

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

GOOGLE LLC

Petitioner

v.

VALTRUS INNOVATIONS LIMITED

(record) Patent Owner

Patent No. 6,728,704

DECLARATION OF PADHRAIC SMYTH

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. ENGAGEMENT AND COMPENSATION4

II. QUALIFICATIONS4

III. SUMMARY OF OPINIONS7

IV. MATERIALS REVIEWED7

V. UNDERSTANDING OF THE RELEVANT LAW8

 A. Anticipation8

 B. Obviousness.....9

VI. LEVEL OF ORDINARY SKILL IN THE ART12

VII. RELEVANT TIMEFRAME FOR DETERMINING OBVIOUSNESS13

VIII. TECHNICAL INTRODUCTION13

 A. The '704 Patent Disclosure13

IX. CLAIM INTERPRETATION16

 A. BACKGROUND ON CLAIM INTERPRETATION.....16

I. DETAILED EXPLANATION OF THE REASONS FOR UNPATENTABILITY17

 Ground 1. Claims 1-3, 5-9, 12-14, 17-20, and 23 were Obvious over Bushee in view of Voorhees.....17

 B. Overview of the Ground.....17

 1. Overview of Bushee.....18

 2. Overview of Voorhees21

 B. Rationale (Motivation) Supporting Obviousness.....26

 C. *Graham* Factors28

 C. Reasonable Expectation of Success29

D.	Analogous Art	29
E.	Claim Mapping.....	30
Ground 2.	Claims 3-4, 9-10, 14-15, and 20-21 were Obvious over Bushee in view of Voorhees and Koppel.....	52
A.	Overview of the Ground.....	52
B.	Overview of Koppel	53
C.	<i>Graham</i> Factors.....	54
D.	Rationale (Motivation) for the Combination.....	54
E.	Reasonable Expectation of Success	54
F.	Analogous Art	55
F.	Claim Mapping.....	55
Ground 3.	Claims 1-3, 5-9, 12-14, 17-20, and 23 are Obvious over Voorhees in view of Bushee and Tso.	56
A.	Overview of the Ground.....	56
1.	Overview of Tso.....	57
B.	<i>Graham</i> Factors	59
C.	Analogous Art	59
D.	Rationale for the Combination	60
E.	Reasonable Expectation of Success	60
F.	Claim Mapping.....	60
Ground 4.	Claims 3-4, 9-10, 14-15, and 20-21 were Obvious over Voorhees in view of Bushee, Tso, and Koppel	84
G.	Explanation of the Ground	84
X.	OATH	86

I. ENGAGEMENT AND COMPENSATION

1. My name is Padhraic Smyth. I have been retained by Google LLC for the purpose of providing my opinion with respect to the unpatentability of U.S. Pat. No. 6,728,704 (“the ’704 patent”). I am being compensated for my time in preparing this declaration at my standard hourly rate, and my compensation is not dependent upon my opinions or the outcome of the proceedings. My curriculum vitae is attached as Ex. 1003.

II. QUALIFICATIONS

2. I am currently a Professor in the Department of Computer Science at the University of California, Irvine. I have held the title of Chancellor's Professor since 2018. Before that, I held the title of Full Professor from July 2003 to 2018. From July 1998 to June 2003, I held the title of Associate Professor. I began at UC Irvine as an Assistant Professor, a title I held from April 1996 to June 1998. I also hold joint faculty appointments with the Departments of Statistics and Education at UC Irvine.

3. I was a Founding Director of the UCI Data Science Initiative at University of California, Irvine, from July 2014 to June 2018. I was also a Founding Director of the Center for Machine Learning and Intelligent Systems at the University of California, Irvine from January 2007 to July 2014.

4. From October 1988 to March 1996, I was a Member of Technical Staff

and a Technical Group Leader (from 1992) at the Jet Propulsion Laboratory, California Institute of Technology, Pasadena, California.

5. I completed a Bachelor's Degree in Electronic Engineering in 1984 at the National University of Ireland, University College Galway. I completed a Master's Degree in Electrical Engineering at the California Institute of Technology, Department of Electrical Engineering, in 1985. In 1988, I completed a Ph.D. in Electrical Engineering from the California Institute of Technology.

6. I have spent three and a half decades researching topics relevant to the '704 patent, including data mining, machine learning, artificial intelligence, pattern recognition, and applied statistics. I am a co-author on over 200 published papers in these and related fields.

7. I have co-authored or edited the following books that are relevant to the subject matter of the '704 patent: *Modeling the Internet and the Web: Probabilistic Methods and Algorithms*, P. Baldi, P. Frasconi, and P. Smyth, John Wiley, June 2003; *Principles of Data Mining*, D. Hand, H. Mannila, and P. Smyth, Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2001; and *Advances in Knowledge Discovery and Data Mining*, U. Fayyad, G. Piatetsky-Shapiro, P. Smyth, and R. Uthurasamy (eds.), Palo Alto, CA: AAAI/MIT Press, 1996. I was an editor of the following conference proceedings relevant to the '704 patent: C. Apte, J. Ghosh, P. Smyth (eds.), *Proceedings of the 17th ACM SIGKDD International Conference on Knowledge Discovery and Data*

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.