

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

VERANCE CORP.,

Petitioner,

v.

MZ AUDIO SCIENCES, LLC,

Patent Owner.

CASE: IPR2022-01544

Patent No. 7,289,961 B2

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXHIBIT LIST	III
I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
II. PATENT OWNER FAILS TO ADDRESS THE BENEFITS GAINED BY THE PROPOSED COMBINATION	1
III. PATENT OWNER'S ARGUMENTS AGAINST THE SRINIVASAN-CABOT-KUDUMAKIS COMBINATION ARE CONTRADICTED BY THE EVIDENCE OF RECORD	3
A. Srinivasan does not mandate using 4.8-6kHz range	3
B. Srinivasan does not require absolute inaudibility	4
C. The combinations in Grounds 1 and 2 maintain low audibility.....	5
D. Patent Owner ignores Cabot's explanations and conclusions that phase shifts are very hard to detect	6
E. The '961 patent's claims do not recite any limitations related to a particular audibility level.....	8
F. The combination does not need to produce an optimum system	10
IV. KUDUMAKIS DOES NOT TEACH AWAY FROM THE PROPOSED COMBINATION	11
V. HOBSON IS ANALOGOUS ART.....	12
A. Hobson is from the same field of endeavor	13
B. Hobson is reasonably pertinent to the problem solved in the '961 patent	15
VI. GROUND 3 COMBINATION RENDERS THE CLAIMS OBVIOUS.....	18
A. Tilki's technique was fast and simple	18
B. The combination with Cabot did not produce audibility issues, and a POSA would have been motivated by the advantages gained by the combination	19
C. Patent Owner's FFT bin spacing assertions are unavailing	20
D. The challenged claims do not recite a bitrate requirement and the combination provides adequate watermarking capacity	22

VII. OTHER INACCURACIES AND MISSTATEMENTS24
VIII. CONCLUSION.....28

EXHIBIT LIST

Exhibit	Description
Ex. 1001	U.S. Patent No. 7,289,961 (“’961 Patent”)
Ex. 1002	Prosecution History of U.S. Patent No. 7,289,961
Ex. 1003	Declaration of Michael Scordilis, Ph.D.
Ex. 1004	Curriculum Vitae of Michael Scordilis, Ph.D.
Ex. 1005	U.S. Patent No. 6,272,176 (“Srinivasan”)
Ex. 1006	Richard C. Cabot et al., “Detection of phase shifts in harmonically related tones,” in <i>Journal of the Audio Engineering Society</i> , vol. 24, no. 7, pp. 568-571 (Sept. 1976) (“Cabot”) (from pages 8-11 of the Rachel J. Watters Declaration, Ex. 1009)
Ex. 1007	PCT Publication WO 01/58063 (“Kudumakis”)
Ex. 1008	John F. Tilki et al., “Encoding a hidden auxiliary channel onto a digital audio signal using psychoacoustic masking,” in <i>Proceedings IEEE SOUTHEASTCON ’97. ‘Engineering the New Century,’</i> pp. 331-333 (1997) (“Tilki”)
Ex. 1009	Declaration of Rachel J. Watters Relating to Exhibit 1006
Ex. 1010	U.S. Patent No. 4,546,779
Ex. 1011	Christine I. Podilchuk et al., “Digital Watermarking: Algorithms and Applications,” in <i>IEEE Signal Processing Magazine</i> , vol. 18, no. 4, pp. 33-46 (July 2001) (“Podilchuk”) (from pages 6-21 of the Rachel J. Watters Declaration, Ex. 1034)
Ex. 1012	Ingemar J. Cox et al., “Review of Watermarking and the Importance of Perceptual Modeling,” in <i>Proceedings of SPIE</i> , vol. 3016, pp. 92-99 (June 1997) (“Cox-1997”)
Ex. 1013	Mitchell D. Swanson et al., “Robust Audio Watermarking Using Perceptual Masking,” in <i>Signal Processing</i> , vol. 66, no. 3, pp. 337-355 (May 1998) (“Swanson”)

Ex. 1014	U.S. Patent No. 3,845,391
Ex. 1015	U.S. Patent No. 4,931,871
Ex. 1016	U.S. Patent No. 3,004,104
Ex. 1017	U.S. Patent No. 5,629,739
Ex. 1018	U.S. Patent No. 5,745,604 (“’604 Patent”)
Ex. 1019	U.S. Patent No. 5,579,124
Ex. 1020	Ingemar J. Cox et al., “Secure Spread Spectrum Watermarking for Multimedia,” in <i>NEC Research Institute Technical Report 95-10</i> , pp. 1-33 (1995) (“Cox-1995”)
Ex. 1021	Chung-Ping Wu et al., “Robust and efficient digital audio watermarking using audio content analysis,” in <i>Proceedings of SPIE</i> , Vol. 3971, pp. 382-392 (2000) (“Wu”) (from pages 16-26 of the Rachel J. Watters Declaration, Ex. 1053)
Ex. 1022	U.S. Patent No. 6,151,578
Ex. 1023	Qiang Cheng et al., “Spread Spectrum Signaling for Speech Watermarking,” in <i>Proceedings of 2001 IEEE International Conference on Acoustics, Speech, and Signal Processing</i> , vol. 3, pp. 1337-1340 (2001) (from pages 12-15 of the Rachel J. Watters Declaration, Ex. 1054)
Ex. 1024	U.S. Patent No. 7,133,534
Ex. 1025	Declaration of Dr. Mary K. Bolin
Ex. 1026	Declaration of Gordon MacPherson Relating to Ex. 1008
Ex. 1027	U.S. Patent No. 6,996,521
Ex. 1028	Jean-Claude Risset, “Exploration of Timbre by Analysis and Synthesis,” in <i>The Psychology of Music</i> , pp. 113-169 (2nd ed. 1999)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.