. Shall I open it? 5 Q. Please. 6 A. Okay. I see it. 7 Q. And is this Exhibit 1 your declaration? 8 A. Yes, it is. 9 Q. And specifically, just looking at the top 10 of it, this is a declaration you submitted in this 11 IPR, which relates to -- actually, the patent 12 number's not on the top, is it? -- the -- if you go 13 to the second page, this is about your opinions 14 regarding U.S. Patent Number 6,157,589, correct? 15 A. That's correct. 16 Q. And could we just refer to that as the '589 17 patent this morning? 18 A. Sure. 19 Q. Dr. Melvin, was anyone else involved in 20 creating this declaration? 21 A. Well, I worked with the attorneys on it. 22 Q. Your counsel defending you today? 23 A. Yes. 24 Q. And potentially other lawyers at his law 25 firm, I presume?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 9</p> <p>1 Q. It is. And it should also be page 70 in 2 the PDF. 3 A. Okay. There's different numbers. The 4 exhibit page number is four off from the PDF. So 5 which page? I think you want me to turn to page 66 6 of the -- the -- 7 Q. Oh, I'm sorry. I forgot there are two page 8 numbers. I was looking in the bottom right corner. 9 So, yes, 66 in the middle; page 70 in the bottom 10 right. 11 A. Yeah. Okay. I got it. 12 Q. Okay. And this is an annotated figure of 13 Lee of one of -- of figure 3 from Lee that you 14 provide in your declaration, correct? 15 A. That is correct. 16 Q. So I just want to kind of use this to 17 orient -- orient us to -- to what we're talking 18 about here. So just at a high level, can you kind 19 of describe what is presented here and -- and 20 generally what -- what this annotated figure is 21 showing? 22 A. Yeah. In -- what I'm doing here with this 23 figure is mapping the -- the circuitry that's 24 disclosed in Lee onto the claim limitations. And 25 this signal INIT is what I'm saying is -- I'm</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 10</p> <p>1 mapping that to the supply voltage stable signal. 2 And the signal RST, R-S-T, is the enable signal. 3 And what's shown in gray is the enable circuit. And 4 what's shown in yellow is the initialization 5 circuit. 6 Q. Okay. And you've got -- I believe you put 7 some orange -- an orange bracket around the inputs 8 to what you've labeled as the "Enable Circuit." 9 There's three different signals there, right? 10 A. On the left you mean, yeah, the command 11 signals. 12 Q. And those signals are, in Lee, DSF, RASB, 13 and CASB, right? 14 A. That is correct. Yeah. 15 Q. So I wanted to ask you some questions about 16 what those signals are precisely. And feel free to 17 reference your declaration or point me to anywhere 18 where you've discussed it if that would be helpful. 19 But let's just start at the top. Well, actually, 20 let's start at the bottom. 21 So what -- what is CASB? And is that how 22 you would refer to it, or call it "CASB," or what 23 would be easiest this morning? 24 A. I would refer to it as CAS. It's -- 25 Q. CAS?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 12</p> <p>1 A. Yeah. So DRAMs have other signals, 2 typically Output Enable, Write Enable, Chip Enable. 3 They sometimes have different names. But those are 4 commonly used in -- in memory -- memory devices as 5 additional control signals. 6 Q. Okay. And, actually, if I could direct you 7 to paragraph 53 of your declaration, which is on 8 page 31 in the bottom right corner, which is 31 of 9 the PDF -- 10 A. Okay. 11 Q. -- or page 27 in the -- in the middle. 12 A. Yes, I see that. 13 Q. Okay. So I'm just looking at this 14 statement. The -- well, let me back up. 15 So at the start of paragraph 53, brief 16 explanation of CAS and RAS and those other 17 additional control signals, such as Chip Select and 18 Write Enable, right? 19 A. Yes, I see that. 20 Q. And then you explain, let's see, "These 21 various input signals are used to perform specific 22 commands by way of a command decoder," et cetera, 23 right? Do you see that? 24 A. Yes. 25 Q. And then "Depending on the combination of</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 11</p> <p>1 A. The B is -- stands for "bar," meaning it's 2 low true. But RAS and CAS are commonly used signals 3 in DRAMs. Frequently they're low. They're low 4 active. They're drawn with a bar over them. So 5 what Lee has done is -- which is fairly common, is 6 just labeled it, you know, "CASB," which is -- which 7 is the same as "CAS" with a bar over it, meaning 8 it's low -- it's low active. So I think we could 9 just refer to those as RAS and CAS if you want. 10 Q. Okay. That works. 11 And what is the DSF signal? 12 A. That's a special mode pin that is used on 13 certain DRAMs to enable the activation of certain 14 modes, special modes. 15 Q. And so I believe in your declaration, you 16 refer to these -- these are examples of control 17 signals that are typically provided to a DRAM, 18 right? 19 A. That's correct. 20 Q. And I think you had identified some other 21 ones. There are additional control signals, such as 22 Chip Select, Write Enable. Does that sound right? 23 A. Did I identify those with respect to Lee or 24 in general? I mean -- 25 Q. Just in general for DRAM devices.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 13</p> <p>1 these input signals sent from the memory controller 2 to the DRAM device, a different command is 3 identified and performed," correct? 4 A. Yes. 5 Q. Okay. So -- so signals such as RAS and CAS 6 and -- or DSF, those would be individual signals 7 provided to a DRAM normally, right? 8 A. Yeah. In general those are signals coming 9 in externally to the DRAM. 10 Q. Okay. Those are -- those are examples of 11 signals that come in externally to the DRAM. Got 12 it. 13 And can you kind of walk me through -- 14 again, looking back at your annotated figure of Lee, 15 what does the -- what you have put a box around 16 calling it "Enable Circuit," what does it do with 17 these signals that are provided to the DRAM? 18 A. So there's a circuit -- there's a -- a 19 circuit there. You see the three inputs coming into 20 input buffers. And then there's a circuit that 21 requires a certain sequence, or a certain pattern, 22 if you will, of those signals. And when it gets 23 that pattern, then it -- then SET goes out. Then 24 the output SET is activated and then deactivated. 25 And I think -- there's a timing diagram in</p>

