

Filed: October 20, 2023

Filed on behalf of:

Patent Owner Masimo Corporation
By: Irfan A. Lateef (Reg. No. 51,922)
Ted M. Cannon (Reg. No. 55,036)
Jarom D. Kesler (Reg. No. 57,046)
Jacob L. Peterson (Reg. No. 65,096)

KNOBBE, MARTENS, OLSON & BEAR, LLP
2040 Main Street, Fourteenth Floor
Irvine, CA 92614
Tel.: (949) 760-0404
Fax: (949) 760-9502
E-mail: AppleIPR127-1@knobbe.com

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

MASIMO CORPORATION,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2022-01299
U.S. Patent 7,761,127

PATENT OWNER SUR-REPLY

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page No.
I. CLAIM CONSTRUCTION	1
A. “thermal mass”	1
B. “bulk temperature”	3
C. “the operating wavelengths dependent on the bulk temperature”	4
II. THE PRIOR ART DOES NOT DISCLOSE OR MAKE OBVIOUS A “THERMAL MASS”	4
III. THE PRIOR ART DOES NOT DISCLOSE OR MAKE OBVIOUS THE “BULK TEMPERATURE” LIMITATIONS	8
IV. MOTIVATION TO COMBINE.....	9
A. Apple fails to rebut Masimo’s teaching-away showing.....	9
1. Cheung and Noguchi teach measuring ambient temperature.....	9
2. Webster and Huiku teach away from the invention, and Apple’s contrary arguments are based on hindsight.....	11
3. Apple’s new references fail to satisfy Apple’s burden to prove motivation to combine.....	12
B. Apple fails to rebut Masimo’s no-motivation-to-combine showing.	19
1. Apple never proposed changing Yamada’s substrate or Chadwick’s core to make either a “thermal mass.”.....	19

TABLE OF CONTENTS
(cont'd)

	Page No.
2. Chadwick’s core would not have the thermal function of the “thermal mass.”	20
3. Chadwick’s core and Yamada’s heat conductor are redundant.....	22
4. Anthony’s oversimplification of the complexity of designing a “thermal mass” is not credible.....	23
V. OBJECTIVE EVIDENCE SUPPORTS NON-OBVIOUSNESS	25
A. It is undisputed the rainbow® sensors embody the invention, are commercially successful, and have received industry praise.	25
B. There is a nexus between the objective evidence and the invention.	25

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Page No(s).

<i>Dynamic Drinkware LLC v. Nat. Graphics, Inc.</i> , 800 F.3d 1375 (Fed. Cir. 2015)	18
<i>Edwards Lifesciences LLC v. Cook Inc.</i> , 582 F.3d 1322 (Fed. Cir. 2009)	4
<i>In re Epstein</i> , 32 F.3d 1559 (Fed. Cir. 1994)	24
<i>Fox Factory, Inc. v. SRAM, LLC</i> , 944 F.3d 1366 (Fed. Cir. 2019)	25
<i>In re Huang</i> , 100 F.3d 135 (Fed. Cir. 1996)	27
<i>K/S Himpp v. Hear-Wear Techs., LLC</i> , 751 F.3d 1362 (Fed. Cir. 2014)	11
<i>Key Pharms. v. Hercon Labs. Corp.</i> , 161 F.3d 709 (Fed. Cir. 1998)	9
<i>In re Publicover</i> , 813 F. App'x 527 (Fed. Cir. 2020)	24
<i>Sanofi-Aventis Deutschland GmbH v. Mylan Pharms. Inc.</i> , 66 F.4th 1373 (2023)	16, 17, 18, 19
<i>SAS Inst. v. Iancu</i> , 138 S. Ct. 1348 (2018).....	5
<i>Uber Techs., Inc. v. X One, Inc.</i> , 957 F.3d 1334 (Fed. Cir. 2020)	24
<i>Unigene Labs., Inc. v. Apotex, Inc.</i> , 655 F.3d 1352 (Fed. Cir. 2011)	19

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES
(cont'd)

Page No(s).

OTHER AUTHORITIES

37 C.F.R. § 42.616

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.