Filed: October 26, 2022

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

_____

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

_____

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD,
SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., and APPLE INC.
Petitioner,

v.

SMART MOBILE TECHNOLOGIES LLC,
Patent Owner.

_____

Case IPR2022-01249
Patent 9,019,946 B1

_____

PATENT OWNER'S PRELIMINARY RESPONSE
UNDER 35 U.S.C. § 313 AND 37 C.F.R. § 42.107

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION 1

II. THE BOARD SHOULD DENY INSTITUTION 10

A. PETITIONER FAILS TO DISCLOSE OR APPLY ITS DISTRICT COURT CLAIM CONSTRUCTION POSITIONS IN VIOLATION OF 37 C.F.R. § 42.104(b)(3) (ALL CLAIMS, ALL GROUNDS) 10

B. PETITIONER FAILS TO DEMONSTRATE A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD OF PREVAILING ON GROUND 1A (CLAIMS 14-15) 20

1. Yegoshin-Johnston-Billström Does Not Teach a Mobile Device that Maintains Multiple IP Addresses (14[i]) 20

a) Yegoshin's Phone Would Not Maintain an IP Address for Cellular Communication Because it Does Not Use IP for Cellular Communication 20

b) Petitioner Fails To Explain Why a POSITA Would Associate a Second IP Address With Yegoshin's Phone 24

2. Yegoshin-Johnston-Billström Does Not Teach the Simultaneous Use of Multiple Network Paths (14[j]) 27

C. PETITIONER FAILS TO DEMONSTRATE A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD OF PREVAILING ON GROUND 1B (CLAIMS 1-11, 16-21) 30

1. Yegoshin-Johnston-Billström-Bernard Does Not Teach a Single Interface Comprised of Multiplexed Signals from the Plurality of Wireless Transmit and Receive Units(1[i]) 30

a) Yegoshin's Phone Does Not Multiplex Signals 30

b) Bernard Does Not Teach "Multiplexed" Signals 34

c) Petitioner Fails To Prove That a POSITA Would Be Motivated To Combine Yegoshin And Bernard as Proposed 39

DOCKET ALARM

Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

i. A POSITA Would Not Be Motivated to Connect Yegoshin's Cell Phone To Bernard's Cradle Which Has a Cellular Telephone And a Land Phone....40

ii. A POSITA Would Not Be Motivated to Add an Internal Serial Interface to Yegoshin's Phone....42

2. Yegoshin-Johnston-Billström-Bernard Does Not Teach a First Interface for Transmission that Uses a Plurality of Interfaces for Internet Protocol Communication (1[i])....47

3. Yegoshin-Johnston-Billström-Bernard Does Not Teach a First Interface for Transmission that Uses a Plurality of Interfaces…to Enable a Single Interface (1[i])....49

4. Yegoshin-Johnston-Billström-Bernard's Processor is Not Configured to Combine the Data Paths into a Single Transmission Interface (17[i])....53

5. Yegoshin Does Not Teach the Simultaneous Use of Multiple Network Paths (1[j], 17[j])....54

D. PETITIONER FAILS TO DEMONSTRATE A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD OF PREVAILING ON GROUND 1E (CLAIMS 27-30)....55

1. Neither Yegoshin nor Bernard Discloses a Second Wireless Transmit and Receive Unit that Communicates to a Remote Server on a Second Network Path in Response to a Change in Signal Strength or Connectivity (27[h])....55

2. Petitioner's Yegoshin-Johnston-Billström-Bernard Combination Does Not Disclose that Video or Audio Can Be Accessed Simultaneously . . . Through Dedicated or Multiplexed Paths (27[h])....59

E. PETITIONER FAILS TO DEMONSTRATE A REASONABLE LIKELIHOOD OF PREVAILING ON ANY DEPENDENT CLAIMS (ALL GROUNDS)....60

DOCKET ALARM

Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

F. PETITIONER'S NEED FOR MULTITUDINOUS REFERENCES STRONGLY SUGGESTS THE PRESENCE OF HINDSIGHT BIAS (ALL GROUNDS) 60

III. CONCLUSION 66

DOCKET ALARM

Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

Carefusion Corp. v. Baxter Int'l, Inc.,
IPR2016-01456, Paper 9 (P.T.A.B. Feb. 6, 2017) 13

Cheese Sys., Inc. v. Tetra Pak Cheese & Powder Sys., Inc.,
725 F.3d 1341 (Fed. Cir. 2013) 46, 65

Chemco Sys., L.P. v. RDP Techs., Inc.,
IPR2019-01562, Paper 9 (P.T.A.B. Jun. 4, 2020) 10

Ecolochem, Inc. v. S. Cal. Edison Co.,
227 F.3d 1361 (Fed. Cir. 2000) 46

Ex parte Evans,
2017 Pat. App. LEXIS 386 (P.T.A.B. Aug. 1, 2017) 64

Ex parte Orbotech LT Solar, LLC,
2012 Pat. App. LEXIS 2784 (B.P.A.I. May 31, 2012) 64

Fid. Fed. Sav. & Loan Ass'n v. de la Cuesta,
458 U.S. 141 (1982) 15

Ford Motor Co. v. Mass. Inst. Tech.,
IPR2020-00010, Paper 9 (P.T.A.B. Mar. 26, 2020) 17

Gen. Elec. Co. v. Raytheon Techs. Corp.,
983 F.3d 1334 (Fed. Cir. 2020) 60

Google Inc. v. Koninklijke Philips N.V.,
IPR2017-00409, Paper 10 (P.T.A.B. Jun. 5, 2017) ..... passim

Halo v. Yale Health Plan,
819 F.3d 42 (2nd Cir. 2016) 15

Hologic, Inc., v. Enzo Life Sciences, Inc.,
IPR2018-00019, Paper 17 (P.T.A.B. Apr. 18, 2018) 13

In re Am. Acad. of Sci. Tech Ctr.,
367 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2004) ..... passim

DOCKET ALARM
Find authenticated court documents without watermarks at docketalarm.com.

DOCKET ALARM

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts

Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research

With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips

Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS
Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS
Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS
Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.