

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

META PLATFORMS, INC.,
Petitioner

v.

THALES VISIONIX, INC.,
Patent Owner

U.S. PATENT NO. 7,725,253

IPR2022-01308

PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

June 14, 2023

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIESv

LIST OF EXHIBITSvi

I. INTRODUCTION1

II. BACKGROUND2

 A. The '253 Patent2

 B. Welch 2001.....6

 C. Welch 1997 and Welch Thesis.....8

 D. Horton.....8

 E. Harris10

 F. Reitmayr11

 G. Person of Ordinary Skill in the Art11

III. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION11

 A. “Estimation Subsystem,” “Sensor Subsystem,” and “Coupled To”12

 B. “Sensor Module”17

 C. “Configuration Data”18

 D. “Enumerating sensing elements available to a tracking system”.....23

 E. “Expected Utility of a Measurement”25

 F. “Set of sensing elements”.....26

IV. PETITIONER FAILS TO DEMONSTRATE OBVIOUSNESS OF ANY CHALLENGED CLAIM.....27

 A. The Petition Fails to Establish a Reasonable Likelihood that Welch 2001 and Welch 1997 Rendered Any Claim Obvious (Ground I).....27

 1. Petitioner fails to show that Welch 2001 and Welch 1997 rendered claims 1 and 2 obvious.....28

 2. Petitioner fails to show that the combination of Welch 2001 and Welch 1997 rendered claims 6-9 obvious.....32

B. The Petition Fails to Establish that Welch 2001, Welch 1997, and Harris Rendered Claims 3-5 Obvious (Ground II).....36

1. The Petition does not establish a motivation to combine Welch 2001 and Welch 1997 with Harris or a reasonable expectation of success in doing so.....37

2. Claim 540

C. The Petition Fails to Establish that Welch 2001, Welch 1997, and Reitmayr Rendered Claims 3-4 Obvious (Ground III).....42

1. The Petition does not establish a motivation to combine Welch 2001 and Welch 1997 with Reitmayr or a reasonable expectation of success in doing so.....42

D. The Petition Fails to Establish that Horton Rendered Any Claim Obvious (Ground IV)45

1. Petitioner fails to show that Horton rendered claims 1-5 obvious46

2. Petitioner fails to show that Horton rendered claims 6-9 obvious58

E. The Petition Fails to Establish that Horton in View of Welch 1997 Rendered Any Claim Obvious (Ground V)64

1. Claim 764

2. Claim 866

3. Claim 966

V. OBJECTIVE INDICIA OF NON-OBVIOUSNESS.....67

CONCLUSION.....67

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES

<i>Arkie Lures, Inc. v. Gene Larew Tackle, Inc.</i> , 119 F.3d 953 (Fed. Cir. 1997)	67
<i>Becton, Dickinson & Co. v. Tyco Healthcare Grp.</i> , 616 F.3d 1249 (Fed. Cir. 2010)	14, 20, 50
<i>Comcast Cable Commc'ns, LLC v. Promptu Sys. Corp.</i> , 838 F. App'x 551 (Fed. Cir. 2021)	14
<i>In re Cyclobenzaprine Pat. Litig.</i> , 676 F.3d 1063 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	36
<i>In re IPR Licensing, Inc.</i> , 942 F.3d 1363 (Fed. Cir. 2019)	65
<i>LG Elecs. Inc. v. ImmerVision, Inc.</i> , 39 F.4th 1364 (Fed. Cir. 2022)	52
<i>Nidec Motor Corp. v. Zhongshan Broad Ocean Motor Co.</i> , 868 F.3d 1013 (Fed. Cir. 2017)	11, 12
<i>Personal Web Techs., LLC v. Apple, Inc.</i> , 848 F.3d 987 (Fed. Cir. 2017)	38
<i>Phillips v. AWH Corp.</i> , 415 F.3d 1303 (Fed. Cir. 2005)	16
<i>Securus Techs., Inc. v. Glob. Tel*Link Corp.</i> , 701 F. App'x 971 (Fed. Cir. 2017)	37
<i>Teva Pharm. USA, Inc. v. Corcept Therapeutics, Inc.</i> , 18 F.4th 1377 (Fed. Cir. 2021)	40, 44
<i>Trs. of Columbia Univ. v. Symantec Corp.</i> , 811 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2016)	16
<i>Wi-LAN Inc. v. Sharp Elecs. Corp.</i> , 992 F.3d 1366 (Fed. Cir. 2021)	15

REGULATIONS

37 C.F.R. § 42.10465

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.