

Filed: October 13, 2023

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD

SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD.,
SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS AMERICA, INC., and APPLE INC.,
Petitioner,

v.

SMART MOBILE TECHNOLOGIES LLC,
Patent Owner.

Case IPR2022-01249
Patent 9,019,946

PATENT OWNER'S SUR-REPLY

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION.....	1
II.	PETITIONER FAILS TO SHOW MULTIPLE IP ADDRESSES	1
III.	PETITIONER FAILS TO SHOW SIMULTANEOUS USE OF MULTIPLE NETWORK PATHS	2
	A. Yegoshin’s Phone Does Not Simultaneously Use Cellular and WLAN Network Paths.	2
	B. Johnston May Not Be Relied On and Does Not Disclose Use of Multiple Network Paths.	3
	C. Petitioner Did Not Make an Obviousness Argument in the Petition, and Fails to Substantiate One Now.....	5
IV.	PETITIONER FAILS TO SHOW “TWO NETWORK PATHS” CONNECTED TO A “SERVER” AND USE OF THE SECOND NETWORK PATH “IN RESPONSE TO A CHANGE IN THE SIGNAL STRENGTH AND/OR CONNECTIVITY”	7
	A. Yegoshin Does Not Disclose a Remote Server.....	7
	B. Yegoshin’s Phone Does Not Operate/Communicate with a Remote Server Over Multiple Network Paths.	9
	C. Neither Yegoshin Nor Bernard Teaches Communicating to the Remote Server on the Second Network Path In Response To A Change In The Signal Strength And/Or Connectivity of the First or Second Communication Unit.....	10
V.	PETITIONER FAILS TO PROVE ITS COMBINATION DISCLOSES “COMBIN[ING] DATA PATHS INTO A SINGLE TRANSMISSION INTERFACE TO ONE OR MORE APPLICATIONS”	11
	A. Petitioner’s New “Virtual Path” Theory is Meritless.....	11
	B. Bernard Does Not Disclose the Recited Data Paths.	14

VI.	PETITIONER FAILS TO SHOW “MULTIPLEXED SIGNALS”	15
A.	Petitioner’s Interpretation Of “Multiplexed” Is Contrary To Plain Meaning, Common Sense And Petitioner’s District Court Positions.	15
B.	Yegoshin Does Not Disclose or Suggest Multiplexing.	19
C.	Bernard Does Not Teach Multiplexed Signals.	20
D.	Petitioner Fails to Show Motivation to Modify Yegoshin- Johnston- Billström to Add Bernard’s Serial Interface.....	24
1.	Petitioner’s “First Scenario.”	24
2.	Petitioner’s “Second Scenario.”	25
VII.	DEPENDENT CLAIMS	27
A.	Claim 2.	27
B.	Claim 10.	27
VIII.	THE BOARD SHOULD DISREGARD PETITIONER’S IMPROPERLY INCORPORATED EXPERT TESTIMONY	29

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

CASES

<i>Alcon Inc. v. AMO Dev., LLC</i> , IPR2021-00853, Paper 48 (PTAB Dec. 2, 2022)	7
<i>Allied Erecting & Dismantling Co. v. Genesis Attachments, LLC</i> , 825 F.3d 1373 (Fed. Cir. 2016)	25
<i>Arendi S.A.R.L. v. Apple, Inc.</i> , 832 F.3d 1355 (Fed. Cir. 2016)	19
<i>Chicago Bd. Options Exch., Inc. v. Int'l Securities Exch., LLC</i> , 677 F.3d 1361 (Fed. Cir. 2012)	5
<i>Ex Parte Foster</i> , Appeal No. 2019-002355, 2020 WL 2731806 (PTAB May 20, 2020).....	26
<i>Henny Penny Corporation v. Frymaster LLC</i> , 938 F.3d 1324 (Fed. Cir. 2019)	25
<i>Intelligent Bio-Sys., Inc. v. Illumina Cambridge Ltd.</i> , 821 F.3d 1359 (Fed. Cir. 2016)	passim
<i>Lucent Technologies, Inc. v. Gateway, Inc.</i> , 525 F.3d 1200 (Fed. Cir. 2008)	5
<i>Qualcomm Incorporated v. Apple Inc.</i> , 24 F.4th 1367 (Fed. Cir. 2022)	6, 24
<i>TQ Delta, LLC v. CISCO Systems, Inc.</i> , 942 F.3d 1352 (Fed. Cir. 2019)	11, 16, 20, 26
<i>Twitter, Inc. v. VidStream LLC</i> , 825 Fed.Appx. 844 (Fed. Cir. 2020).....	24

