

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

In re Patent of: Billhartz et al.
U.S. Patent No.: 7,110,779 Attorney Docket No. 50095-0111IP1
Issue Date: September 19, 2006
Appl. Serial No.: 10/767,794
Filing Date: January 29, 2004
Title: WIRELESS COMMUNICATIONS SYSTEM INCLUDING
A WIRELESS DEVICE LOCATOR AND RELATED
METHODS

Mail Stop Patent Board

Patent Trial and Appeal Board
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, VA 22313-1450

**PETITION FOR *INTER PARTES* REVIEW OF UNITED STATES PATENT
NO. 7,110,779 PURSUANT TO 35 U.S.C. §§ 311–319, 37 C.F.R. § 42**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	IPR REQUIREMENTS—37 C.F.R. §42.104	1
	A. Standing—37 C.F.R. §42.104(a)	1
	B. Challenge and Relief—37 C.F.R. §42.104(b)	1
	C. Claim Construction—37 C.F.R. §42.104(b)(3)	2
III.	THE '779 PATENT	3
	A. Brief Description.....	3
	B. Prosecution History Summary	4
IV.	LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL	4
V.	THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS ARE UNPATENTABLE	5
	A. GROUND 1: Claims 1, 2, 8-10, 12-13, 18-19, 22-24, 26-28, 32, 34 are Obvious Over McCrady-Raphaeli	5
	1. McCrady	5
	2. Raphaeli	7
	3. McCrady-Raphaeli Combination	8
	4. Independent Claims 1, 18, 27	13
	5. Claims 2, 19, 28 and Independent Claim 13	29
	6. Claims 8, 22.....	30
	7. Claims 9, 23.....	31
	8. Claims 10, 24, 32.....	31
	9. Claims 12, 26, 34.....	31
	B. GROUND 2: Claims 1, 3-6, 10-11, 13-17, 20-21, 24-25, 29-33 are Obvious Over McCrady-Raphaeli-Rofheart.....	32
	1. Rofheart	32
	2. McCrady-Raphaeli-Rofheart Combination	34
	3. Independent Claims 1, 13	37
	4. Claims 3, 14, 20, 29.....	38
	5. Claims 4, 15, 30.....	41
	6. Claims 5, 16.....	43
	7. Claims 6, 17, 21.....	44
	8. Claims 10, 24, 32.....	45
	9. Claims 11, 25, 33.....	45
	10. Claim 31	46

C.	GROUND 3: Claims 6-7, 17, 21, 31 are Obvious Over McCrady-Raphaeli-Kuwahara	46
1.	Kuwahara.....	46
2.	McCrady-Raphaeli-Kuwahara Combination	47
3.	Claims 6, 17, 21.....	49
4.	Claim 7	51
5.	Claim 31	52
D.	GROUND 4: Claims 1-6, 8-34 are Obvious Over Rofheart-Raphaeli-Godfrey	52
1.	Godfrey.....	52
2.	Rofheart-Raphaeli-Godfrey Combination.....	54
3.	Independent Claims 1, 18, 27.....	59
4.	Claims 2, 19, 28 and Independent Claim 13	72
5.	Claims 3, 14, 20, 29.....	73
6.	Claims 4, 15, 30.....	75
7.	Claims 5, 16.....	76
8.	Claims 6, 17, 21.....	76
9.	Claims 8, 22.....	77
10.	Claims 9, 23.....	77
11.	Claims 10, 24, 32.....	78
12.	Claims 11, 25, 33.....	78
13.	Claims 12, 26, 34.....	78
14.	Claim 31	79
VI.	DISCRETION SHOULD NOT PRECLUDE INSTITUTION	79
A.	The <i>Fintiv</i> Factors Favor Institution—§314(a)	79
1.	Factor 1	79
2.	Factor 2.....	79
3.	Factor 3	80
4.	Factor 4.....	81
5.	Factor 5.....	81
6.	Factor 6.....	81
B.	The <i>Advanced Bionics</i> Test Favors Institution—§325(d)	81
VII.	FEES—37 C.F.R. §42.103	82
VIII.	MANDATORY NOTICES—37 C.F.R §42.8(a)(1)	82
A.	Real Party-In-Interest—37 C.F.R. §42.8(b)(1).....	82
B.	Related Matters—37 C.F.R. §42.8(b)(2).....	82
C.	Lead And Back-Up Counsel Under 37 C.F.R. §42.8(b)(3).....	84
D.	Service Information	84

