

UNITED STATES INTERNATIONAL TRADE COMMISSION
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20436

In the Matter of

**CERTAIN SMART THERMOSTATS,
SMART HVAC SYSTEMS, AND
COMPONENTS THEREOF**

Inv. No. 337-TA-1185

INITIAL DETERMINATION

Administrative Law Judge David P. Shaw

Pursuant to the notice of investigation, 84 Fed. Reg. 65421 (Nov. 27, 2019), this is the initial determination in *Certain Smart Thermostats, Smart HVAC Systems, and Components Thereof*, United States International Trade Commission Investigation No. 337-TA-1185.

It is held that no violation of section 337 of the Tariff Act, as amended, has occurred in the importation into the United States, the sale for importation, or the sale within the United States after importation, of certain smart thermostats, smart HVAC systems, and components thereof, with respect to asserted claims 1, 2, and 5 of U.S. Patent No. 8,131,497, asserted claims 1, 2, and 5 of U.S. Patent No. 8,423,322, and asserted claim 9 of U.S. Patent No. 10,018,371.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. Background.....	1
A. Institution of the Investigation; Procedural History.....	1
B. The Parties	5
C. The Accused Products.....	6
D. The Domestic Industry Products.....	7
II. Jurisdiction.....	7
III. Importation.....	8
IV. General Principles of Law	13
A. Claim Construction.....	13
B. Infringement.....	16
1. Direct Infringement.....	16
2. Indirect Infringement	18
a. Induced Infringement.....	18
b. Contributory Infringement.....	18
C. Validity	19
1. Anticipation.....	19
2. Written Description.....	22
3. Enablement	23
4. Indefiniteness	24
D. Domestic Industry.....	25
V. Claim Construction.....	28
A. Level of Ordinary Skill in the Art.....	28

TABLE OF CONTENTS (CONT'D)

	Page
B. Disputed Constructions	29
1. “HVAC System” / “heating, ventilation and air conditioning (HVAC) system” / “heating, ventilation and air conditioning system” (collectively, “HVAC system”) (’497 patent, claims 1, 2, 5; ’322 patent, claims 1, 5; ’371 patent, claim 9)	29
2. “operational efficiency” / “operational efficiency of an HVAC system” / “operational efficiency of a heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) system” / “operational efficiency of the HVAC system” (’497 patent, claim 1; ’322 patent, claim 1)	32
a. Whether the Preambles of Claim 1 of the ’497 Patent and ’322 Patents Are Limiting	33
b. Construction of “operational efficiency”	36
3. “measurements of outside temperatures” / “outside temperature measurements” / “outside temperatures” (’497 patent, claims 1, 2; ’322 patent, claims 1, 2)	43
4. “programmable thermostat” (’497 and ’322 patent, claim 5)	46
5. “status of the HVAC system is ‘on’” / “status of the HVAC system is ‘off’” (’497 patent, claim 1) and “status [of said HVAC system]” (’322 patent, claim 1)	49
6. “one or more rates of change in temperature” (’497 patent, claim 1)	54
7. “one or more processors” / “said one or more processors” (’497 patent, claim 1; ’322 patent claim 1)	59
8. “actual setpoint” (’371 patent, claim 9)	61
9. “thermostatic controller” (’371 patent, claim 9)	65
VI. The ’497 Patent	68
A. Overview of the ’497 Patent	68
B. Infringement	69
1. Claim 1	69

..

TABLE OF CONTENTS (CONT'D)

	Page
a. Google Products.....	69
b. ecobee Products	110
c. Vivint Products	153
2. Claim 2.....	190
a. Google Products.....	190
b. ecobee Products	192
c. Vivint Products	195
3. Claim 5.....	196
a. Google Products.....	196
b. ecobee Products	199
c. Vivint Products	202
C. Domestic Industry (Technical Prong).....	204
1. Claim 1.....	205
a. A system for calculating a value for the operational efficiency of a heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) system comprising:	205
b. at least one HVAC control system that receives temperature measurements from at least a first location conditioned by at least one HVAC system;	210
c. one or more databases that store at least said temperatures measured at said first location over time;.....	213
d. one or more processors that receive outside temperature measurements from at least one source other than said HVAC system;	213
e. wherein said one or more processors are configured to calculate one or more rates of change in temperature at said first location for periods during which the status of the HVAC system is “on” and	

...

TABLE OF CONTENTS (CONT'D)

	Page
wherein said one or more processors are further configured to calculate one or more rates of change in temperature at said first location for periods during which the status of the HVAC system is "off", and to relate said calculated rates of change to said outside temperature measurements.....	216
2. Claim 2.....	221
a. A system as in claim 1	221
b. in which said processors receive outside temperatures for geographic regions based on ZIP codes from sources other than said HVAC system.	221
3. Claim 5.....	223
a. A system as in claim 1	223
b. further comprising a programmable thermostat and said programmable thermostat is the sole source for current data regarding temperature inside said location conditioned by said HVAC system.	223
VII. The '322 Patent.....	225
A. Overview of the '322 Patent	225
B. Infringement.....	226
1. Claim 1.....	226
a. Google Products.....	226
b. Alarm.com Products	264
c. Vivint Products	304
2. Claim 2.....	327
a. Google Products.....	327
b. Alarm.com Products	329
c. Vivint Products	331

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.