EXHIBIT LIST

2001.	Reserved
2002.	Declaration of Professor Todor V. Cooklev, Ph.D. [1 st -Cooklev-Decl.]
2003.	<i>Smart Mobile Technologies, LLC v. Apple Inc., Smart Mobile Technologies, LLC v. Samsung Electronics Co., Ltd. et al.</i> , Nos. 6:21-cv-00603 and 6:21-cv-00701, Defendants' Opening Claim Construction Brief (June 8, 2022) [Defendants'-Opening-Claim-Construction-Brief]
2004.	<i>Smart Mobile Technologies, LLC v. Apple Inc., Smart Mobile Technologies, LLC v. Samsung Electronics Co., Ltd. et al.</i> , Nos. 6:21-cv-00603 and 6:21-cv-00701, Defendants' Opening Claim Construction Brief – Exhibit 1 (June 8, 2022) [Defendants' Opening Claim Construction Brief – Exhibit 1]
2005.	Kevin M. Stack, <i>Preambles as Guidance</i> , 84 GEO. WASH. L. REV. 1252 (2016) (http://www.gwlr.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/84-Geo.-Wash.-L.-Rev.-1252.pdf) [Stack]
2006.	ElectronicsTutorials, <i>The Multiplexer</i> , WWW.ELECTRONICS-TUTORIALS.WS, https://www.electronicstutorials.ws/combination/comb_2.html (last visited Oct. 26, 2022) [Electronics-Tutorial]
2007.	TexasInstruments, 74HC153 Data Sheet, Dec. 1982, revised Feb. 2022, WWW.TI.COM, https://www.ti.com/lit/gpn/sn74hc153 [74HC153-Data-Sheet]
2008.	Lee Stanton, <i>What is the Difference Between a Landline and a Mobile Phone Number?</i> , WWW.ALPHR.COM, Feb. 22, 2022, https://www.alphr.com/difference-landline-mobile-phone-number/ [Alphr]

Explore Litigation Insights

Docket Alarm provides insights to develop a more informed litigation strategy and the peace of mind of knowing you're on top of things.

Real-Time Litigation Alerts



Keep your litigation team up-to-date with **real-time alerts** and advanced team management tools built for the enterprise, all while greatly reducing PACER spend.

Our comprehensive service means we can handle Federal, State, and Administrative courts across the country.

Advanced Docket Research



With over 230 million records, Docket Alarm's cloud-native docket research platform finds what other services can't. Coverage includes Federal, State, plus PTAB, TTAB, ITC and NLRB decisions, all in one place.

Identify arguments that have been successful in the past with full text, pinpoint searching. Link to case law cited within any court document via Fastcase.

Analytics At Your Fingertips



Learn what happened the last time a particular judge, opposing counsel or company faced cases similar to yours.

Advanced out-of-the-box PTAB and TTAB analytics are always at your fingertips.

API

Docket Alarm offers a powerful API (application programming interface) to developers that want to integrate case filings into their apps.

LAW FIRMS

Build custom dashboards for your attorneys and clients with live data direct from the court.

Automate many repetitive legal tasks like conflict checks, document management, and marketing.

FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS

Litigation and bankruptcy checks for companies and debtors.

E-DISCOVERY AND LEGAL VENDORS

Sync your system to PACER to automate legal marketing.