EXHIBITS

- APPLE-1001 U.S. Patent 7,110,779 to Thomas Jay Billhartz, *et al.* (“the ’779 Patent”)
- APPLE-1002 Excerpts from the Prosecution History of the ’779 Patent (“the Prosecution History”)
- APPLE-1003 Declaration of Dr. Zhi Ding
- APPLE-1004 Curriculum Vitae of Dr. Zhi Ding
- APPLE-1005 U.S. Patent 6,453,168 to McCrady (“McCrady”)
- APPLE-1006 U.S. Patent 7,511,604 to Raphaeli, *et al.* (“Raphaeli”)
- APPLE-1007 U.S. Patent 6,070,079 to Kuwahara (“Kuwahara”)
- APPLE-1008 WO2003098528 to Raphaeli, *et al.* (“Raphaeli”)
- APPLE-1009 U.S. Patent 7,058,414 to Rofheart (“Rofheart”)
- APPLE-1010 Hargrave’s Communications Dictionary, 2001 (excerpts)
- APPLE-1011 The Authoritative Dictionary of IEEE Standards Terms, 2000 (excerpts)
- APPLE-1012 Federal Court Management Statistics June 2022 published by the Administrative Office of the U.S. Courts, retrieved from https://www.uscourts.gov/sites/default/files/fcms_na_distprofile_0630.2022_0.pdf on August 19, 2022
- APPLE-1013 Scheduling Order, *Speir Technologies Ltd. v. Apple Inc.*, Case 6:22-cv-00077-ADA (WDTX)

- APPLE-1014 Complaint for Patent Infringement Against Apple Inc., *Speir Technologies Ltd. v. Apple Inc.*, Case 6:22-cv-00077-ADA (WDTX)
- APPLE-1015 Amended Complaint for Patent Infringement Against Apple Inc., *Speir Technologies Ltd. v. Apple Inc.*, Case 6:22-cv-00077-ADA (WDTX)
- APPLE-1016 Preliminary Disclosure of Asserted Claims and Infringement Contentions to Defendant Apple Inc., *Speir Technologies Ltd. v. Apple Inc.*, Case 6:22-cv-00077-ADA (WDTX)
- APPLE-1017 Apple's Opening Claim Construction Brief, *Speir Technologies Ltd. v. Apple Inc.*, Case 6:22-cv-00077-ADA (WDTX)
- APPLE-1018 Speir's Responsive Claim Construction Brief, *Speir Technologies Ltd. v. Apple Inc.*, Case 6:22-cv-00077-ADA (WDTX)
- APPLE-1019 U.S. Patent 6,181,944 to Uebayashi *et al.* ("Uebayashi")
- APPLE-1020 U.S. Patent 5,945,948 to Buford *et al.* ("Buford")
- APPLE-1021 U.S. Patent 5,929,806 to Birchler *et al.* ("Birchler")
- APPLE-1022 U.S. Patent 5,365,516 to Jandrell ("Jandrell")
- APPLE-1023 U.S. Patent 6,760,882 to Gesbert *et al.* ("Gesbert")
- APPLE-1024 U.S. Patent App. Pub. 2006/0234725 to Litwin ("Litwin")
- APPLE-1025 U.S. Patent App. Pub. 2002/0136226 to Christoffel *et al.* ("Christoffel")
- APPLE-1026 C. Eisenhart, "Realistic Evaluation of the Precision and Accuracy of Instrument Calibration Systems," JOURNAL OF RESEARCH of the National Bureau of Standards-C. Engineering and Instrumentation, Vol. 67C, No.2, April-June

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.