

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

MEDIVIS, INC.
Petitioner

v.

NOVARAD CORP.
Patent Owner

US Patent No. 11,004,271

Inter Partes Review No. IPR2023-00042

**REPLY IN
INTER PARTES REVIEW OF US PATENT NO. 11,004,271**

ME1 46109404v.4

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION.....	1
A. The Response Does Not Qualify the Cited Opinions	1
B. The Patent Conflicts with Novarad’s Construction of “3D data”	3
C. The Patent Refutes Novarad’s Construction of “Inner Layer(s) of The Patient”	6
D. The Patent Refutes Novarad’s Proposed Construction of “Confined Within a Volume of a Virtual 3D Shape”	10
E. Novarad Fails to Show that its Inclusion of “Being Having” Is a Correctable Error	13
III. DOO ANTICIPATES CLAIMS 1, 5, AND 6	14
A. <i>Doo</i> Anticipates Claim 1	14
1. Preamble: “[a] method for augmenting real-time, non-image actual views of a patient with three- dimensional (3D) data”	14
2. Claim 1’s first step: “identifying 3D data for the patient, the 3D data including an outer layer of the patient and multiple inner layers of the patient”	14
3. Claim 1’s second step: “displaying, in an augmented reality (AR) headset, one of the inner layers of the patient from the 3D data projected onto real-time, non-image actual views of the outer layer of the patient”	16
4. Claim 1’s final limitation: “the projected inner layer of the patient from the 3D data being confined within a volume of a virtual 3D shape”	17
B. <i>Doo</i> Anticipates Claim 5 and 6	18
IV. DOO AND AMIRA RENDER CLAIMS 1-6 AND 11-20 OBVIOUS.....	19
A. <i>Amira</i> Is Prior Art.....	19

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
B. Motive to Combine <i>Doo</i> and <i>Amira</i>	19
C. <i>Doo</i> and <i>Amira</i> Render Claim 1 Obvious	20
D. <i>Doo</i> and <i>Amira</i> Render Claims 2-6 Obvious	22
E. <i>Doo</i> and <i>Amira</i> Render Claim 11 Obvious	23
1. Claim 11’s second step: “altering the original color gradient of the multiple inner layers to be lighter than the original color gradient in order to be better visible when projected onto real-time, non-image actual views of the outer layer of the patient”	23
2. Claim 11’s final limitation—“the projected inner layer of the patient from the 3D data being having the altered color gradient”	24
F. <i>Doo</i> and <i>Amira</i> Render Claims 12-20 Obvious	24
V. CHEN, 3D-VISUALIZATION, AND 3D-SLICER-GUI RENDER CLAIMS 1-6 AND 11-20 OBVIOUS	26
A. Motive to Combine <i>Chen</i> , <i>3D-Visualization</i> , and <i>3D-Slicer-GUI</i>	26
B. <i>Chen</i> , <i>3D-Visualization</i> , and <i>3D-Slicer-GUI</i> Are Prior Art.....	27
1. <i>Chen</i>	27
2. <i>3D-Visualization</i>	27
3. <i>3D-Slicer-GUI</i>	28
C. The <i>Chen</i> Combination Renders Claim 1-6 Obvious	28
D. The <i>Chen</i> Combination Renders Claims 11-20 Obvious.....	29
VI. CONCLUSION	30

TABLE OF EXHIBITS

Exhibit	Description
Ex. 1001	US Patent No. 11,004,271, claiming priority to March 30, 2017 (the '271 Patent)
Ex. 1002	Excerpts of File history of Application No. 16/574,524, now the '271 Patent
Ex. 1003	Excerpts of File history of Application No. 15/894,595, now U.S. Patent No. 10,475,244, through which the '271 Patent claims priority
Ex. 1004	Excerpts of File history of Application No. 15/474,702, filed on March 30, 2017, and now U.S. Patent No. 9,892,564, through which the '271 Patent claims priority
Ex. 1005	Excerpt of Amira 5 User's Guide title through Chapter 2 (Visual Imaging 2009) (" <i>Amira</i> ")
Ex. 1006	US Patent Application Publication No. US 2016/0191887 A1 to Casas, published on June 30, 2016 (" <i>Casas</i> ")
Ex. 1007	S. Pujol, Ph.D. et al., 3D Visualization of DICOM Images for Radiological Applications (Surgical Planning Laboratory, Brigham and Women's Hospital, Boston, Massachusetts 2014) (" <i>3D Visualization</i> ")
Ex. 1008	International Publication No. WO 2015/164402 A1 to Doo et al., published on October 29, 2015 (" <i>Doo</i> ")
Ex. 1009	X. Chen et al., "Development of a Surgical Navigation System Based On Augmented Reality Using an Optical See-Through Head-Mounted Display," 55 JOURNAL OF BIOMEDICAL INFORMATICS 124-131 (2015) (" <i>Chen</i> ")

TABLE OF EXHIBITS

Exhibit	Description
Ex. 1010	Main Application GUI for 3D Slicer < https://www.slicer.org/wiki/Documentation/4.6/Slicer/Application/MainApplicationGUI > (last edited 7 November 2016) (“3D Slicer”)
Ex. 1011	E. Azimi et al., “Augmented Reality Goggles with an Integrated Tracking System for Navigations in Neurosurgery,” IEEE VIRTUAL REALITY 123-124, 123 (IEEE 2012) (“AR Goggle for Neurosurgery”).
Ex. 1012	Declaration of Peter Kazanzides Ph.D.
Ex. 1013	Curriculum Vitae of Peter Kazanzides Ph.D.
Ex. 1014	Email message entitled “Novarad v. Medivis” and dated August 3, 2022, from counsel for Novarad, Brett Davis, to counsel for Medivis, Brian Lemon and others.
Exhibit 1015	Declaration of Christopher Fraiser (May 22, 2023) [served May 22, 2023]
Exhibit 1016	Page Vault capture of Slicer.org Main Applications GUI [served May 22, 2023]
Exhibit 1017	Page Vault capture of Slicer.org Acknowledgements [served May 22, 2023]
Exhibit 1018	Page Vault capture of Slicer.org Release Details Slicer 4.6.0 [served May 22, 2023]
Exhibit 1019	Page Vault capture of Google Search Results 3D Visualization and Training [served May 22, 2023]

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.