

Paper No. _____

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

MEDIVIS, INC.
Petitioner

v.

NOVARAD CORP.
Patent Owner

US Patent No. 11,004,271

Inter Partes Review No. IPR2023-00042

**PETITIONER'S
MOTION TO EXCLUDE**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. STATEMENT OF MATERIAL FACTS	2
III. STANDARD FOR ADMISSION OF EXPERT OPINION	7
IV. NOVARAD WAIVED THE RIGHT TO DISPUTE MEDIVIS’S DEFINITION OF A POSA	9
V. MULUMUDI’S OPINIONS DO NOT QUALIFY FOR ADMISSION.....	10
A. Mulumudi Opinions on the Perspective of a POSA Are Inadmissible Because He Lacks the Required Qualifications	10
B. Mulumudi’s Opinions Are Not Otherwise Qualified for Admission.....	10
C. Mulumudi Relies on His Own Say-So	11
D. Mulumudi’s DVR-Related Opinions Are Unreliable	11
VI. ROSENBERG’S OPINIONS DO NOT QUALIFY FOR ADMISSION	12
A. Rosenberg’s Opinions on the Perspective of a POSA Are Inadmissible Because He Lacks the Required Qualifications	12
B. Rosenberg’s Opinions Are Not Otherwise Qualified for Admission.....	13
C. Rosenberg Opined Without Relevant Specialized Knowledge	13
D. Cognitive Bias Explains How Rosenberg Found a New User Interface Requirement in a Non-Existent Claim Term	14
VII. NOVARAD FAILED TO DISCLOSE THE BASIS FOR ITS PROFFERED OPINIONS	15
VIII. CONCLUSION.....	15

TABLE OF MEDIVIS EXHIBITS

Number	Description
1001	US Patent No. 11,004,271, claiming priority to March 30, 2017 (the '271 Patent)
1002	Excerpts of File history of Application No. 16/574,524, now the '271 Patent
1003	Excerpts of File history of Application No. 15/894,595, now U.S. Patent No. 10,475,244, through which the '271 Patent claims priority
1004	Excerpts of File history of Application No. 15/474,702, filed on March 30, 2017, and now U.S. Patent No. 9,892,564, through which the '271 Patent claims priority
1005	Excerpt of Amira 5 User's Guide title through Chapter 2 (Visual Imaging 2009) (" <i>Amira</i> ")
1006	US Patent Application Publication No. US 2016/0191887 A1 to Casas, published on June 30, 2016 (" <i>Casas</i> ")
1007	S. Pujol, Ph.D. et al., 3D Visualization of DICOM Images for Radiological Applications (Surgical Planning Laboratory, Brigham and Women's Hospital, Boston, Massachusetts 2014) (" <i>3D Slicer-Visualization</i> ")
1008	International Publication No. WO 2015/164402 A1 to Doo et al., published on October 29, 2015 (" <i>Doo</i> ")
1009	X. Chen et al., "Development of a Surgical Navigation System Based On Augmented Reality Using an Optical See-Through Head-Mounted Display," 55 JOURNAL OF BIOMEDICAL INFORMATICS 124-131 (2015) (" <i>Chen</i> ")
1010	Main Application GUI for 3D Slicer < https://www.slicer.org/wiki/Documentation/4.6/Slicer/Application/MainApplicationGUI > (last edited 7 November 2016) (" <i>3D Slicer GUI</i> ")
1011	E. Azimi et al., "Augmented Reality Goggles with an Integrated Tracking System for Navigations in Neurosurgery," IEEE VIRTUAL REALITY 123-124, 123 (IEEE 2012) (" <i>AR Goggle for Neurosurgery</i> ").
1012	Declaration of Peter Kazanzides Ph.D.
1013	Curriculum Vitae of Peter Kazanzides Ph.D.

TABLE OF MEDIVIS EXHIBITS

Number	Description
1014	Email message entitled “Novarad v. Medivis” and dated August 3, 2022, from counsel for Novarad, Brett Davis, to counsel for Medivis, Brian Lemon and others.
1015	Declaration of Christopher Fraiser (May 22, 2023) [served May 22, 2023]
1016	Page Vault capture of Slicer.org Main Applications GUI [served May 22, 2023]
1017	Page Vault capture of Slicer.org Acknowledgements [served May 22, 2023]
1018	Page Vault capture of Slicer.org Release Details Slicer 4.6.0 [served May 22, 2023]
1019	Page Vault capture of Google Search Results 3D Visualization and Training [served May 22, 2023]
1020	A. Federov et al., “3D Slicer as an image Computing Platform for the Quantitative Imaging Network,” 30 MAGNETIC RESONANCE IMAGING 1323-1341 (2012) [served May 22, 2023]
1021	Supplemental Declaration of Peter Kazanzides Ph.D. (May 22, 2023) [served May 22, 2023]
1022	Transcript of the Deposition of Mahesh S. Mulumudi, M.D. (September 19, 2023) g
1023	Declaration of Page Vault Representative Todd W. Price (May 19, 2023) (including publicly-accessible complete copies of Exhibit 1007, <i>3D Slicer-Visualization</i> , and of Exhibit 1005, <i>Amira</i>) [served May 22, 2023]
1024	Declaration of Internet Archive Representative Nathaniel E Frank-White (May 16, 2023) (including publicly-accessible complete copy of Exhibit 1005, <i>Amira</i>) [served May 22, 2023]
1025	The Britannica Dictionary Definition of “Confine” from < https://www.britannica.com/dictionary/confine > (downloaded 9/7/23).
1026	Merriam-Webster Dictionary Definition & Meaning of “Confined” from < https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/confined > (downloaded 9/7/23).
1027	Cambridge English Dictionary Definition of “Confine” from < https://dictionary.cambridge.org/us/dictionary/english/confine > (downloaded 9/7/23).

TABLE OF MEDIVIS EXHIBITS

Number	Description
1028	Declaration of Pamela Keyl (October 10, 2023)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.