

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

TWI PHARMACEUTICALS, INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

MERCK SERONO SA,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2023-00049
Patent 7,713,947

Case IPR2023-00050
Patent 8,377,903

**DECLARATION OF FRED D. LUBLIN, M.D.
UNDER 37 C.F.R. § 1.68**

Merck 2019
TWi v. Merck
IPR2023-00049
IPR2023-00050

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	BACKGROUND AND QUALIFICATIONS	2
III.	SUMMARY OF OPINIONS.....	6
IV.	LEVEL OF SKILL IN THE ART	12
V.	LEGAL STANDARDS	13
	A. NOVELTY	13
	B. OBVIOUSNESS	14
	C. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	15
VI.	TECHNICAL FIELD OF THE ART	16
	A. Multiple Sclerosis.....	16
	1. MS Clinical Course and Diagnosis.....	17
	2. MS Treatment as of 2004.....	19
	3. Outcome Measures in MS Clinical Trials.....	28
	4. Cladribine Investigations For MS.....	31
	B. Alleged Prior Art.....	36
	1. Bodor (Ex. 1029).....	36
	2. Rice (Ex. 1008)	36
VII.	THE '947 AND '903 PATENTS INVENTIONS	39
	A. The '947 Patent Invention.....	39

B. The '903 Patent Invention43

VIII. THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS OF THE '947 AND '903 PATENTS
ARE PATENTABLE.....46

A. Ground I: Claims 36, 38-39, and 41-48 of the '947 Patent and
Claims 17, 19-20, and 22-29 of the '903 Patent Are Not
Anticipated by Bodor47

1. The Challenged Claims of the '947 Patent and the '903
Patent.....47

a. Bodor Does Not Disclose All Claim Limitations.....47

i. Bodor Does Not Disclose the Claimed
Induction Period Dose of About 1.7 or 1.7-
3.5 Mg/Kg or Maintenance Period Dose of
About 1.7 Mg/Kg47

b. Bodor Does Not Disclose a Maintenance Period as
Claimed.....53

i. Bodor Does Not Disclose Re-Treatment.....53

a) Cladribine Treatment Raises Safety
Concerns.....54

b)	There Was No “Standard Course of Treatment” For Dosing Immunosuppressants.....	57
c)	The Art Did Not Disclose a Maintenance Period as Claimed	66
2.	The Challenged Claims of the ’903 Patent	75
B.	Ground II: Claims 36, 38-39, 41-48 of the ’947 Patent and Claims 17, 19-20, and 22-29 of the ’903 Patent Would Not Have Been Obvious Over Bodor in View of the Knowledge of a POSA.....	77
1.	The Challenged Claims of the ’947 Patent and the ’903 Patent.....	77
a.	Bodor Does Not Disclose or Suggest All Claim Limitations.....	77
b.	A POSA Would Not Have Been Motivated to Modify Bodor’s Method to Arrive at the Claims or Have Had Any Reasonable Expectation of Success in Doing So	77
i.	A POSA Would Not Have Been Motivated to Repeat Bodor’s Method to Treat MS or	

	Have Had Any Reasonable Expectation of Success in Doing So	77
ii.	A POSA Would Not Have Been Motivated to “Fine Tune Dosages” to Arrive at the Claimed Method with a Reasonable Expectation of Success	91
2.	The Challenged Claims of the ’903 Patent	98
C.	Ground III: Claims 36, 38-39, 41-48 of the ’947 Patent and Claims 17, 19-20, and 22-29 of the ’903 Patent Would Not Have Been Obvious Over Bodor and Rice	100
1.	The Challenged Claims of the ’947 Patent and the ’903 Patent.....	100
a.	Bodor and Rice Do Not Teach or Suggest All Claim Limitations	100
b.	A POSA Would Not Have Been Motivated to Combine or Modify Bodor and Rice to Arrive at the Claimed Method or Have Had a Reasonable Expectation of Success in Doing So.....	103
2.	The Challenged Claims of the ’903 Patent	109

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.