Page 14

1 figure 4. I don't know if it's here. We'd have to
 2 pull up Lee. But it illustrates the -- the sequence
 3 of -- or the pattern of -- of -- of inputs that
 4 causes that to happen. So the purpose of the gray
 5 box is to -- or at least the -- box 46 is to detect
 6 that sequence on the input signals.
 7 Q. Okay. And let me -- since you mentioned
 8 Lee and the timing diagram, let me just go ahead and
 9 mark Lee for us. If you'll give me a second.
 10 (Deposition Exhibit 2 was marked for
 11 identification.)
 12 BY MR. DeZERN:
 13 Q. I've put in the chat what I've marked as
 14 Exhibit 2. Let me know when you've got it pulled
 15 up, please.
 16 A. Okay. I have it.
 17 Q. Okay. And if you could flip to figure 4,
 18 which I believe is the timing diagram you were just
 19 referring to. And let me know when you've got that.
 20 A. Yeah, I have that.
 21 I've got it.
 22 Q. Okay. Thank you. Sorry. I just wanted to
 23 make sure I've got it, too.
 24 Okay. So with figure 4 pulled up, if you
 25 could just kind of explain at a high level what --

Page 15

1 what's going on in your annotated figure 3 using
 2 these RAS, CAS, and DSF signals and reference --
 3 referencing the -- figure 4 of Lee as needed to help
 4 me understand what's going on.
 5 A. Yeah. So this is showing RAS -- showing
 6 CAS going low, and then there's a little arrow that
 7 is drawn down to the signal C. I'm just going to
 8 call it C. There's a little Greek symbol before it
 9 indicating that's a clock signal, PHY symbol. But
 10 let's just call it C.
 11 So CAS goes down to C. And so this shows
 12 the causality here, where CAS goes low, causes C to
 13 go high, and that causes this -- the signal called
 14 CTL to go high. And then you have RAS going low,
 15 which causes R to go high, which then causes the
 16 signal MSH to go high; and similarly with DSF.
 17 So the top three lines in this figure are
 18 the external pins, and everything else are the
 19 internal signals. And this is illustrating how this
 20 sequence of CAS low, RAS low, with DSF low causes
 21 ultimately SET to go high. And the SET signal going
 22 high is what will basically hold the RST signal
 23 high.
 24 Now, one thing to understand about figure 4
 25 is that the very last line on this figure is --

Page 16

1 illustrates what Lee calls -- calls the failure
 2 mode, or the error, or the case when the supply
 3 voltage stable signal doesn't trigger properly. But
 4 in the normal operation, that RST signal would be
 5 shown as high coming in from the left. And it's
 6 the -- it's the -- the ultimate goal of this whole
 7 sequence is for the RST signal to go low, which
 8 causes the -- releases the circuits out of
 9 initialization.
 10 So -- so that very last little arrow going
 11 down to RST is not actually -- doesn't actually
 12 exist in the normal operation, but in the case
 13 that -- what Lee calls the -- the failure of the
 14 power-up signal to enable properly, then that would
 15 cause RST to go high before it goes low.
 16 Q. Okay. So let me follow up on -- on some of
 17 that to make sure I understand.
 18 So if we're looking at figure 4 of Lee --
 19 and correct me if I'm wrong, but if -- if operating
 20 normally, then the RST signal, R-S-T -- again, we'll
 21 just -- we'll ignore the Greek symbol in front of
 22 it. But the RST signal, you're saying, should be
 23 high. It should already have been high regardless
 24 of the operation of -- of this -- the rest of this
 25 timing diagram that we're looking at?

Page 17

1 A. Yeah, that's right. And that can be seen
 2 by looking at figure 3, because in -- when -- when
 3 the INIT -- the INIT signal triggers RST to go high.
 4 And everything in figure 4 is what happens after
 5 power-on, after the voltage supply signal.
 6 So in the normal mode, the INIT signal --
 7 and you can see the INIT signal goes down to this
 8 gate 50 if you look at figure 3. And that's a
 9 little latch, because there's feedback. So -- so
 10 when INIT goes high, then the output goes low, which
 11 causes 52 to go high, which then will hold that NOR
 12 gate in -- in a high state -- or I mean in a low
 13 state, which will cause RST to go high.
 14 So in the normal mode of operation, when,
 15 you know, the -- the power-up circuit works
 16 correctly, then you would see the RST signal high
 17 coming in from the left, because -- because you only
 18 need the circuit -- you only need 46 to -- to
 19 trigger it to go low in the normal mode. But the --
 20 Lee has drawn it this way, I think, to illustrate
 21 one of the ideas, which was that even in the case
 22 that you have failed -- that the power-up supply
 23 circuit has failed, you can still --
 24 (Discussion off the record.)
 25 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.