

Filed on Behalf of Novarad Corp.

By: Joseph Harmer
Jed Hansen
Thorpe North & Western, LLP
175 S. Main St., Ste. 900
Salt Lake City, UT 84111
Tel: (801) 566-6633

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

MEDIVIS, INC.,

Petitioner,

v.

NOVARAD CORP.,

Patent Owner.

Patent 11,004,271 B2

Case IPR 2023-00042

PATENT OWNER RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	BACKGROUND	2
A.	Technology Background	2
B.	The Challenged Claims of the '271 Patent.....	8
III.	CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	11
A.	“three-dimensional (3D) data ... including an outer layer of the patient and multiple inner layers of the patient”	11
B.	“inner layer(s) of the patient”	14
C.	“confined within a virtual 3D shape”	15
D.	“being having”	18
IV.	<i>AMIRA</i> , <i>CHEN</i> , <i>3D Visualization</i> , and <i>3D Slicer</i> ARE NOT PRIOR ART	18
V.	THE CHALLENGED CLAIMS ARE PATENTABLE	20
A.	Summary of Alleged Prior Art	21
1.	<i>Doo</i> (Ex. 1008)	21
2.	<i>Amira</i> (Ex. 1005)	21
3.	<i>Chen</i> (Ex. 1009).....	22
4.	<i>3D Visualization</i> (Ex. 1007)	22
5.	<i>3D Slicer</i> (Ex. 1010).....	23
B.	Ground 1: Claims 1, 5, and 6 Are Not Anticipated by <i>Doo</i>	24
1.	<i>Doo</i> Does not Disclose 1[Pre].	25
2.	<i>Doo</i> Does not Disclose 1[A]......	26
3.	<i>Doo</i> Does not Disclose 1[B].	27
4.	<i>Doo</i> Does not Disclose 1[C].	28
5.	<i>Doo</i> Does Not Disclose the Elements of Claim 5.	32
6.	<i>Doo</i> Does Not Disclose the Elements of Claim 6.	35
C.	Ground 2: Claims 1-6 and 11-20 Are Not Obvious Over <i>Doo</i> in View of <i>Amira</i>	35

..

1. <i>Doo and Amira</i> Do Not Disclose All of the Claim Elements Recited in Claims 1-6.....	36
2. <i>Doo and Amira</i> Do Not Disclose All of the Claim Elements Recited in Claim 11.....	43
3. <i>Doo and Amira</i> Do Not Disclose All of the Claim Elements Recited in Claims 12-20.....	46
4. There is No Motivation to Combine <i>Doo</i> with <i>Amira</i>	48
D. Ground 3: Claims 1-6 and 11-20 Are Not Obvious Over <i>Chen</i> in view of <i>3D Visualization</i> and <i>3D Slicer</i>	52
1. <i>Chen, 3D Visualization</i> and <i>3D Slicer</i> Do Not Disclose All of the Elements Recited in Claims 1-6 and 11-20.	52
2. <i>Chen, 3D Visualization</i> and <i>3D Slicer</i> Do Not Disclose All of the Elements Recited in Claims 11-20.	60
3. There is No Motivation to Combine <i>Chen</i> with <i>3D Visualization</i> and <i>3D Slicer</i>	63
VI. CONCLUSION.....	65

...

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

<i>Apotex Inc. v. Wyeth LLC</i> , IPR2014-00115 (Apr. 20, 2015).....	64
<i>Argentum Pharms. LLC v. Res. Corp. Techs., Inc.</i> , IPR2016-00204 (PTAB May 23, 2016)	19
<i>Blue Calypso, LLC v. Groupon, Inc.</i> , 815 F.3d 1331 (Fed. Cir 2016)	18
<i>CCS Fitness, Inc. v. Brunswick Corp.</i> , 288 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2002)	11
<i>Continental Can Co. USA, Inc. v. Monsanto Co.</i> , 948 F.2d 1264 (Fed. Cir. 1991)	34
<i>Dynamic Drinkware v. Nat’l Graphics, Inc.</i> , 800 F.3d 1375 (Fed. Cir. 2015)	20
<i>Ex parte LARS STOPPE</i> , 2023 Pat. App. LEXIS 1765 (P.T.A.B. May 23, 2023)	40
<i>Graham v. John Deere Co. of Kansas City</i> , 383 U.S. 1 (1966)	35
<i>HewlettPackard Co. v. U.S. Philips Corp.</i> , IPR2015-01505 (PTAB Jan. 19, 2016)	19
<i>In re NTP, Inc.</i> , 654 F.3d 1279 (Fed. Cir. 2011)	49
<i>In re Ratti</i> , 270 F.2d 810 (CCPA 1959).....	40
<i>In re Stepan Co.</i> , 868 F.3d 1342 (Fed. Cir. 2017)	52
<i>In re Wyer</i> , 655 F.2d 221 (CCPA 1981).....	19
<i>KSR Int’l Co. v. Teleflex Inc.</i> , 550 U.S. 398 (2007)	36, 49, 63
<i>Kyocera Wireless Corp. v. ITC</i> , 545 F.3d 1340 (Fed. Cir. 2008)	19
<i>Medtronic, Inc. v. Barry</i> , 891 F.3d 1368 (Fed. Cir. 2018)	19

Case IPR 2023-00042
Patent 11,004,271 B2

<i>Microsoft Corp. v. Global Touch Solutions, LLC</i> , IPR2015-01024 (September 23, 2015).....	37
<i>Net MoneyIN, Inc. v. VeriSign, Inc.</i> , 545 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2008)	24
<i>Par Pharm. Inc. v. TWi Pharms., Inc.</i> , 773 F.3d 1186 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	51
<i>Phillips v. AWH Corp.</i> , 415 F.3d 1303 (Fed. Cir. 2005)	11
<i>Procter & Gamble Co. v. Teva Pharms. USA, Inc.</i> , 566 F.3d 989 (Fed. Cir. 2009)	64
<i>Shopkick, Inc. v. Novitaz, Inc.</i> , IPR2015-00279 (May 29, 2015).....	50
<i>Stratoflex, Inc. v. Aeroquip Corp.</i> , 713 F.2d 1530, 218 USPQ 871 (Fed. Cir. 1983).....	36
<i>Teva Pharms. USA, Inc. v. Indivio UK Ltd.</i> , IPR2016-00280 (PTAB Jun. 10, 2016)	18, 51, 64
<i>Volkswagen Grp. of Am., Inc. v. Velocity Patent LLC</i> , IPR2015-00276 (PTAB Jun. 1, 2015).....	49, 63
Statutes	
35 U.S.C. § 103	35
35 U.S.C. §§ 102 and 311(b)	18

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.