

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

MASIMO CORPORATION,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2022-01299
U.S. Patent 7,761,127

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO PATENT OWNER'S RESPONSE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Introduction.....	1
II.	Claim Construction.....	2
	A. “A Thermal Mass” (Independent Claims 1, 7, 13, 20, 26)	2
	B. “Bulk Temperature” (Independent Claims 1, 7, 13, 26; Dependent Claim 21).....	5
	C. “Operating Wavelengths Dependent on the Bulk Temperature” (Claim 7).....	8
III.	Grounds 1A-2F Render the Disputed Claim Limitations Obvious	9
	A. The “Thermal Mass” Limitations Are Obvious	9
	B. The “Bulk Temperature” Limitations Are Obvious.....	11
IV.	The POR Fails to Refute the Petition’s Showing that a Thermal Core and Bulk Temperature Suitable for Estimating LED Temperatures and Wavelengths Would Have Been Obvious in the Instituted Grounds	12
	A. A POSITA Would Have Been Motivated to Use the Thermal Core for LED Temperature and Wavelength Estimation, and Masimo’s Arguments to the Contrary are Based on Masimo’s Inaccurate and Incomplete Review of Prior Art Solutions.....	12
	B. A POSITA Would Have Known How to Implement the Thermal Core and Sensor in the Instituted Grounds to Successfully Obtain a Bulk Temperature Measurement Suitable for LED Temperature and Wavelength Estimation	18
V.	Masimo’s Secondary Considerations Evidence Fails to Show That the Challenged Claims Would Not Have Been Obvious	23
	A. Masimo Fails to Show a Presumption of Nexus	23
	B. Masimo Cannot Show Nexus-in-Fact Because the ’127 Claims Contain No Unique Characteristics.....	25

C. Masimo’s Objective Indicia Evidence is Not Connected to the ’127
Claims or the Direct Result of Any Allegedly Unique Characteristics
.....25

VI. Conclusion27

EXHIBITS

APPLE-1001	U.S. Patent No. 7,761,127 to Al-Ali (“the ’127 Patent”)
APPLE-1002	Excerpts from the Prosecution History of the ’127 Patent
APPLE-1003	Expert Declaration of Brian Anthony, Ph.D.
APPLE-1004	Certified English Translation of Japanese Patent Publication No. JP 2004-337605 A (“Yamada”)
APPLE-1005	U.S. Patent No. 3,514,538 (“Chadwick”)
APPLE-1006	U.S. Patent No. 4,591,659 (“Leibowitz”)
APPLE-1007	U.S. Patent No. 5,259,381 (“Cheung”)
APPLE-1008	U.S. Patent No. 5,334,916 (“Noguchi”)
APPLE-1009	[RESERVED]
APPLE-1010	[RESERVED]
APPLE-1011	Japanese Patent Publication No. JP 2004-337605 A
APPLE-1012	Respondent Apple Inc.’s Post-Hearing Brief, <i>In the Matter of Certain Light-Based Physiological Measurement Devices and Components Thereof</i> , International Trade Commission Investigation No. 337-TA-1276 (June 27, 2022) (Public Version)
APPLE-1013	<i>Interim Procedure for Discretionary Denials in AIA Post-Grant Proceedings with Parallel District Court Litigation</i> , issued June 21, 2022 (“Interim Guidance”)
APPLE-1014	J.A. Scarlett, THE MULTILAYER PRINTED CIRCUIT BOARD HANDBOOK (1985) (selected excerpts)
APPLE-1015	[RESERVED]

- APPLE-1016 Counsel's Email Exchange re "Motions to Seal and Protective Order" dated November 2, 2022 and November 3, 2022
- APPLE-1017 Respondent Apple Inc.'s Corrected Pre-Hearing Brief, *In the Matter of Certain Light-Based Physiological Measurement Devices and Components Thereof*, International Trade Commission Investigation No. 337-TA-1276 (May 16, 2022) (Public Version)
- APPLE-1018 Respondent Apple Inc.'s Corrected Reply Post-Hearing Brief, *In the Matter of Certain Light-Based Physiological Measurement Devices and Components Thereof*, International Trade Commission Investigation No. 337-TA-1276 (September 2, 2022) (Public Version)
- APPLE-1019 Complainants Masimo Corp's. and Cercacor Labs., Inc.'s Pre-Hearing Brief, *In the Matter of Certain Light-Based Physiological Measurement Devices and Components Thereof*, International Trade Commission Investigation No. 337-TA-1276 (May 13, 2022) (Public Version)
- APPLE-1020 Complainants Masimo Corp's. and Cercacor Labs., Inc.'s Reply Post-Hearing Brief, *In the Matter of Certain Light-Based Physiological Measurement Devices and Components Thereof*, International Trade Commission Investigation No. 337-TA-1276 (July 11, 2022) (Public Version)
- APPLE-1021 Respondent Apple Inc.'s Opening Markman Brief, *In the Matter of Certain Light-Based Physiological Measurement Devices and Components Thereof*, International Trade Commission Investigation No. 337-TA-1276 (Jan. 27, 2022)
- APPLE-1022 Complainants Masimo Corp's. and Cercacor Labs., Inc.'s Opening Claim Construction Brief, *In the Matter of Certain Light-Based Physiological Measurement Devices and Components Thereof*, International Trade Commission Investigation No. 337-TA-1276 (Jan. 27, 2022)
- APPLE-1023 Respondent Apple Inc.'s Rebuttal Markman Brief, *In the Matter of Certain Light-Based Physiological Measurement Devices and Components Thereof*, International Trade Commission Investigation No. 337-TA-1276 (Feb. 10, 2022)

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.