

Patent No. 9,194,597

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

GOOGLE LLC

Petitioner

v.

ECOFACITOR, INC.

(record) Patent Owner

IPR2022-00538
U.S. Patent No. 9,194,597

**PETITION FOR INTER PARTES REVIEW
UNDER 35 U.S.C. §§ 311-319 AND 37 C.F.R. § 42.100 ET. SEQ**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION6

 A. The '597 Patent Disclosure6

II. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION11

 III. DETAILED EXPLANATION OF THE REASONS FOR UNPATENTABILITY13

 Ground 1. Claims 1-24 Are Obvious Over Ehlers '330 in view of the knowledge of a POSITA and Wruck.13

 A. Effective Prior Art Dates13

 B. Overview of the Ground.....14

 1. Overview of Ehlers '330.....14

 2. Overview of Wruck.....17

 3. Overview of the Combination.....19

 C. Rationale (Motivation) Supporting Obviousness.....20

 D. *Graham* Factors21

 E. Reasonable Expectation of Success21

 F. Analogous Art22

 G. Claim Mapping.....22

IV. INSTITUTION UNDER 35 U.S.C. § 31472

V. CONCLUSION.....73

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE75

CERTIFICATE OF WORD COUNT76

TABLE OF EXHIBITS

Exhibit No.	Description
1001	U.S. Patent No. 9,194,597 (“ the 597 patent ”).
1002	Declaration of Rajendra Shah.
1003	C.V. of Rajendra Shah.
1004	U.S. Patent App. Pub. 2004/0117330 (“ Ehlers ’330 ”).
1005	U.S. Patent App. Pub. 2005/0040250 A1 (“ Wruck ”).
1006	Excerpt from <i>The Industrial Electronics Handbook</i> , Irwin, J.D. ed. CRC Press and IEEE Press, 1997, pp. 59-60.
1007	Horan, T, <i>Control Systems and Applications for HVAC/R</i> , Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1997.
1008	Levenhagen, J, <i>HVAC Control and Systems</i> , McGraw-Hill, Inc., 1993.
1009	File History of Application No. 14/082,675.
1010	U.S. Patent No. 8,751,186 B2 (“ the ’186 patent ”).
1011	<i>Exhibit number not used.</i>
1012	U.S. Patent No. 6,789,739 (“ Rosen ”).
1013	WO 2007/128783 A1 (“ McNulty ”).
1014	U.S. Pat. App. Pub. 2005/0171645 (“ Oswald ”).
1015	U.S. Patent No. 5,943,544 (“ Charles ”).
1016	U.S. Patent No. 6,029,092 (“ Stein ”).
1017	ITC Inv. No. 337-TA-1185, Public Version of April 20, 2021 Initial Determination

1018	<i>Google, LLC f/k/a Google Inc. v. EcoFactor, Inc.</i> , 4-21-cv-03220 (N.D. Cal.), Answer (July 13, 2021).
1019	<i>Google, LLC f/k/a Google Inc. v. EcoFactor, Inc.</i> , 4-21-cv-03220 (N.D. Cal.), Scheduling Order (August 11, 2021).
1020	<i>Security People, Inc. v. Ojmar US, LLC</i> , 14-cv-04968-HSG (N.D. Cal.), Order (May 29, 2015).

Patent No. 9,194,597

Petitioner respectfully requests *inter partes* review under 35 U.S.C. § 311 of claims 1-24 of U.S. Pat. No. 9,194,597 (“the ’597 patent”).

NOTICE OF LEAD AND BACKUP COUNSEL

Lead Counsel Matthew A. Smith Reg. No. 49,003 SMITH BALUCH LLP 700 Pennsylvania Ave. SE Second Floor Washington, D.C. 20003 (202) 669-6207 smith@smithbaluch.com	Backup Counsel Elizabeth Laughton Reg. No. 70,484 SMITH BALUCH LLP 700 Pennsylvania Ave. SE Second Floor Washington, D.C. 20003 (703) 585-8839 laughton@smithbaluch.com
---	--

NOTICE OF THE REAL-PARTIES-IN-INTEREST

The real-party-in-interest for this petition is Google LLC (“Google”).

NOTICE OF RELATED MATTERS

The ’597 patent has been asserted in the following litigations:

EcoFactor, Inc. v. ecobee, Inc., 6-21-cv-00428 (W.D. Tex. April 28, 2021);

Google, LLC f/k/a Google Inc. v. EcoFactor, Inc., 4-21-cv-03220 (N.D. Cal. April 30, 2021).

NOTICE OF SERVICE INFORMATION

Please address all correspondence to the lead counsel at the addresses shown above. Petitioners consent to electronic service by email at: smith@smithbaluch.com, and laughton@smithbaluch.com.

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.