

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

GARMIN INTERNATIONAL, INC., GARMIN USA, INC.,
AND GARMIN LTD.,
Petitioner,

v.

AIRE TECHNOLOGY LIMITED,
Patent Owner.

IPR2023-00188
U.S. Patent No. 8,581,706

**PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW
UNDER 35 U.S.C. § 312 AND 37 C.F.R. § 42.104**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PETITIONER’S EXHIBIT LIST 5

I. INTRODUCTION 7

II. GROUNDS FOR STANDING 8

III. NOTE 8

IV. SUMMARY OF THE ‘706 PATENT 8

V. PROSECUTION HISTORY 11

VI. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART 12

VII. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION 13

VIII. RELIEF REQUESTED AND THE REASONS FOR THE REQUESTED RELIEF 14

IX. DISCRETIONARY DENIAL WOULD BE INAPPROPRIATE 14

A. Discretionary denial under the *Fintiv* factors is not appropriate 14

1. The district court case is stayed 14

2. Parallel proceeding trial date 15

3. Investment in the parallel proceeding 15

4. Overlapping issues with the parallel proceeding 15

5. Petitioner is a defendant 15

6. Other circumstances 16

B. The *Fintiv* Framework Should Be Overturned 16

C. Discretionary denial under *General Plastic* is not appropriate 16

1. Garmin is a different, unrelated petitioner. 18

2. Factor 2 is of little probative value. 19

3. Patent owner preliminary responses. 19

4. Fourth and fifth factors are inapplicable. 20

5.	The resources of the Board and the requirement under 35 U.S.C. § 316(a)(11).	20
D.	Discretionary denial under 35 U.S.C. § 325(d) is not appropriate	20
X.	IDENTIFICATION OF HOW THE CLAIMS ARE UNPATENTABLE	21
A.	Challenged Claims	21
B.	Statutory Grounds for Challenges.....	21
C.	Ground 1: Claims 1-3 and 11-12 are obvious under 35 U.S.C. § 103 over Guthery and Nozawa.	23
1.	Summary of Guthery.....	23
2.	Summary of Nozawa.....	28
3.	Reasons to Combine Guthery and Nozawa	29
4.	Claim 1.....	34
5.	Claim 2.....	49
6.	Claim 3.....	51
7.	Claim 11.....	53
8.	Claim 12.....	62
D.	Ground 2: Claim 16 is obvious over Guthery, Nozawa, and the RFID Handbook.....	63
1.	Summary of the RFID Handbook.....	63
2.	Reasons to Combine the RFID Handbook with Guthery and Nozawa	65
3.	Claim 16.....	68
E.	Ground 3: Claim 18 is obvious over Guthery and the Smart Card Handbook.....	71
1.	Summary of the Smart Card Handbook.....	71
2.	Reasons to Combine the Smart Card Handbook with Guthery	73
3.	Claim 18.....	76

F.	Ground 4: Claim 20 is obvious over Guthery and the RFID Handbook.	82
	82
4.	Claim 20.....	82
XI.	CONCLUSION.....	87
XII.	MANDATORY NOTICES.....	88
A.	Real Party-in-Interest	88
B.	Related Matters	88
C.	Lead and Back-up Counsel and Service Information	88
	CERTIFICATE OF WORD COUNT	90
	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE	91

PETITIONER'S EXHIBIT LIST

Ex.1001	U.S. Patent No. 8,581,706
Ex.1002	Prosecution History of U.S. Patent No. 8,581,706
Ex.1003	Declaration of Dr. Joshua Phinney under 37 C.F.R. § 1.68
Ex.1004	<i>Curriculum Vitae</i> of Dr. Joshua Phinney
Ex.1005	U.S. Patent No. 6,824,064 to Guthery et al. (“Guthery”)
Ex.1006	JP2000163539 to Nozawa et al. (“Nozawa”) – Certified English Translation
Ex.1007	<i>RFID Handbook: Radio-Frequency Identification Fundamentals and Applications</i> , Klaus Finkenzeller (1999)
Ex.1008	<i>Smart Card Handbook: Third Edition</i> , Wolfgang Rankl (3 rd ed. 2003)
Ex.1009	Reserved.
Ex.1010	Reserved.
Ex.1011	Complaint, <i>Aire Technology Ltd. v. Apple Inc.</i> 6-21-cv-01101 (W.D. Tex. Oct. 22, 2021)
Ex.1012	Infringement Contentions, <i>Aire Technology Ltd. v. Apple Inc.</i> 6-21-cv-01101 (W.D. Tex. Oct. 22, 2021)
Ex.1013	Scheduling Order, <i>Aire Technology Ltd. v. Apple Inc.</i> 6-21-cv-01101 (W.D. Tex. Oct. 22, 2021)
Ex.1014	Standing Order Governing Proceedings (OGP) 4.1
Ex.1015	Complaint, <i>Aire Technology Ltd v. Samsung Electronics Co., Ltd.</i> , 6:21-cv-00955 (W.D. Tex. Sep. 15, 2021)
Ex.1016	JP2000163539 to Nozawa et al. (original)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.